

youth **th**
& policy

The Journal of Critical Analysis

Winter 1994/95

Issue Number: 47

Michael Lavalette, Sandy Hobbs, Sandra Lindsay and Jim McKehnie Child Employment in Britain: <i>Policy, Myth and Reality</i>	1
Ian Procter and Maureen Padfield Young Women's Career Aspirations: <i>What Happens to Them?</i>	16
Peter Selman & Caroline Glendinning Teenage Parenthood & Social Policy	39
Ray Fabes and David Popham Mobile Facilities for work with Young People in Rural Areas	59
Bob Holman Urban Youth - Not an Underclass	69
Working Space · Philip Roycroft Short Sharp Kenyan Safari	78
Book Reviews	82
Subscription Page	112

© Youth & Policy 1995

Editorial and Production Group:

Sarah Banks, Richard Barber, Meg Brown, Judith Cocker, Lucy Ford, Robert Hollands, Umme Imam, Tony Jeffs, Tia Khan, Robert MacDonald, Chris Parkin, Moyra Riseborough, Gordon Stoner.

Editorial Associates: Inge Bates, Shane Blackman, Bob Coles, Lynne Chisholm, Judith Ennew, Dick Hobbs, Mark Smith, Fred Robinson, Shirley Tate, Patrick West, Lionel Van Reenen.

Youth & Policy, a non-profit making journal, is devoted to the critical study of youth affairs and youth policy in Britain and in an international context. The journal strives to maintain balance between academic contributions and debates focussed upon policy, practice and the issues confronting young people in society.

Submissions which are insensitive to equal opportunities issues and which are considered to be offensive to any social group on the basis of class, race, gender, sexuality or disability will not be considered and contributors must avoid the use of discriminatory language.

Material from the journal may be extracted for study and quotation with acknowledgement of the journal and the author(s). The views expressed in the journal remain those of the authors and not necessarily those of the editorial group. Whilst every effort is made to check factual information, the editorial group is not responsible for errors in the material published in the journal.

For details of subscriptions, submission of material for publication and advertising see the inside back cover.

Typeset and Printed by:

The Art Department, 1 Pink Lane,
Newcastle upon Tyne, NE1 5DW.
Telephone: (091) 230 4164.

Proofread by:

Seaham Proofreaders, 5 Dene Terrace, Seaham,
County Durham, SR7 7BB.

Youth & Policy, 10 Lady Beatrice Terrace,
New Herrington, Houghton le Spring, DH4 4NE

CHILD EMPLOYMENT IN BRITAIN:

Policy, Myth and Reality

MICHAEL LAVALETTE, SANDY HOBBS,
SANDRA LINDSAY, and JIM McKECHNIE

Introduction

An episode in *Short Change* (27 February 1994), a BBC television series primarily aimed at school students, reported a survey which suggested that large numbers of the children from whom the programme draws its viewers were either working or had worked. Many were earning as little as £1 per hour. The programme went on to focus on children who spent their holidays and week-ends selling flowers on motorway slip roads. The children stood by the roadside in all weathers and could take between £200 and £300 for their employers. In return the children would be lucky to receive £20 for their day's toil. In some respects, the programme was an example of a long line of journalistic accounts of the 'horrors of child labour'.¹ However, such accounts are important in as much as they are part of the process of the creation of child labour as a 'social problem' (Manning, 1987). One distinctive feature of the *Short Change* item was its attempt to provide a child's perspective, and to encourage the viewers to consider the wider implications of their work. The programme concluded that the exploitation of child labour was still a feature of 1990s Britain and had not, as is often thought, been abolished by historical progress.

Beyond this journalistic concern, there are a number of pressure groups and academics who see child employment in Britain today as problematic. The last ten years has witnessed a growth in research in this field. Recent surveys have established that generally between one third and one half of school students in their last two years of compulsory schooling will be in some form of paid labour at any given time (Lavalette, 1994). Beyond Britain, a number of supranational policy makers and agenda setters are active in the sphere of child employment. Attempts to restrict children's work have been made as part of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (Article 32) which was formally adopted in November 1989 and by a recent European Union (EU) Labour and Social Affairs Council directive intended to severely restrict the work opportunities available to school students. The British Government is a signatory to the UN convention but feels that no action is required to implement it since existing legislation already meets the requirements of Article 32. The Government opposed the European Union directive and sought to negotiate a British opt-out. Its basic case is stated in *The United Kingdom in Europe* (Department of Employment, 1993). Reviewing the evidence of ministers to parliamentary committees considering the protection of young people at work, we have identified six elements in the Government's case.²

The first is the belief that relatively few children in Britain work. Extrapolating from a study undertaken in Birmingham, the Low Pay Unit has suggested that as many as two million children may be working in Britain (Pond and Searle, 1991). The Government's response has been simply to suggest that Birmingham may not be representative of the country as a whole.

The second element in the Government's case may be found in statements by ministers who suggest that they perceive children to be working in a narrow range of

'light' tasks which are undertaken for extra pocket money. This may be taken to imply that children are effectively excluded from inappropriate jobs.

Third, Michael Forsyth, Minister of State for Employment, argued that existing legislation provided adequate protection for young people.

Fourth although the EU directive was put forward on health and safety grounds, the Government felt general workplace health and safety directives already applied to young people and provided adequate cover. Specific legislation would only muddy the waters.

Fifth, the minister claimed that administrative and legal complications for employers of young people will discourage their recruitment and retention.

Finally, the principle of subsidiarity and the specificity of young people's job outlets were invoked. Forsyth claimed that the Government could 'see no role for Brussels in this area' because 'young people under 18 are unlikely to seek jobs in other member states'. He went on to remark, rather facetiously, 'I know of no paper round that is pan-European'. This was an area best covered by national legislation which could account for British cultural traditions and employment conditions and practices.

These six points, then, represent the British government's case. In this paper we shall be attempting to assess the validity of these claims in the light of the evidence available, including a recent study we have conducted in three contrasting schools. We shall address each point in turn.

There are only a small number of working children

One of the reasons given for rejecting the results of the study published by Pond and Searle (1991) was that it was conducted in one area, Birmingham, which might be atypical. Implicit in this argument is the assumption that no other information is available which could provide us with a nationwide picture of the scale of child employment. This is misleading. Other studies have been published and, although, as we shall see, they present some difficulties in interpretation, they all agree in suggesting that child employment is a fairly substantial phenomenon.

Davies (1972) published the results of research sponsored by the Department of Health and Social Security. This covered over 2,800 pupils, aged 13 to 15, in 40 varied schools in 18 different LEAs in England and Wales. Davies distinguished between what he called Category A jobs (where the child assists in a trade or occupation carried out for profit) and Category B jobs such as babysitting. Looking at Category A alone, 41% of males and 23% of females were employed. If Category B jobs are included, however, the percentages rise to 69% and 80% for males and females respectively. How does this compare with the Pond and Searle finding? Their definition of work seems roughly equivalent to Davies' Category A. However, they report two different totals of 'workers', those who worked in term time only (32%) and those who worked in either term time or during the school holiday (44%). Obviously, the former figure is similar to Davies' finding (around 32% if male and female figures are combined), but this may be merely a coincidence. Davies' published report does not reveal whether or not he includes working during the school holiday. Indeed it does not reveal what time period his figures are based on. Are his 'workers' currently employed, or have they worked at some time in the current term, or is it that they have worked *at some time in their lives*?

A similar difficulty arises when one examines a more recent national study. Balding (1991) reports the results of a survey of around 19,000 secondary school children throughout the country. Questions on employment were included in a more broadly based Health Related Behaviour Questionnaire. The basic employment question was:

Do you do a regular paid job during term time?

Thus we do know here the relevant Pond and Searle finding with which to compare the result, holiday work being clearly excluded. However, two other difficulties arise. First, what counts as 'regular' work and did all respondents interpret this in the same way? Secondly, Balding does not report which definition of work was employed. However, unlike Pond and Searle, Balding differentiates between school students at different stages. The general trend is for greater proportions of children to be in paid employment as one progresses up the school. In Year 7 (11 to 12-year olds), more boys (29%) work than girls (23%) but by Year 11, the female figure (71%) outstrips the males (60%). The age range covered is broadly equivalent to that in the Pond and Searle study, but the reported rate of employment is clearly higher. Balding does not give an overall average and it is possible to make only a rough estimate on the basis of the figures published. However, approaching 50% of his sample were working during term time compared to Pond and Searle's finding of 32%. One simple explanation might be that Balding's definition of employment was indeed broader.

A number of other studies of a more local character have been published in recent years. None of them escape the problems of definition and interpretation which we have noted in those reports we have highlighted.³ However, it is not possible to interpret any of them as suggesting paid employment of school aged children is a rare phenomenon. That said, it would obviously be preferable to have less ambiguous findings on which to judge the scale and the character of the problem. This we have been attempting to do in a series of related studies undertaken in a number of areas in Scotland and northern England.

We have defined work as paid employment outside of the family. This is not because we regard domestic labour, for example, as unimportant, but because the nuances of economic and power relationships within the family make it appropriate to study domestic labour as a phenomenon in its own right. Unlike some other researchers, we have included work such as babysitting. Since it is quite a common type of employment, particularly for girls, it could be misleading to omit from consideration this type of activity and source of income. Respondents were asked initially about *current* jobs (if any) and then about any jobs they had had previously. As Davies (1972) notes, children do move in and out of jobs, so it is worthwhile trying to take account of this. We are able to distinguish between current and former workers and between those who have worked at some time and those who have never worked.

In our earlier studies we concentrated on those students who were nearing the end of compulsory schooling.⁴ Questionnaires were administered in Years S3 and S4 (in Scotland) and Years 10 and 11 (in England). These pupils are predominantly 14 or 15 years old (with a handful who have turned 16). As can be seen in Table 1, percentages currently working varied from area to area (from a low of 35% to a high of 50%). A similar pattern is found if we look at overall experience of employment; those who have never worked vary from a low of 21% to a high of 38%. These variations might be accounted for in different ways, such as differences in average ages or differences in local economic circumstances. What cannot be denied, however, is

that irrespective of the locality studied, most children, as they approach the statutory minimum school leaving age, have had experience of paid employment.

Table 1 Earlier Studies of work Status (Percentages)

	Currently Working	Formerly Worked	Never Worked	n	Survey Date
Strathclyde					
11 Schools	36	26	38	567	Jan 88/Jan 90
Urban Scottish					
2 Schools	35	29	36	347	Jan/Jan 92
Cumbria					
4 Schools	50	22	27	490	Jun 92
North Tyneside					
2 Schools	46	33	21	281	Dec 92
Dumfries and Galloway					
3 Schools	35	35	30	259	Jan 93
Scottish			35	1173	
English			25	771	
All			31	1944	

We have now extended our research to three secondary schools in which we surveyed all years up to the limit of compulsory schooling. They were an urban school in Lancashire, a rural school in Lancashire and an urban school in Scotland. In Table 2 we report the work status in each school of each year separately from Years 7 to 11 in the English schools and Years S1 to S4 in the Scottish school (roughly equivalent to English Years 8 to 11). Like Balding, we found that the younger children had less work experience. However, unlike Balding, we found that two of our schools show a slight tendency to taper off in the 'current worker' category in Year 11. This may be because, as major examinations approach, some children drop out of work to concentrate on exam preparation.

Table 2 Later Studies of Work Status (Percentages)

Year	*Urban Scottish			Urban Lancashire			Rural Lancashire		
	Current	Former	Never	Current	Former	Never	Current	Former	Never
7				16	5	79	20	6	74
8/S1	10	7	83	28	9	63	35	14	51
9/S2	25	21	54	40	16	44	43	17	40
10/S3	34	20	46	52	19	29	48	21	31
11/S4	31	32	37	47	21	32	70	14	16

* A different urban Scottish area from that listed in Table 1.

The most significant finding is that, even although we are dealing with smaller units of analysis (single schools), we find once again that in each case the majority of students in the later years have experience of paid employment. As in our previous studies, the percentages working at some time are somewhat greater in the north of England than in Scotland. Since, despite small regional variations, the general rule is that most children work, we conclude that there is no evidence of a major change in the high levels of employment established in the last Government sponsored survey (Davies, 1972). Pond and Searle's Birmingham study, rejected by the Government, on our evidence is not a misleading indicator of levels of employment; if anything it may underestimate the extent of child employment by not including all children who had ever worked.

Children are employed in a narrow range of tasks

The Government's assumption appears to be that children are employed in a narrow range of work tasks. However, our previous studies have demonstrated that children can be found working in a wide range of jobs, a finding confirmed in the current study. Table 3 presents the jobs reported by the school students who work.

Table 3 Type of Current Employment (Percentages)

	DEL	HWK	SHP	BAB	WAI	FRM	CAT	Other
Urban Scottish School								
Year S1	62	19	-	6	-	-	-	13
Year S2	64	21	-	9	-	-	-	6
Year S3	67	23	5	2	-	-	-	2
Year S4	36	9	21	18	6	-	-	9
Total	57	18	7	9	2	-	-	6
Urban Lancashire School								
Year 7	80	-	3	3	-	-	-	13
Year 8	67	-	13	8	2	6	2	2
Year 9	60	-	4	15	4	-	-	17
Year 10	40	1	22	14	17	2	1	3
Year 11	16	-	27	16	20	-	5	16
Total	47	-	16	12	11	2	2	10
Rural Lancashire School								
Year 7	63	-	6	12	-	-	-	19
Year 8	62	-	7	10	3	7	-	10
Year 9	31	3	3	19	13	16	3	12
Year 10	28	-	23	5	23	8	5	8
Year 11	9	-	15	9	32	6	28	-
Total	32	1	12	11	18	8	11	8

DEL: delivery; HWK: hawking; SHP shopwork;

BAB: babysitting; WAI: waiting; FRM: farm;

CAT: hotel & catering.

It is apparent that delivery work is the major job of school pupils in all three schools. Included in this category are newspaper delivery (morning and evening) and milk delivery (sometimes very early in the morning). Also common are shopwork, babysitting and waiting in the catering trade, to varying degrees depending on the school. Possible regional variations emerge in the number of pupils involved in work classed as hawking or street trading. While this is the second most likely job after delivery work in the Scottish school, it is hardly represented at all in the Lancashire schools. Amongst jobs simply classified as 'other' are cleaning, gardening, modelling and work at garages and building sites. The table shows that the proportion of pupils involved in delivery work tends to decline as the age of pupils increases. This is particularly noted in both the English schools. Pupils in Years 10 and 11 are more likely to be employed in shopwork and waiting jobs. Thus they move from jobs which are typically thought of as 'children's work' to jobs where potentially they are in competition with adults in the labour market.

Further examination of job categories confirmed that students typically worked in gender specific jobs. Whilst male school students are generally employed in delivery, farm and 'other' work, female students predominate in shopwork, babysitting and waiting jobs. It may be noted, too, that it is the younger males who are typically engaged in delivery and the older females who compete as cheap casual labour in 'adult' type jobs. The interaction of age and gender thus structure the employment opportunities for children and young people in the labour market.

Some past research has tended to exclude 'babysitting' as a form of paid employment. Pond and Searle (1991) made this judgement on the basis that it was not prohibited by byelaws or national legislation. However, given that approximately one in ten young people in this survey report this as paid employment outwith the family, we believe that it should be included in the findings. Furthermore, the degree of responsibility placed on young people who are caring for younger children is perhaps an issue which deserves more attention.

The existing legislative framework

The legislation regulating the employment of children and young people is a labyrinth of Parliamentary Acts and local authority byelaws. To simplify, the definitive legislation dates back to the 1933 Employment of Children and Young Persons Act (the Scottish equivalent was passed in 1937). The Acts regulate children's work in several ways. These include the hours a child may work, the times at which this work may start and finish, the age at which a child may enter employment and a range of jobs that are prohibited to children and young people. In addition, local authorities may supplement this legislation to suit particular local needs or peculiarities. The resulting regulatory framework is outdated. In 1973, the Employment of Children Act passed through parliament, but its provisions have never been implemented.

The main rationale behind legislation has been to protect children and ensure that education rather than work takes priority in the years up to the end of compulsory schooling. The health of the child is another consideration. The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child stresses these same principles, stating:

The Government must protect children from doing work which could be dangerous or which could harm their health or interfere with their education (Article 32).

The Convention was ratified by the British Government in 1991, thus committing Britain to ensure that policy and practice reflected the Convention's aims.

Children spend, on average, twenty-eight hours per week at school, excluding time for homework. Legislation restricts the number of hours young people can work in order that schooling is not adversely affected. They are not permitted to start work prior to 7.00 a.m. or work beyond 7.00 p.m. in the evening. Working on school days is restricted to two hours per day maximum. Holiday work is limited to five hours per day for under-fifteens and eight hours per day for those aged fifteen and over. The maximum number of hours permitted during term time is 17 hours per week for under-fifteens and twenty hours for those aged fifteen and over.

While the majority of pupils were working for less than ten hours per week, our current study confirms earlier findings that a minority of children work considerably longer.⁵ Between 11% and 19% worked for more than ten hours per week. Working hours tended to increase with the age of the pupils. The greatest number of hours worked in an average week reported in this survey was fifty-four. More than one third of pupils reported working before 7.00 a.m., with between 40% and 63% claiming to work beyond 7.00 p.m. Evening work was most common in the Scottish school which may in part be explained by the amount of hawking undertaken.

A further aspect of the legislation is the stipulation that, with a few highly specific exceptions, no child should be employed before the age of thirteen. The children in the earlier years of our survey were aged between twelve and thirteen when this survey was completed. Up to 20% of pupils in this age group reported being in some form of paid employment. Thus a number of them would have been illegally employed on this criterion alone. A fifth of pupils in this study entered paid employment at age ten or younger, the youngest age reported being seven.

Finally, the basic measure which local authorities have for recording, and in theory regulating, the employment of children is the permit system. Young people under the minimum school leaving age are not allowed to work without one. Before a permit may be issued the conditions of employment have to be considered. The potential impact on school attendance and the health and well-being of the child must also be appraised by both the headteacher and a doctor. It is apparent from our investigations that the existing system is simply not working. Only 6% of the urban Scottish children who had worked had ever had a work permit. In both the Lancashire schools the figure was even less (2%). The government claims that the present system is satisfactory in regulating the employment of children. Michael Forsyth, Employment Minister, responding to questions at the debate of the European Standing Committee B on the Protection of Young People at Work claimed that instances of illegal child employment are not the result of deficiencies in existing legislation, but rather the responsibility of local authorities who are not adequately enforcing the law.

With over 90% of pupils in this study reporting to have never had a work permit, one implication of the serious failure of the permit system is the extent to which children and young people become invisible members of the workforce. They are not in effect employees and thus have no protection in relation to employment rights and health and safety regulations. While the debate between Government and local authorities continues with respect to who has responsibility for the regu-

lation of child employment, children continue to work in circumstances outwith the law. As is well known, the present Government has shown considerable commitment to the cause of restricting local authority spending. Given the very low percentages of working pupils who currently hold employment permits, it is difficult to imagine a substantial shift towards legality without considerable increase in local authority expenditure to attempt to implement current legal requirements.

The problem of 'overlap, duplication and confusion'

Michael Forsyth claimed that the EU directive would lead to a situation of legislative 'overlap, duplication and confusion'. In essence his claim here is shaped by the fact that the directive was introduced as a health and safety at work measure. His assumption was that existing health and safety legislation in Britain (a) was generally adequate, and (b) applied to, and covered, young people at work.

The general adequacy or otherwise of Britain's health and safety legislation is not an issue which can be covered here⁶ but we shall look at the particular position of children. There are two points to be noted in this regard. First the 1933/37 legislation in combination with *most* local authority bye-laws includes health and safety clauses: the perceived health and safety costs, both physical and psychological, are a central element of the rationale prohibiting children from undertaking certain jobs, notably work down mines, in factories and construction sites. In addition, Section 28 (1)(f) of the 1933 Act states that no child shall be employed 'to lift, carry or move anything so heavy as to be likely to cause injury to him'. Secondly, the general legislation on health and safety at work applies equally to both children and adults in employment. Thus far these points would seem to offer some support to Forsyth's claim. However, there are a number of problems which need to be addressed.

Most importantly, despite the existing legislative framework, children do suffer accidents at work, sometimes serious ones. There are no centrally produced figures in this area. The Health and Safety Executive (HSE) does not record the number of children hurt at work in any separate form nor do local authorities. Using HSE data, Fyfe (1989) has argued that the increase in the number of farm injuries and deaths during the summer months coincides with the period when there are increasing numbers of young children working on the farms though this evidence is at best circumstantial. Previous studies which have looked at the issue have all reported substantial numbers of children hurt or injured performing their work.⁷ The proportion of children in our studies who had had an accident or had been injured at work ranges from 17% (urban Scottish) through up to 27% and 30% in urban and rural Lancashire respectively.

The evidence is sufficient to lead us to conclude that health and safety is a significant issue. However, we are aware that the self-report questionnaire is a weak instrument for assessing the extent and nature of children's accidents at work, particularly when this is only one of a number of employment issues addressed within the survey. It relies heavily on the assumption of accurate collection and presupposes the awareness of an incidents significance. A child is not necessarily aware of the health implications of the conditions experienced at work.

Murray (1991) has utilised a slightly different technique. She administered a 'note-book' to 65 school students and asked them to write about their work experiences. This produced more detailed accounts of their accidents and the potential dangers

that they face: stray dogs chasing delivery workers, inappropriately designed bicycles used by newspaper boys and girls, the difficulties presented by ill-lit stairs in blocks of flats, the threat of attack and robbery while collecting money, and the more substantial injuries caused by children operating machines in butcher shops, restaurants and factories (1991, pp. 88-89). This is an area which tends to receive little attention until a tragic accident occurs. An example is the report in *The Independent on Sunday* (27 June 1993) which told the story of the two roadside flower sellers, one killed and one seriously injured in car accidents while at work. Although occurrences such as these may not be common, there is enough evidence to indicate that more detailed investigations are required.

The second general issue which needs to be addressed is in relation to the legal and insurance cover and compensation for those children who are working illegally. As noted in the last section the vast majority of child workers are employed illegally on one count or another. The compensation for injuries sustained at work is a grey area when the child is not recognised as being a legitimate employee.

These problems are compounded by the difficulties of adequately policing child employment laws, a task which primarily falls to the Local Authority's Educational Welfare Service, but can also fall within the remit of the Police and the Factory Inspectorate. Because the relevant restrictions are to be found in a variety of statutes, it would perhaps be more appropriate to state, in contradistinction to Forsyth's claim, that the *present* legislative framework is one where we have 'overlap, duplication and confusion' and what is needed is a clear and rational policy and framework to combat the dangers child workers face. Pending such a development, it would surely be advisable if there were to be greater liaison between the different authorities who may be faced with monitoring the conditions under which children work.

The threat to young people's job opportunities

Forsyth's suggestion that adopting the EU directive would threaten young people's job opportunities embodies many aspects of the Government's deregulatory approach to labour market issues. As with the abolition of Wages Councils and the implementation of anti-Trade Union legislation, the argument essentially is that we all have the 'right to work', wherever we can, for whatever wage we can obtain, and that all impediments to this process and to the free working of the labour market should be kept to a minimum.

The social consequences for adult labour associated with such a perspective and such policy commitments have been well documented.⁸ However, with regard to child employment there are more specific issues which need to be addressed. In essence, to say the directive is a threat to young people's jobs is a criticism only if one presupposes that the work threatened is in all cases a 'good thing'.

We believe the evidence we have already presented casts serious doubt on such a simple minded view. However, quite apart from what we are learning about the extent, character and circumstances of child employment, there is another type of evidence to be considered. This is the research being undertaken which seeks to examine possible links between work and other aspects of the child's development such as attitudes, skills, social development and educational performance. The pioneers of research in this field were the Americans, Greenberger and Steinberg, who

published several empirical studies in the early 1980s, most of which are summarized in their book *When Teenagers Work* (1986). Since then, research in the United States and elsewhere has flourished. This has contributed to the debate between those who see child employment as essentially a valuable step in the transition to adulthood (the child worker acquiring appropriate work attitudes and skills) and those who see it as potentially dangerous to the child's education, psychological and physical well-being. On the whole, in Britain, this debate is conducted without a great deal in the way of research backing. There are social and economic differences between Britain and the United States which may limit the extent to which generalization between countries is permissible. On the other hand, it would surely be foolhardy for British policy makers to ignore American evidence entirely.

We shall not attempt a full review of the United States research and the associated theoretical work. However, it may be valuable to outline some of its general features. Greenberger and Steinberg's own research clearly suggests that work can have some beneficial effects on children's social and cognitive development and the enhancement of personal responsibility can develop what could be termed an awareness of the 'value of money', and increase self-reliance and promote greater social understanding. Other researchers have claimed that there are other benefits to be gained, suggesting that work is a source of useful careers information, provides a positive work image, enhances the work ethic, increases earning potential in the first five post-school years, and increases personal responsibility and orientation towards the future.⁹

However, as Greenberger and Steinberg (1986) point out, every advantage can be matched by a disadvantage. Thus they suggest work can detrimentally affect children's schooling, make them more accepting of 'unethical' work practices and various forms of pilfering, and that the money and social contacts afforded by work can give the children access to 'deviant' pastimes based around drugs, alcohol and cigarettes. More recent research building on Greenberger and Steinberg's findings suggests that work can lead to lower academic achievement and school involvement, 'psychological distress', higher rates of drug and alcohol abuse, diminished parental responsibility and breakdown of familial ties, and increased 'delinquency'.¹⁰

Taken together, these studies present a picture which is far from clear-cut. As a result 'the debate over the costs and benefits of part-time work is likely to continue' (Bachman and Schulenberg, 1993, p 221). It is worth noting that the way in which this debate is framed is not completely unproblematic. There are two features which need to be highlighted. First, the way in which many of the perceived 'costs' and 'benefits' are formulated embody many ideological assumptions. Cummings and Taebeil (1978) have noted, for example, that certain types of research can identify the 'benefits' as being those accruing to the economic system rather than the child. Another serious weakness of much of the research so far undertaken is that it is not related to wider social phenomena such as class, gender or ethnic background. Thus the effects of social class, for example, on both the jobs performed and the perceived 'costs' and 'benefits' of the work are downplayed.

Do these uncertainties and limitations in the empirical research leave the policy makers free to make their own choices? Certainly it is true that research to date does not suggest *precise* answers to policy questions. However, there is one finding by Greenberger and Steinberg which may be worth noting before we leave consideration

of American work. They offer the generalization that, whereas *benefits* can be said to emerge even from relatively limited experience of work, *costs tend to grow with the amount of work*. This has been referred to as the 'work intensity' variable (Bachman and Schulenberg, 1993). This would indicate that it might be preferable to concentrate on controlling hours worked rather than seeking to prohibit it entirely.

How relevant are these American findings and debates to Britain? Opinions expressed in Britain on the virtues and dangers of child employment mirror views expressed in the United States. Unfortunately, in Britain, the relevant evidence is severely limited. Over twenty years ago, Davies (1972) published findings which indicated an adverse effect of employment on schooling, but he gave insufficient information on his research methods and, in any case, the results might no longer hold in changed conditions. We have begun to explore links between employment and schooling in a number of small studies in different parts of Scotland and England.¹¹ It is too early to make firm generalizations, but we have found evidence in Britain of both costs and benefits. There is reason to believe that in Britain too 'work intensity' is a key issue. Future research should pay much greater attention to the specific character of different jobs, the amount of time spent at work being only one of many potential important aspects.

Furthermore, the discussion of costs and benefits cannot be isolated from the evidence presented above regarding the types of jobs performed by children, the hours they work, their conditions of employment and accident rates. Thus the evidence suggests once again that there is a need for clear and rationally presented legislation which will identify legitimate tasks for children to perform, the hours they can work and regulate their conditions of employment. Ann Clwyd, Shadow Employment Minister, has recently called for a strengthening of the legislation but without specifying what that might involve (Clwyd, 1994).

In the current state of our knowledge, it would seem foolhardy to reject cautious regulations seeking to control child employment on the grounds of 'restricted opportunity'. It may make sense to refer to 'opportunity' when talking about unemployed adults, but school-aged children without jobs cannot sensibly be regarded as 'unemployed'. Adult unemployment is self evidently a problem for the individual and for society. Children may gain some benefits from working but they are also at risk, and it seems particularly inappropriate to apply concepts which might apply to unemployed adults.

The principle of subsidiarity and the specificity of young people's job outlets

At a conference held in Tecklenburg, Germany, in 1991, it became clear that evidence exists in several European countries that child employment is emerging as a matter for concern.¹² However, in most of the countries research is at a fairly early stage and no one has yet attempted a comparative study which might indicate differences between European countries. Thus, when the British Government claims that child employment in this country is sufficiently unique to justify invoking the principle of subsidiarity, it must be relying on 'commonsense' notions of what working children do. Michael Forsyth's already cited remark about pan-European paper rounds gives the clue to what this image amounts to. It is reinforced by remarks by the then Employment Secretary, David Hunt. Referring to his apparent success in negotiating an opt-out from the EU directive where it applied to child employment, he was quoted as claiming to have 'saved British paper boys and girls from extinction' (Carvel, 1994).

We have already demonstrated that many British children do other kinds of work besides milk and paper delivery. However, let us assume, for the sake of argument, that these are the distinctive British jobs the Government wishes to protect. Let us leave aside, too, the question of whether children in other countries undertake similar work. Are these so clearly positive features of British society that it is worth the Government coming into profound conflict with its EU partners?

It may well be that some young people enjoy undertaking light, pleasant delivery jobs, and also enjoy the wages they receive. However, it is unquestionably true that there are darker sides to delivery work too. Currently many children in these jobs are working illegally. Nor are these simply technical breaches of the law. We would argue that legal restrictions on the time when schoolchildren may start work are eminently sensible, if we are to expect them to be able to participate adequately at school. Yet we have found substantial numbers of children rising at five o'clock and even earlier to deliver milk. The various drawbacks to child employment which we have noted already apply in almost all cases to delivery work. These include danger of accidents and of being attacked. It is a strange sort of commonsense which regards it as 'natural' for children to work outdoors before dawn in winter. Yet this is what work means for some children. We acknowledge that this is not true of all delivery work but that it is true for any children is sufficient grounds for concern. We cannot say yet with any confidence just how widespread the undesirable types of work are. Research may eventually clarify the picture. Unfortunately, the British Government seems unconcerned with finding out what child employment in Britain actual involves. Instead it invokes subsidiarity in the name of what can best be regarded as little more than a convenient myth.

Conclusion

Research on child labour in Britain needs to be taken much further than the tentative beginnings we have described. Nevertheless, even in its early stages, it has revealed enough to demonstrate the inadequacies of the current Government's policies. On each of the aspects of child labour discussed, we believe we have been able to show that even the limited evidence currently available shows the Government to be operating on false assumptions about child employment in contemporary Britain.

At various points throughout this paper, we have indicated some of the additional research which is needed to deepen our understanding of child employment. However, it is surely not necessary to await further research findings to take more positive action. Since the government states that it wishes to protect children who work, it is not unreasonable to expect it to help local authorities and others involved to implement the current laws. If local authorities had the resources to pursue their statutory duties more vigorously, researchers could monitor the effectiveness of the various ways in which this might be done.

Michael Lavalette is based at the University of Central Lancashire, Sandy Hobbs, Sandra Lindsay and Jim McKechnie at the University of Paisley.

Notes

- 1 The tone of journalistic treatment of the topic may be judged from the following headlines: 'Paper weight lifters' (*The Observer*, 18 December 1988), 'Paper tigers on the newsround' (*The Guardian*, 11 August 1989), 'Scandal of the Possil pieman' (*Evening Times*, Glasgow, 12 February 1990), 'Child slave anger' (*Evening News*, Edinburgh, 9 March 1991), 'In the soup' (*The People*, 10 March 1991), 'Jungle kids in circus fury' (*Scottish Sport*, 21 June 1991), 'Young flower sellers at risk' (*The Independent on Sunday*, 27 June 1993), 'MP denounces "lenient" fine for child labour man' (*The*

Scotsman, 12 November 1993), 'Child "Sweat Shop" Probe' (*Lancashire Evening Post*, 12 April 1994). Press accounts tend to favour the use of 'child' and 'children' although in some cases 'adolescent' might seem a more suitable description. Many 14 and 15-year olds doubtless dislike being termed 'children'. In this paper we are dealing with work by all young people under the statutory school leaving age. To constantly refer to 'children and adolescents' would seem unwieldy, so we have reluctantly settled on 'children' as the least inappropriate single term. Moreover, this corresponds to the terminology of the relevant Acts of Parliament.

- 2 Michael Forsyth, Minister of State for Employment, and Tim Yeo, Parliamentary Secretary of State for Health, both appeared before the House of Lords Select Committee on the European Communities when it was considering Protection of Young People at Work. Forsyth also appeared before the House of Commons European Standing Committee B when it was considering the same issue. These individuals are no longer in the government posts they then held but their statements would appear to reflect the continuing government position. See, for example, the section 'The proposed directive on young people in employment' in the Department of Employment document, *The United Kingdom in Europe: People, Jobs and Progress*, August 1993. As we were revising this paper, Gerry Malone, Minister for Health, answering a Labour Party call for stricter legislation, argued child employment 'is already very strictly regulated' ('New laws to stop children working urged', *The Independent*, 29 August 1994).
- 3 Examples of such local studies include Brown (1987) who dealt with South Wales, Finn (1984) and Mizen (1992) who both dealt with the Midlands, and MacLennan, Fitz and Sullivan (1985) who dealt with two areas of South East England. See too the works by the present authors listed in Note 4 below.
- 4 Our earlier empirical research on child employment in Britain has appeared in the following works: Hobbs, Lindsay and McKechnie (1993a), Hobbs, Lindsay and McKechnie (1993b), Lavalette (1994), Lavalette, McKechnie and Hobbs (1991), McKechnie, Lindsay and Hobbs (1993), McKechnie, Lindsay and Hobbs (1994).
- 5 Earlier British studies showing that some school children work long hours include MacLennan, Fitz and Sullivan (1985), Balding (1991), and Lavalette, McKechnie and Hobbs (1991).
- 6 See, for example, Nichols and Armstrong (1973) and Lavalette and Wright (1991).
- 7 Earlier British studies dealing with children's accidents at work include MacLennan, Fitz and Sullivan (1985), Pond and Searle (1991), Lavalette, McKechnie and Hobbs (1991), Murray (1991), McKechnie, Lindsay and Hobbs (1993), Hobbs, Lindsay and McKechnie (1993) and McKechnie, Lindsay and Hobbs (1994).
- 8 See, for example, MacInness (1987), Esping-Andersen (1990), Wilson (1992) and Low Pay Network (1993).
- 9 A number of American empirical studies suggest that work can have beneficial effects. As examples of such benefits, we note: enhancement of personal responsibility (Greenberger and Steinberg, 1981), enhancement of the work ethic (Green, 1990), increased earning potential in the first five post-school years (Finch and Mortimer, 1985), provision of useful careers information (Vangelesti, 1988).
- 10 Several American empirical studies suggest that work can have costs. Examples of costs include: acceptance of unethical work practices (Steinberg, Greenberger, Vaux and Ruggiero, 1981), greater access to drugs and alcohol (Greenberger, Steinberg and Vaux, 1981), lower academic achievement (D'Amico, 1984), breakdown of family ties (Steinberg and Dornbusch, 1991), increased delinquency (Steinberg and Dornbusch, 1991).
- 11 Relationships between employment, on one hand, and school attitudes and performance, on the other, have been explored previously in McKechnie, Lindsay and Hobbs (1993), Hobbs, Lindsay and McKechnie (1993a), Hobbs, Lindsay and McKechnie (1993b) and McKechnie, Lindsay and Hobbs (1994).
- 12 See proceedings of the Tecklenburg conference (Vuzina and Schaffer, 1992). The significance of the conference is discussed in Hobbs, Lavalette and McKechnie (1992).

References

Bachman, J. G., and Schulenberg, J. (1993) 'How Part-Time Work Intensity Relates to Drug Use, Problem Behaviour, Time Use and Satisfaction Among High School Seniors: Are these Consequences or Merely Correlates?', in *Developmental Psychology*, vol. 29, no. 2, pp. 220-235.

- Balding, J. (1991) 'A Study of Working Children in 1990...', in *Education and Health*, vol. 9, no. 1, pp. 4-6.
- Brown, P. (1987) *Schooling Ordinary Kids : Inequality, Unemployment and the New Vocationalism*, London, Tavistock.
- Carvel, J. (1994) 'Child Labour Opt-Out "Revolt"', *The Guardian*, 17 January.
- Ciwyd, A. (1994) *Children at Risk!*, London: Labour Party.
- Cummings, S., and Taebel, D. (1978) 'The Economic Socialization of Children: A Neo-Marxist Analysis', in *Social Problems*, vol. 26, pp. 198-210.
- D'Amico, R. (1984) 'Does Employment During High School Impair Academic Progress?', in *Sociology of Education*, vol. 57, July, pp. 152-164.
- Davies, D. E. (1972) 'Work Out of School', in *Education*, 10 November, pp. i-iv.
- Department of Employment (1993) *The United Kingdom in Europe: People, Jobs and Progress*, Department of Employment.
- Esping-Andersen, J. (1990) *The Three Worlds of Welfare Capitalism*, Oxford, Polity Press.
- Finch, M. D. and Mortimer, J. T. (1985) 'Adolescent Work Hours and the Process of Achievement', in *Research in the Sociology of Education*, vol. 5, pp. 171-196.
- Finn, D. (1984) 'Leaving School and Growing Up: Work Experience in the Juvenile Labour Market', in Bates, I. (Ed.), *Schooling for the Dole? The New Vocationalism*, London, MacMillan, pp. 17-64.
- Fyfe, A. (1989) *Child Labour*, Cambridge, Polity Press.
- Green, D. L. (1990) 'High School Student Employment in Social Context: Adolescent's Perceptions of the Role of Part-Time Work', in *Adolescence*, vol. 25, no. 98, pp. 425-434.
- Greenberger, E., Steinberg, L. D., and Vaux, A. (1981) 'Adolescents Who Work: Health and Behavioural Consequences of Job Stress', in *Developmental Psychology*, vol. 17, no. 6, pp. 691-703.
- Greenberger, E. and Steinberg, L. D. (1981) 'The Workplace as a Context for the Socialization of Youth', in *Journal of Youth and Adolescence*, vol. 10, no. 3, pp.185-210.
- Greenberger, E., and Steinberg, L. (1986) *When Teenagers Work : The Psychological and Social Costs of Adolescent Employment*, New York, Basic Books Inc.
- Hobbs, S., Lavalette, M. and McKechnie, J. (1992) 'The Emerging Problem of Child Labour', in *Critical Social Policy*, vol. 34, Summer, pp. 93-105.
- Hobbs, S., Lindsay, S., and McKechnie, J. (1993 a) 'Part-Time Employment and Schooling' in *Scottish Educational Review*, vol.25, no. 1, pp. 53-60.
- Hobbs, S., Lindsay, S., and McKechnie, J. (1993 b) *Children at Work : Part-Time Employment in North Tyneside*, A Report to North Tyneside Council, University of Paisley.
- House of Commons Parliamentary Debates, European Standing Committee B, 19 May 1993, *Protection of Young People At Work*, London, HMSO.
- House of Lords Select Committee on the European Communities, Report No. 23, 29 June 1993, *Protection of Young People at Work*, London, HMSO.
- Lavalette, M., McKechnie, J., and Hobbs, S. (1991) *The Forgotten Workforce : Scottish Children at Work*, Glasgow, Scottish Low Pay Unit.
- Lavalette, M. and Wright, C. (1991) 'The Cullen Report - Making the North Sea Safe?', in *Critical Social Policy*, vol. 31, Summer, pp. 60-69.
- Lavalette, M. (1994) *Child Employment in the Capitalist Labour Market*, Aldershot, Avebury.
- Low Pay Network (1993) *Save Wages Councils : A Briefing Paper on the Abolition of Wages Councils* .
- MacInness, J. (1987) *Thatcherism at Work : Industrial Relations and Economic Change*, Milton Keynes, Open University Press.
- McKechnie, J., Lindsay, S., and Hobbs, S. (1993) *Child Employment in Cumbria : A Report to Cumbria County Council*, University of Paisley.

McKechnie, J., Lindsay, S., and Hobbs, S. (1994), *Still Forgotten : Child Employment in Dumfries and Galloway*, Glasgow, Scottish Low Pay Unit.

MacLennan, E., Fitz, J., and Sullivan, J. (1985) *Working Children*, Low Pay Unit Report No. 2.

Manning, N. (1987) 'What is a Social Problem?', in Loney, M., Bocock, R., Clarke, J., Cochrane, A., Graham, P. and Wilson, M., *The State or the Market*, London, Sage.

Mizen, P. (1992) 'Learning the Hard Way: The Extent and Significance of Child Working in Britain', in *British Journal of Education and Work*, vol. 5, no. 1, pp.5-17.

Murray, J. (1991) 'The Working Children Project', in Lavalette, M. et al, *The Forgotten Workforce : Scottish Children at Work*, Glasgow, Scottish Low Pay Unit, pp. 76-95.

Nichols T. and Armstrong, P. (1973) *Safety or Profits : Industrial Accidents and the Conventional Wisdom*, Bristol, Falling Wall Press.

Pond, C., and Searle, A. (1991) *The Hidden Army : Children at Work in the 1990s*, London, Low Pay Unit.

Steinberg, L. D., Greenberger, E., Vaux, A., and Ruggiero, M. (1981) 'Early Work Experience: Effects on Adolescent Occupational Socialization' in *Youth & Society*, vol. 12, no. 4, pp. 403-422.

Steinberg, L. and Dornbusch, S. M. (1991) 'Negative Correlates of Part-Time Employment During Adolescence: Replication and Elaboration', in *Developmental Psychology*, vol. 27, no. 2, pp. 304-313.

Vangelisti, A. (1988) 'Adolescent Socialization into the Workplace: A Synthesis and Critique of Current Literature' in *Youth & Society*, vol 19, no. 4, pp. 460-484.

Vuzina, D. and Schaffer, H. (ed) (1992) *Kinderarbeit in Europa*, Dusseldorf, Ministerium fur Arbeit, Gesundheit und Soziales des Landes, Nordrhein-Westfalen.

Wilson, E. (1992) *A Very British Miracle : The Failure of Capitalism*, London, Pluto Press.

YOUTH PARTICIPATION

I am a community worker in Middlesbrough and am currently undertaking some research in the above area.

In addition to collecting information across the broad spectrum of 'Youth Participation' models, I am particularly keen to examine projects aimed at increasing involvement of young people in the affairs of their neighbourhoods.

I would be grateful to hear from anyone with experience of current or past projects and can be contacted on (0642) 829934 (work) · (0429) 269116 (home).

Malcolm Walker
Area One Community Development Team
43 Deepdale Avenue
Grove Hill
Cleveland
TS4 2XD

YOUNG WOMEN'S CAREER ASPIRATIONS:

What Happens to Them?

IAN PROCTER and MAUREEN PADFIELD¹

Abstract

This paper reports results from a small scale project based on interviews with young adult women who were single and childless but employed full-time in the adult labour market. Interviews revealed a strong commitment to work, manifest from the time of leaving school to the present, between two and eight years later. Little evidence was found for the dominion of future domesticity reported by other studies of young women. The paper seeks to explain work commitment in terms of three factors which seem to hold across the wide range of occupations held by the women in the study:

- a) *self determination whereby the women planned and organised their lives;*
- b) *family support for daughters' employment rather than pressure toward marriage;*
- c) *at unplanned 'fateful moments' in the women's working lives the balance of fortune had favoured them.*

On the basis of this analysis some comment is made on recent debate about choice and determinism in the youth labour market. The conclusion raises but cannot determine whether the results indicate a changing world or highlights the experience of women neglected by previous studies.

Introduction

This paper arises out of a small research project² based on interviews³ with 39 women, each of whom was 18 to 24 years of age, single, childless and employed full-time. Our reasons for targeting such a group were that women at that phase of the life course have been neglected in other research yet they seemed to us to be a potentially significant group in the study of gender, work and family. By contrast to studies of women at the point of transition from school to the labour market (Griffin 1985, Lees 1986, 1993, Wallace 1987) and studies of marriage and motherhood (Leonard 1980, Mansfield and Collard 1988, Brannen and Moss 1991, Clark 1991) we knew of no research on women who were young adults, established in full-time jobs and without ties to partner or children. Earlier research (Hunt 1968, Martin and Roberts 1984) had suggested that successive generations of women were becoming less 'traditional' in their expectations for family and work. It seemed to us that women with the characteristics we specified were the most likely to hold non-traditional attitudes. Our first objective was thus to enquire whether this was the case and what was distinctive about our interviewees' experience and expectations. We asked them about their past work and household histories, their recollections of what they had expected in life when they left school and their current plans and expectations for future family and work. The interviews were carefully structured by us in specifying what we asked about but designed to encourage the interviewee to speak freely about her experience and ideas.

A second immediate⁴ objective was to investigate whether we were detecting a general pattern amongst women with the characteristics we specified or whether

there were variations amongst them. Our limited resources meant that we could only control for occupational differences and not for other significant distinctions, especially ethnicity. As Figure 1 indicates, the women in our interview group covered a wide range of occupations. Within the context of this paper it is important to emphasise that the interview group is not restricted to those in higher status occupations. But we should also note that, as well as the characteristics we specified, the women we interviewed are all white and heterosexual. This was not by design but a side effect of our accessing procedure. Most of our interviewees were recruited via mature students in the Coventry and Warwickshire area. Whilst this was successful in giving us a spread of occupations, it did not access ethnic minority or lesbian women. We return to the question of generality in our conclusion but we should be quite clear here that we are not in a position to say whether ethnicity or sexual orientation would significantly influence our findings.

The paper is divided into three main sections. The first discusses women's recollections of their plans for family and work when they were leaving school. The second section is concerned with their present plans for employment in the foreseeable future. In both of these we will stress the women's strong commitment to work. The third section explores what has sustained this work commitment since leaving school.

Figure 1: The occupations of the women in the interview group.

Using the Standard Occupational Classification's Major Groups (OPCS 1990: 5)

<p>Managers and administrators Bar and restaurant manager Business analyst Customer liaison manager Gym manager Quality control manager</p>	<p>Craft and related occupations None</p>
<p>Professional occupations Chartered accountant Civil engineer Management accountant Primary teacher</p>	<p>Personal and protective service occupations Bar person Care assistant Care assistant Care assistant Fitness instructor Nursing assistant Nursery nurse Waitress</p>
<p>Associate professional and technical occupations Accountancy technician Graphic designer Veterinary nurse</p>	<p>Sales occupations Assistant shop manager Fast food sales person Field sales representative Shop assistant Shop assistant Supermarket check-out operator Telephone salesperson</p>
<p>Clerical and secretarial occupations Applications analyst Civil service clerk Computer operator Drawing office assistant Library assistant Local government (housing) clerk Medical secretary Parts person (car dealership) Secretary Secretary/receptionist Senior insurance clerk</p>	<p>Plant and machine operatives None</p> <p>Other occupations Cinema assistant</p>

Retrospect: Expectations for family and employment when leaving school

A number of studies have explored young women's expectations of family and employment at the time of leaving school and entering the labour market. By far the strongest themes in these studies are young women's pre-occupation with their sexual identities, their relationship with young men and their acceptance of the inevitability of future traditional domestic roles. Expectations regarding employment are limited by these parameters of seeking boyfriends and the primacy of marital/mother roles. These themes were first developed in Leonard's *Sex and Generation* (1980) reporting field work undertaken in the late 1960s. They reoccur in studies reporting field work in the late 1970s and throughout the 1980s (Griffin 1985, Lees 1986, 1993, Rees 1992: Chap 3). On occasion a ray of light peeps through but is soon extinguished. The Girls and Occupational Choice project (Holland 1985, Chisholm and Du Bois-Reymond 1993) found that younger girls had higher aspirations but these were scaled down as the realities of the labour market were taken on board. Wallace (1987: 82-84) reports a distancing from domesticity until young women were discouraged by their experience in the youth labour market.

All of these report the perceptions and aspirations of young women still at school or in the uncertainties of the youth labour market (Roberts et al 1986). Our interviewees had entered the labour market between two and six years earlier and were, in the main, established in adult jobs. In our study we asked the women about their expectations for family and employment at the time they were leaving school. In these recollections we do not get a sense of preoccupation with boyfriends and future domestic roles, rather the seriousness of commitment to employment is the central theme to come across. To convey this we will briefly outline summary findings on relationships with boyfriends at the time of leaving school, expectations regarding marriage and how, at that time, the women anticipated combining employment and family responsibilities. We will then turn to their ideas about the jobs and careers they wished to go on to. This section will conclude with a brief methodological note on using retrospective data.

(a) Expectations with regard to future family

Boyfriends

To begin with relations with boyfriends at the point of leaving school, the first point to make is that the majority of our interview group, 24 of the 39, did not have a steady boyfriend at that time. Of the remaining 15, the biggest group, (nine), saw boyfriends and school work as separate matters. Here, when we asked whether boyfriends were an encouragement or distraction to school work the response was that neither of these applied, the relationship did not concern school matters.

IP What did he think about schoolwork, what sort of influence do you think he had on you?

*Rena Renault*⁶ *Um. We didn't really talk about schoolwork much because he'd just left school, he'd just started a job, so he didn't... I didn't want to talk about... He didn't really have an interest in it really, only what I did in the day with my friends. Not to do with work.*

In six cases it did - two women had boyfriends who encouraged schoolwork, four had distracting relationships. Realising this, one woman decided to 'knock it on the head'

(Jade Johnson) to concentrate on her studies. That leaves three who, in retrospect, saw their work at school as being undermined by their relationship to their boyfriend.

IP Now you've said you perhaps didn't do quite as well at school as you might have done. Do you think your boyfriend was part of that?

Roxanne Daltry Probably, yeah (laughter) yeah.

IP Can you tell me a bit more about that...

Roxanne Daltry Well he was, like as I said, a bit older and he had a car and we used to go to the pub with him and that, and I sort of didn't want to be a school kid anymore.

Two interviewees, however, became engaged immediately after leaving school. Both insisted that their relationship with their fiancée-to-be had not interrupted their school-work, and they both did reasonably well in their examinations. The engagements lasted for some time after school and were both broken off by the woman, citing the way in which their lives had separated. Both look back with some puzzlement to their early engagements and suggest that it was 'the thing to do' at the time.

IP So this was quite a strong steady boyfriend then?

Marie Whelan Looking back, probably not, at the time it seemed like it.

IP Hmm.

Marie Whelan Not since no...I think it was err one of those things that you just sort of...taken over on a flow.

Here, then, is some evidence of a preoccupation with sexuality and becoming attached to a young man. However, in both cases the woman concerned extricated herself from what seems to her, in retrospect, to be foolishness. More importantly, this was by no means a common pattern amongst our interviewees. To reiterate, the majority did not have boyfriends as they were leaving school and, of those that did, most saw school work and personal relationships as separate and different. In only a small minority of cases do we glimpse the preoccupation with personal relationships suggested by other commentators.

Marriage

Moving now to recollected expectations about marriage. Of the 39, a majority, 24, said that at the time they were leaving school they expected that they would marry at some point in the future. Seven women asserted that at that time they did not anticipate marriage. Three of these did anticipate future cohabitation. The remaining eight individuals refused to give an answer either way, insisting that at that time they did not think about such matters.

MP Did you expect that at some time you would get married?

Joanne Smith I suppose so. But not really! I didn't really think about it.

MP You didn't think about it at all?

Joanne Smith No.

MP Or living with anybody or having children?

Joanne Smith No.

MP No.

Joanne Smith No way.

So, a substantial minority of the women were either against marriage or adamant that at school leaving age they did not give it a thought.

However, the marriage expectations of the majority warrant further analysis. Having stated that they expected to marry at some time they were asked at what age they expected this to occur, again, when they were leaving school. Six gave non numerical answers such as 'not for ages' (Hannah King) or 'haven't got a clue' (Sophie James) but eighteen indicated an age range:

Twenties	1
Early twenties (20-23)	2
Mid twenties (24-26)	9
Late twenties (27-29)	2
Thirty plus	4

Given that this 'prediction' was being made at the age of 16 to 18, the expected age of marriage was at some considerable time in the future and did not indicate marriage as on the foreseeable agenda of life at that time. In only one case was marriage an event which the woman self consciously planned.

MP Did you expect at that time that you'd probably get married?

Clare Cordle Yes.

MP You did.

Clare Cordle Something that I always wanted, it wasn't, it was more, it was more an expectation than err a decision (laugh).

MP What age did you think that?

Clare Cordle Emm well I always thought I'd get married at about twenty two and have children when I was about twenty four....That was something that was quite different at school, that I always wanted that and most of my friends didn't.

The self conscious way in which this woman planned to marry contrasted with her school peers and with the rest of our interviewees. One element in the expectation that they would marry at some point was the recognition that most women do indeed marry. As one woman commented 'It was pretty inevitable.' (Amy Dahl) This recognition is expressed in various ways - as statistically probable, as an idealised dream that most women have, as the 'biological clock' (Diana Cauthen) sending its signal.

In the body of research work noted above the inevitability of marriage is associated with a fatalism which then rules out a serious commitment to work (eg Griffin 1985: 51). But in placing marriage in the mid to late 20s our interviewees were distancing themselves from such an event. In telling us what employment she wanted one woman commented on her expected date of marriage 'I just wanted to do that and that was it, I didn't think about, sort of, ten years time.' (Roxanne Daltry). Common phrases were 'I just thought it was a mile away' (Jane Smith) and 'not for ages' (Sophie James/Hannah King). One way of expressing this was to note that in the teenage years, the mid twenties seemed to mark a time when she would be qualitatively different - 'older'. As one 22 year old said, when she was 18, the age of 25 'seemed very old then'(Diane Williams).

Laura Hill *Emm late twenties yeah.*

IP *Why did you think - that's the age?*

Laura Hill *Because I still thought I was really young and late twenties was sort of old and withered so.*

So although the majority expected to marry this was not something that preoccupied them - rather it was a matter for the distant future.

Combining family and employment

A third indicator here is the women's expectations when they were leaving school as to how they would cope with the demands of family and employment. We asked the following question:

There seems to be three ways in which many women cope with the demands of their family and their work:

- One is not to have children.
- A second is to take short maternity breaks at the time children are born.
- The third is to leave work for a longer period of time whilst children are young.

At the time you were leaving school, which of these appealed to you?

The responses to this question are as follows:

Not to have children	10
To take maternity breaks	9
To withdraw from labour market	15
Interviewee did not know	4
Missing item	1
<hr/>	
Total	39

Within Britain over the post-war period (Bakker 1988, Lewis 1992) by far the most common means of dealing with the issue of combining employment and family is for women to withdraw from the labour market whilst their children are young, returning later (often part-time) as children start schooling. As McRae (1991) has pointed out this pattern seems to be changing rapidly and this seems to be indicated here. Although the single largest group, only 15 out of the 38 individuals for whom we have data anticipated this. Nineteen stated that at the age they were leaving school they anticipated either not having children or taking maternity leave.

So far we have concentrated on women's expectations for their future family when they left school taking three pieces of relevant evidence: their relationship to a steady boyfriend at the time, their views on future marriage and how they anticipated combining employment and family responsibilities. Our general conclusion from this is that our interview group were far from preoccupied with such matters at the time of leaving school. This contrasts with what they told us about their plans for employment at that time to which we now turn.

(b) Expectations regarding employment

We asked our interviewees:

Thinking back to when you were leaving school, did you have any definite plans or ambitions as far as a job was concerned?

A very large proportion of interviewees answered yes and identified a specific occupation that they hoped to enter. This applied to 26 of the 39. Before discussing these further we will turn to the remaining 13 cases. Again, for the most part, the lack of specific vocational plans at that stage did not imply lack of concern with future work.

For seven of them, their intention was to enter higher education. This was their immediate goal and their career plans beyond the three or four years involved were vague partly because of the time perspective required. Of the remaining six individuals, three display a clear career orientation but at the time were unsure of what they wanted to do.

Alannah Miles I didn't know where exactly I was going to end up but I knew wherever I ended up I was going to make a go of it.

Sheila Mann ...I knew I wanted something with a challenge that, you know, that made you use your brain not just, you know, being a robot in an office just going through the motions; emm, what I wanted to do, no I had absolutely no idea at all.

Again, on leaving school at 16, Ronnie Mairoudis had little specific idea of what she wanted to do but 'I wanted to get into a job that led somewhere'. This leaves only three individuals who, at the point of leaving school had neither a clear idea of what they wanted to do nor any strong inclination to find something. For two of these, personal circumstances at the time account for a general sense of alienation which affected their attitude to work.

Thus, the great majority of our group had either a definite occupational intention, or intended to proceed to higher education or wanted to 'do something' without knowing specifically what it was. Furthermore, the 26 who stated a definite intention, had not simply 'plucked their ambitions from thin air'. Their ambitions were serious and their plans were well thought out, being based on experience and research. We indicate this by the following kinds of evidence:

- A long standing intention indicated by the woman saying that she had always wanted to do this, or she had held the intention since childhood.
- Experience of the work involved, through part-time or voluntary work or a work experience scheme
- Awareness of training and qualifications required. A point to note here is that in numerous cases interviewees mentioned the lack of advice, or indeed inappropriate advice, they received from careers officers in schools. The overwhelming impression from our data is that this service is often useless. Thus 'awareness' here very often indicates considerable personal and family effort in researching what was required.
- Application for a relevant vocational course or training
- Choice of or strength in relevant school subjects
- Seeking advice from a practitioner of the occupation.

Figure 2 lists the distribution of these qualities amongst the 26 who hoped to enter a specific occupation. In only one case (marked by *) did the intention seem 'unrealistic' in not being based upon information about the job and/or action to secure entry to the occupation.

Figure 2: Intended occupations and seriousness of intent

Intended occupation	Indicator(s) of seriousness of intent	Intended occupation	Indicator(s) of seriousness of intent
Riding instructor	Part-time job in riding school Owned own horse Long-standing	Veterinary service	Awareness of qualifications required Long-standing
Hairdresser	Saturday job in salon	Engineering	Awareness of qualifications required, despite school indifference Long-standing
Nurse	Awareness of qualifications required, despite school indifference Long-standing	Chemist	Awareness of qualifications required Choice of school subjects
Tourism	Applied for relevant course Long-standing	Accounts	* lack of awareness
Dancer	Dance lessons since 3 years old Applied for relevant course Long-standing	Actress	Child actress, dance lessons since 5 years old Applied for relevant course Long-standing
Dancer	Dance lessons since 3 years old Long-standing	Nurse	Choice of school subjects Applied for relevant course Long-standing
Health professional	Choice of school subjects Long-standing	Theatre	Choice of school subjects Applied for relevant course
Finance (banking/accountancy)	Choice of school subjects Applied for relevant course Work experience placement	Design	Awareness of qualifications required, despite school indifference
Physiotherapist	Voluntary work Awareness of qualifications Long-standing	Nursery nurse	Applied for relevant course
Electronic/electrical engineer	Sought advice from practitioner Choice of school subjects Applied for relevant training	Health	Awareness of qualifications required Sought advice from practitioner
Dancer	Attended school of dance	Accountancy	Enterprise scheme at school Awareness of qualifications required Self organised work experience placement, despite indifference of school
Nursery nurse	Two years voluntary work Work experience placement		
Nanny	Work experience placement		
Catering	Awareness of qualifications required Catering as her hobby	Police force	Awareness of qualifications required Long-standing

The detailed evidence we marshal in Figure 2 leads us to a further, more methodological, point regarding retrospective data. The use of autobiographical data has become common in social history (Thompson 1988) and the sociology of economic

life (Dex 1991). Yet people's memories are clearly selective and there is a need for caution in deploying recollections as evidence. In this particular context we have claimed that at points in their past lives interviewees prioritised their work commitment rather than their sexual identity. Could this be a reflection of their present priorities rather than an accurate recollection of their past thoughts and feelings? In asking our retrospective questions we tried to avoid projecting the present to the past by establishing a chronological framework in which meanings and motivations could be located⁷. Two aspects of this are important. First, the chronology is partly 'factual' in the sense of establishing 'matters of fact'. Examples are how old the woman was when she left school, the type of school it was, where she was living at the time. This grounds questions of how she felt and thought at the time in a more existential context. But such a grounding is not only factual but also chronological. Questions such as a woman's thoughts about her future marriage did not come to her abstractly but in the context of telling her life story since she left school.

The data we have rehearsed above leads us to give considerable credibility to the women's retrospective accounts. We did not get 'idealised' memories. For example, many of the occupational intentions they reported have not worked out. Interviewees clearly distinguished between what they had hoped to do and what actually happened. Further, they described their intentions with supporting evidence. This is why we have included the details of Figure 2. Insofar as an interviewee informs us that she became interested in electronics whilst helping her grandfather repair televisions, had specifically taken school subjects to enable her to pursue this and had applied for apprenticeships with firms X and Y, then it seems churlish to define her (unfulfilled) intention to become an electronic / electrical engineer as retrospective invention. The same goes for marriage intentions. Interviewees were quite clear about what they had felt in the past and, as our examples above indicate, often elaborated to support what they said, drawing comparisons with their present views or those of their contemporaries.

2. Prospect: Plans regarding future work

We now turn from the women's recollections of their past to their present aspirations for their future. As we explained, all 39 were in full-time employment at the time of the interview. Some, but not many, were in jobs with an inbuilt career structure. However, what is striking is the large proportion of the group who are 'career oriented' in the sense that they have a well worked out plan for developing their working lives. Of the 39, 30 can be characterised in this way. To reiterate, this feature of clearly defined plans for future work does not apply only to those in occupations which we associate with 'careers' in the sense of structured upward movement in salary, responsibility or seniority. Work plans are found amongst those who, on the face of it, occupied jobs which were static in these terms. However, through education, training, job change and self employment, women in jobs without career trajectories could and did plan developmental paths for their work in the future.⁸

Three women were still trainees on inhouse training programmes for veterinary nursing, management accountancy and public house management. Five were continuing with vocational qualifications on a part-time basis; in marketing, civil engineering, quality management, social work and accountancy. Seven were in the process of job change, some applying for jobs, others in the midst of the selection process, others about to start new jobs. In each case this was a self-initiated move,

to progress to a better job, rather than arising from redundancy. Four women had applied or been accepted for a course of full-time training or education, in drama, nursing and the law. Four women employed in large organisations saw themselves on a promotion ladder with realistic possibilities. Two examples are a woman who had just completed a management traineeship with a car manufacturer and was working her way through different departments and a woman who worked as a field sales representative in newspaper advertising and intended to manage a sales team. Three had medium term strategies which required them to attain a defined age or accumulate experience, for example, a 19 year old woman who intends to apply for the mounted police when she reaches the required age of 21. Finally, the plans of four women involved self-employment. This was not an idle dream (Goldthorpe 1968, Wallace 1987), one had just started her own business, the others worked in the rapidly expanding areas of fitness training and childcare.

Of the nine who did not have some definite plan we can note that two had contingency plans for the future but felt that current recessionary times made change unlikely. One other deserves mention. She had definite plans but they were for family formation and possibilities within employment (to upgrade her qualification) interfered with this. Two women were content where they were. This left four women who were stuck in jobs they would rather be out of. Again recessionary times inhibited movement but here the individuals concerned had little idea of what to move to. Thus, the great majority of women had realistic and well thought out plans for development in their working lives. The minority did not but even here recession in the economy was a dampener on aspiration to change. In sum, the vast majority of our group of interviewees were 'career' minded for their foreseeable future.

3. Analysis: What has sustained career orientation?

We have attempted to demonstrate that when these women left school they were seriously committed to work. Furthermore, this has been sustained and with several years experience of the labour market they display a continued determination to develop their working lives. Given the uncertainties of the youth labour market (Roberts 1986, Banks et al 1992), the inbuilt discrimination against women (Dale and Joshi 1992) and the recessionary conditions of the early nineteen nineties, this seems to be rather remarkable. We thus move on to explore what seems to have sustained this high degree of career orientation in these women's working lives. We will discuss three factors which seem important: self-determination, family support and the balance of fortune at fateful moments.

This discussion will allow us to comment on recent debate on the consequences of the restructuring of the youth labour market (Banks et al 1992, Roberts 1994). There can be no doubt that a restructuring has occurred. By comparison with the past only a small proportion of 16 and 17 year olds are in employment. Far more are in a wide range of educational and training courses and some are unemployed. One interpretation of these changes is that they represent a much greater degree of openness and choice for young people as they shape their own 'package' of education, training, experience and employment. To others this is a gross distortion. Restructuring the post-compulsory education years has occurred but along familiar lines of class, gender and race. These factors exert a determining influence on young people's prospects and individual choice is an illusion (Bates 1993, Roberts 1993).

Self-determination.

The interviews are striking in the presence of elements of initiative, determination and planning which these women have shown in their post school working lives. Although we begin with self-determination, we will go on to show that career orientation has been sustained by support systems and structurally available opportunities and constraints. In all cases these women's plans and aspirations have been sustained and shaped by a determining context. A little later we will turn to the relationship between 'plans and aspirations' and 'a determining context'. But we begin by establishing that in most cases there have been key points when the woman's self-determined action has been crucial. There are many manifestations of this, often in complex ways. The following typology is illustrative rather than systematic; its aim is to bring out different ways in which the woman's intervention in her own life has been crucial. Whilst we have classified each case under only one heading, in many cases there are multiple elements involved.

Long term strategic planning (five cases).

Here the woman had a clear goal which was not immediately achievable because of some obstacle which had to be overcome. Her actions were guided by the goal and getting round the obstacle. In most cases the goal was entry to some occupation (police, veterinary nursing, nursing).⁹ The obstacles in the way were age requirements, qualifications not obtained at school and cautious advice from others, especially parents. Action taken was not simply to 'wait' for the appropriate age but to take work which would be relevant to the intended occupation and prove to others that the commitment was serious, and to take (and retake) academic qualifications so that the occupation's entry demands were met.

Example: Toni Penn has wanted to join the police force since school. Minimum age of application is 18. On leaving school at 16 she took a computing course in Further Education to reassure her parents that she had something to fall back on. Most other students applied for Higher Education but Toni resisted this. Having gained this qualification she extended her part-time job in retailing to full-time with the explicit intention of broadening her inter-personal skills. Again, she refused an offer of a traineeship. Her parents were not happy about this so she took her present job in computers to show that the 'fallback' was viable. At time of interview she was in the middle of an extended process of tests and interviews for the police force.

Job spiralling (three cases).

In these cases, at the time of leaving school career intentions were not clear but what was quite definite was the objective of making a 'success' of working life. The years since have involved a number of job changes in which a) the goal has been clarified through experience and b) the job changes have been geared to edging nearer to the goal.

Example: Ronnie Mairoudis left school at 16 with a strong sense of where her strengths lay (in inter-personal communication) but no clear idea how to express these in an occupation. In six years she has accumulated experience in a short lived YTS, a spell as a 'temp' in clerical work and

six different jobs as a receptionist (double glazing, solicitors, hotels), sales administrator for a manufacturing company and her present job as a field sales representative selling newspaper advertising. She self consciously sees this as a process of learning that she was good at selling and gaining the experience of responsibility to qualify for the job. Her job changes have been managed to clarify what she was good at and to enable her to do it.

Job change (three cases).

This again involves (mainly but not exclusively) self initiated job change but without the sense of clarification of ultimate objective or an 'upward' progression. Rather, job change is to seek more satisfying work, but in a more 'horizontal' movement.

Example: *as a student, Diane Williams intended to work abroad, deploying her degree qualification in languages and business studies. Her student experience of living abroad led her to change her mind and she switched to marketing, taking a job with a manufacturing company. Various aspects of this were unsatisfactory (lack of training and promotion; sexual harassment) and she moved to her present job training as a chartered accountant in the public sector.*

Combining jobs, benefit and freelancing (four cases)

In this case the woman does not at the time have a stable full-time job but engineers an opportunity for more stable employment by combining multiple jobs, freelance work and (least importantly) benefit.

Example: *Caroline Waterhouse had trained as a graphic designer and had two jobs working in this field, both of which she lost through redundancy. She was determined to stay in the work she was trained for and talented in and for a period combined unemployment, some commission based work she generated and occasional casual unskilled work until she obtained the backing to become self-employed.*

Making part-time jobs full-time (three cases).

In most cases (and there are many more than the three here in which it was the most prominent feature) the part-time job is held whilst the woman is in education or training. This clearly gives the employer the opportunity to inspect a potential full time worker but what should also be noted here is that the initiative for the change in hours comes from the woman rather than the employer.

Example: *Maddie Price took a part-time job in a pub to partially support her post-graduate course. Towards the end of her course, she asked the manager about the opportunity for management jobs within the brewery and he set up an interview for her, by-passing the usual application processes.*

Personal initiative (three cases).

Here a crucial intervention was made as a result of some particular but clear decision.

Example: *Alex Forrester had attended a school of dance but left at 16. At that time she had a boyfriend problem. At 16 she and her friend registered*

with an agency and found work as dancers in Portugal. She has done this on short term contracts interspersed with pub work ever since.

In all the above manifestations of self determination the need for initiative, planning or resilience has arisen from the woman's desire to develop her work. But there are also cases where the need for self determination arises from circumstances which demand some responses, either active or passive. The following are instances of active responses to outside pressures.

Women working in predominantly 'male' occupations (three cases).

Here the woman was subject to forms of opposition or discouragement which she had to actively fight against.

Example: Jade Louise had desperately wanted to train as an electronic or electrical engineer but her lack of English O level thwarted both applications for apprenticeships and a place on a YTS in electronics. She was accepted for a YTS in motor parts. She was the only woman and received 'stick' from both trainers and other trainees. This she found hard and it required considerable determination to remain on the course. She completed and was taken on by her placement garage.

Jade Louise I was at college with twelve of the lads who at sixteen did not appreciate a female being there and I always got left with, like, the ones that were a bit slower. I always got lumbered with them, if I got something right I was a prude, if I got something wrong I was sick cos I was female, I had all these sexist jokes a lot. I used to hate going to college after school definitely. Oh you got a lot of verbal, I'd walk through the workshop and get grabbed but you just hit 'em (laugh) I did, I hit 'em, I hit 'em, I'd chase them round the workshop with hammers the lot (laugh).

Response to crisis (five cases).

Here the crisis often spans both work and personal life and demands some solution otherwise the woman is in danger of going under, of losing job, home, family or her sanity.

Example: Sarah Brown had trained as a laboratory technician and taken her BTEC. At 17 she had left home because of the conflict between her parents and later moved in with her boyfriend. At 18 she went to the local Polytechnic to start a science degree. Her relationship broke up, she returned to the friction and anxiety of her parental home, and she found being a woman on the degree course isolating. She did very little work and was on the verge of a nervous breakdown. At this point of crisis she moved to London, to share accommodation with friends, taking temporary jobs with technology based firms to retain her links with science.

Family support

In their working lives these women have received degrees of support from colleagues, friends, and occasionally boyfriends. Yet this is overshadowed by the support given by the woman's family of origin. It is important to say something about the family background of these women at the time of the interview. In 32 cases the

family of origin was a partnered couple, of which 26 were married natural parents, five included a step-parent and one a widowed but partnered parent. Turning to parental economic status, 31 fathers were employed, three retired, three were unemployed and two were not known to the woman because of loss of contact. Of the mothers, 30 were employed, two unemployed, six were 'housewives' and one deceased. Putting these points together we see a high proportion of two 'parent' households and a high proportion of employed parents.

We can also look at this situation in terms of the social class origins of the interviewees. We have not the space here to consider complex indicators of class and we will simply use father's / stepfather's occupation to show the family social class from which the woman originated, using the Registrar-Generals' classification¹⁰. The family social class of the interviewees was as follows.

I	Professional	4
II	Intermediate	13
III N	Skilled non-manual	4
III M	Skilled manual	14
IV	Partly skilled manual	1
V	Unskilled manual	0
Total		36

A number of points are immediately evident from this data. First is the virtual absence of family backgrounds in social classes IV and V. But, second, is the presence of families from class III M, the skilled manual working class. In conjunction with what we have said about the marital and employment status of parents we suggest that it is not the middle - working class division which is significant here but the capacity of the family of origin to materially support a daughter's efforts.

We can initially indicate this by focussing on the 25 who lived in the parental household at the time of the interview, plus one who lived with her grandfather. In Figure 3 we present a comparison of their current pay and what they paid for their board and accommodation. From Figure 3 we can see that their accommodation payments were modest in relationship to their income, the real costs of their accommodation, and their age. In only one case, marked *, is the amount paid a substantial proportion of her income. This was the only case again in which the amount paid to parents was reasonably near the rate paid by, for example, students, for board and lodgings - and in most cases our observation of the home circumstances would confirm that they were considerably more comfortable than many students. Taking account of the age of our interviewees is of interest. Using survey data, Jones and Wallace (1993: 83-92) suggest that the economic balance between parents and young adult children tilts toward the latter making more substantial contributions as the young adult gets into her late teens and early 20s. Like the mean age of the group as a whole, the 26 included in the table have a mean age of 21. Yet there is little indication that despite these individuals being 'adult' rather than 'youth', they were paying the economic costs of their accommodation. We can thus conclude that the predominant practice in these households was for parents to substantially subsidise their daughters¹¹.

Figure 3: Comparison of income and payment to parents of those who lived in the parental home. (1)

Age	Weekly net income	Weekly payment to parents	Notes
18	£80	£10	
19	£56	£10	
19	£87	£10	
19	£90	£10	
19	£90	Transports brother to school in lieu	
19	£92	£15	
19	£95	None	
19	£100	£60	(*)
19	£108	£10	
19	£110	NOT KNOWN	(2)
19	£111	£40	
20	UNCLEAR	None	
20	£148	£10	
21	Variable	£10	
21	£125	£10	(1)
22	£112	NOT KNOWN	(2)
22	£174	£25	
22	£180	NOT KNOWN	(2)
24	IRREGULAR	None	
24	£150	£35	
24	£159	£30	
24	£173	£40	
24	£173	NOT KNOWN	(2)
24	£180	Contributes to groceries	
24	£202	NOT KNOWN	(2)
24	£209	£25	

Notes

(1) plus one who lived with her grandparent.

(2) in all these cases except one contextual data suggests that the payment was not substantial but we did not obtain an actual figure.

As well as parents subsidising their daughter's living costs there are many instances of parents materially assisting their daughters at key points in their lives. The main examples are:

- Providing employment in the family run firm¹² (five cases).
- A parent acting as a contact and spokesperson in obtaining a job (six cases).
- Providing accommodation after the breakdown of a cohabiting relationship (seven cases).
- Financial assistance in debt situations (four cases).
- Provision of rent free accommodation outside the family home (three cases).

In total 16 individuals received such substantial material support from their parents.

So far we have discussed parental support in material terms. At least as important is the much less tangible encouragement and backing which many of these

women received from their parents. We will give some indication of this by using a question we used toward the end of the interview when our interviewees were asked to look back over the period since leaving school and tell us:

...what has been most important to you, your work, close relationships, your family...what do you think?

The responses to this question were often complex, the suggested priorities were not mutually exclusive and the main priority was often hedged with qualification. Note also that this question was not asked of our first six interviewees, being inserted on the basis of some revision of the schedule at that point. But of the 33 responses, 17 clearly nominated their family (of origin) as being most important to them over this time. Nine said work, five relationships and friends, with two giving responses which did not fit any of these.

We have indicated earlier how important continuing and developing employment was to these women. Yet in this overall reflection, half of them recognised the importance of their families to them. This was not as against their work but recognising the support which their families had given them in their working lives. The following statement sums this up

MP Right. Now looking back at your life since you left school, what do you think has been the most important to you, your work, close relationships or your family?

Amy Dahl Um. That's difficult because all three of them... um, probably my family because I think they've always been there for me whatever... you know, whatever's been happening at work or in my close relationships, the family unit has always been quite solid and fair whatever else has been happening around me.

The balance of fortune at fateful moments

So far we have drawn out the importance of self-determination and family support in sustaining the women's career orientation. In general sociological terms the former points to the importance of voluntaristic choice, the latter to structural determination. From the account above it is clear that we regard neither of these as adequate in itself. A glance at the interviewees' occupations in Figure 1 shows them to be overwhelmingly 'women's' jobs. There is little evidence here of any move from a gender segregated labour market. We have already noted that although a fair proportion of our interviewees come from working class families these are overwhelmingly from the 'upper' reaches of the working class and, irrespective of class, from two parent / worker families. These gender and class determinations mean that choices made are not freely available to all. But on the other hand we find that structural conditions are equally inadequate in themselves to provide explanation. We can return to the impact of the woman's family class of origin to illustrate this. We find that family social class is very loosely linked to the woman's own social class position as indicated by her occupation. For example, of the 13 women who originated from social class II, the 'Intermediate' middle class, three have remained there, two have moved to class I (Professional), five are located in III N (Skilled non manual) and three in IV, (Partly skilled manual). Again, of the 14

who originated in families of the skilled working class, four are themselves located in class II (Intermediate), six in class III N (Skilled non manual) and four in class IV (Partly skilled). Clearly this is a crude comparison as the family social class is based on the occupation of middle aged males, the interviewees' social class on the occupations of young adult females. But the extent of variability is striking and shows that, in itself, class as a determining feature is inadequate.

We thus want to include elements of both voluntarism and determinism in our account. This seems to be the position recently arrived at by Roberts and his colleagues (1994) in what they call 'structured individuation'. Roberts has only recently argued for the strength of structural determination (1993) but now concedes:

Maybe British youth researchers, in stressing the extent to which their subjects' career prospects have changed as a result of trends in the surrounding labour markets, in many cases for the worse, have neglected individuals' continuing scope to make significant choices. Some major recent British investigations have not even bothered to question young people about their own career aspirations. (1994: 51)

One reason for this concession is the recognition that the whole transition from youth to adulthood has become far more complex and contingent in employment, family status and citizenship terms (Wallace 1987). In the past, (and Anderson's (1985) work shows this to be for a brief historical moment), the life course for women from education to motherhood seemed highly predictable. By contrast, as Roberts et al put it:

Like the young people's careers, the bounds of their probable opportunities were individualised and varied according to the multitude of configurations created by different combinations of family and educational backgrounds, gender, place of residence, and prior training and employment experience. (1994: 51)

In a wider context, Beck (1992) argues that choice has become important because people are now made to make choices whereas in the past no realistic choice seemed available to them.

So far we have operated within a framework of voluntaristic agency and structural determination. Yet recently some sociologists (Smith 1993, Becker 1994) have argued for a third aspect of explanation in social life - a positive place for chance and coincidence in accounting for why things happen as they do. Until recently appeal to chance has been what Smith calls a 'residual category' in sociology, a mark of the inadequacy of an explanation. For example, to include chance in an explanation of why people get the jobs they do, or don't, would be regarded as a 'failure' as compared to the influence of specified factors such as sex, education, gatekeepers etc. In reviewing recent trends in sociology Smith detects a much more positive attitude emerging to chance as a general category alongside voluntaristic agency and determining structures. Howard Becker's (1994) example of marriage illustrates the general point. Marital partners do choose each other but it is well known that most people marry partners who are very much like themselves in terms of class, ethnicity, education, or locality. But *which* similar person is neither chosen in the abstract nor determined by these factors - it depends upon two paths crossing in an unplanned and unpredictable manner.

Returning to our problem of explaining the career orientations of our interviewees we have found the unexpected intervention of some outside individual or circumstance to be an important aspect of the women's work history. Furthermore, the effect of the unexpected can, from the point of view of the individual concerned, be for good or bad. It can be a 'lucky break' or the operation of 'sod's law'¹³. We have borrowed the term 'fateful moment' from Giddens (1991) to characterise this. As we use it this includes two elements:

- a) A fateful moment occurs when, irrespective of self-determination and/or family support, there is an unexpected turn of events in the woman's working life or in her personal life relevant to her working life.
- b) This can be either positive or negative in its consequences, using the woman's own assessment to make this judgement.

Using these criteria, 29 of the 39 women in our group have experienced one or more fateful moments in their working lives since leaving school¹⁴. In 23 of these cases this amounted to a 'lucky break' - the balance of fortune turned in her direction. In three cases the unexpected worked to her disadvantage and in three cases it is ambiguous. So, overall, fateful moments have been a common occurrence in the interview group and they have generally been positive, sustaining rather than deflecting or deflating the women's commitment to work.

In the nature of the case fateful moments are idiosyncratic in their character as they depend very much on the particularities of circumstance. What we can do is to provide some illustrations of what we mean. Here are three examples of fateful moments which amounted to good fortune for the woman concerned:

- Diana Cauthen had failed to achieve the necessary A level grades to go to university as she had planned. Under pressure from her parents to take a vocationally relevant course she started one as a bilingual secretary. She was not convinced that this was what she wanted but the course involved a two week work placement with a large manufacturing company. She took the opportunity to tell the personnel manager that she would like to work for the company. By coincidence the company had just agreed to start a management trainee scheme for nongraduates and were looking for suitable candidates. She was invited by the manager to apply and became the first entrant, very much sponsored by the company to verify the scheme. Here family pressure and Diana's own initiative coincided with the opportunity to speak with a senior manager who was on the look-out for someone in just her situation.
- Amy Dahl had left school after examination results had prevented her going on to nurse training. She had obtained two part-time jobs, neither of which held out any prospects and she was very much drifting. Out of the blue came a telephone call from the library service. She had done a work experience placement with them at school and very occasional casual work. They suggested she applied for a full-time job they had just advertised. She got the job. So, her self determined plans had been thwarted by lack of educational qualifications but she was available just at the time that an employer needed her.
- Paula Sullivan had worked for her present employer in summer jobs and her mother worked for the firm. She knew she wanted to work in finance but was

not sure in what capacity. She had just begun an experimental degree course at her local further education college but was very uncertain about this when the employer rang her up and offered her a job to train in the area where her strengths lay.

An example of a fateful moment with negative consequences:

- Stevie Edmonds came to her fateful moment at the end of her schooling. She had a place in higher education but was torn between that and staying in the same locality as her boyfriend. Whilst looking for a summer holiday job she saw her present job advertised and applied for and got it. So it was by chance that she found this job which resolved her dilemma at the time, although in retrospect this was 'bad' luck as she feels trapped in this job.

An example of a fateful moment with ambiguous consequences:

- Jane Smith is one of the cases of examination failure at 16 throwing carefully made plans out of joint. As she returned to retake GCSEs she took a part-time job as a care assistant. The intention was to re-initiate her original plans after the retakes. However, by the time she had finished the retakes she had increased the hours to full-time and was really enjoying looking after mentally handicapped people. The fateful moment was to remain in work or go back to education. She chose the former, to spend a 'year out'. That was three years ago. So her self determination is interwoven with the unexpected opportunity to work full-time in a job she had seen as a stop gap but which offered her great satisfaction.

4. Conclusion

We have claimed that from school to the present the women in our interview group have displayed a serious commitment to work which we have called career orientation. We have further argued that this has been sustained by the women's own tenacity, initiative and planning, the support they have received from their families and by their experience of good fortune in the unexpected turnings of opportunities and constraints at fateful moments.

We conclude with some observations on the general significance of our results. As we explained earlier the interview group shared specific demographic and economic characteristics - they were young adult, single, childless women in full-time employment. The Sample of Anonymised Records from the 1991 Census (SARs)¹⁵ shows 61,025 women fell in our 18-24 year old age range of whom 20,795 met our criteria by being neither married nor cohabiting, being employed full-time or self-employed, and not living with a dependent child. That is, 34% of the female population met our criteria. As such we clearly cannot generalise to young women as a whole, to the two thirds who fell outside our criteria by being students, partners, mothers, part-time workers or some combination of these. However, within the characteristics we focus upon our small sample has a degree of representivity despite being constructed on a non-random basis. Figure 4 compares our sample and the SARs subset of 18-24 year old full-time employed, single and childless women in terms of Standard Occupational Major Groups and Registrar General's Social Classes.

**Figure 4: The research sample group compared to the 1991 Census in terms of
a) Major Occupational Groups and b) Social Classes.**

(Note: the Census figures here are taken from the SARs 2% sample of individuals. They include women between 18 and 24 who were employed full-time or self-employed, were not married or cohabiting and who were not living with a dependent child).

a) Major occupational groups	Research sample		1991 Census
	No	%	%
Managers and administrators	5	13	9
Professional	4	10	3
Associate professional and technical	3	8	9
Clerical and secretarial	11	28	42
Craft	0	0	5
Personal and protective service	8	20	14
Sales	7	18	10
Plant and machine operatives	0	0	5
Others	1	3	3
		100	100
	N = 39		20,795

b) Registrar General's Social Classes	Research sample		1991 Census
	No	%	%
I Professional	2	5	2
II Intermediate	10	26	20
III N Skilled non manual	17	44	52
III M Skilled manual	1	3	10
IV Partly skilled manual	9	23	15
V Unskilled manual	0	0	1
		100	100
	N = 39		20,795

In both comparisons the national figures are dominated by clerical and secretarial occupations / the skilled non manual class. This is our biggest group but we deliberately restricted it to cover a greater range. So we have rather higher proportions in professional, personal service and sales occupations and in the intermediate and partly skilled manual social classes. But nevertheless the basic 'shape' of the national picture is maintained in our small group.

Returning to the wider question of the significance of our sample for young women as a whole, there is a striking contrast between our findings and those reported by earlier research. Here it is the strength of the commitment to work and the distancing from future family which comes across rather than the centrality of sexual identity associated with future domestic role.

There are a number of possible reasons for this disparity but we will concentrate on just two. First, it could be that the world has changed and young women in general have become much more work oriented over the last decade or so. In this case our particular group might, because of their specific characteristics, represent an exaggerated picture, but what we have picked up is a changed empirical situation in a much broader sense. Second, the world has remained the same but we have picked out a particular group of people who have been neglected by previous research. To our knowledge there are no other studies which focus on the demographic and economic features we specified and used the kind of qualitative approach that we have used. So perhaps they were a 'hidden group'. This would be consistent with Hakim's (1991) recent claims about a minority of women whose work history is very similar to men's and who are set on a path of full-time, continuous employment by commitment to work in their teenage years.

To follow up whether our group is, to a degree, typical of other women of their age or stand out as very different we need to do two things. First, to compare our group with women of the same generation but with very different demographic and economic characteristics. The contrast will be widest with a group of young adult women who are partnered mothers and not in the labour market. Key issues will be their plans for work and family as they left school and their work and household histories since school. Were such women less committed to work on leaving school? If they were not were they less skilled in manoeuvring in the labour market, did they have very different relations with their families or did they get more unlucky breaks at fateful moments? Second, we need to examine how robust the work orientation of our interview group is as these women proceed through the life course and the labour market. Over the period since leaving school 10 have cohabited with men, seven have had abortions or miscarriages, 10 have had temporary work and six have been out of work. Their career orientations have come through these events but they are at an age when both work and personal relationships hold out many possibilities.

Ian Procter is Lecturer in Sociology at the University of Warwick. Author of *Service Sector Workers in a Manufacturing City* (Gower 1988). His recent work has been on work history especially the interconnection of women's work and family lives. Just commencing a project on *Young Adult Women: Work, Family and Future* funded by the Leverhulme Trust.

Maureen Padfield is Research Fellow in Sociology at the University of Warwick working on the Leverhulme Trust funded project on *Young Adult Women: Work, Family and Future*. She completed an ethnographic study of the Birmingham Jewellery Quarter including the place of women in a craft industry for her PhD.

Notes

- 1 Our collaboration as researchers includes a policy of joint authorship whereby both our names appear on our publications, the first named alternating between the two of us. The order of authors here does not indicate seniority of authorship.
- 2 Supported by the University of Warwick Research and Innovations Fund to whom we are grateful for enabling our research to get under way.
- 3 Interviews were conducted in the summer and autumn of 1992, 20 by Ian Procter, 19 by Maureen Padfield. Our paper 'Interviewer gender and the interview' discusses the impact of our own gender on the interviews (Padfield and Procter 1993).

- 4 Our interview group all agreed to further interviews in which we will investigate the impact of transitions in both their economic and demographic status.
- 5 To be clear, we did not recruit students, rather mature students acted as our gatekeepers to women with the characteristics we were seeking.
- 6 The women's names are pseudonyms, chosen by themselves. For discussion of this see our internal working paper (Procter and Padfield 1993).
- 7 Detailed discussion of methodological issues arising from work history interviewing can be found in Procter 1988 Chap 2.
- 8 These are not mutually exclusive and there is some overlap. In the following review the most important element of the future plan is counted.
- 9 In one case the woman's clear ambition from school was to become a wife and mother but in an occupation which would allow the return to part-time work when convenient to her. This is reminiscent of a pattern some have detected very strongly in Sweden (Ruggie 1988, Lewis and Astrom 1992)
- 10 In three cases this was not appropriate because of the absence of a 'father'. Here we have used mothers' occupation. In three cases insufficient detail was forthcoming with which to place the family in the class system.
- 11 We have not space here to elaborate these points but there are only a few instances of daughters compensating for low cash payments by their contribution to domestic work. Again, with some exceptions, neither financial contribution nor domestic work seemed to have been sources of tension between daughters and their parents.
- 12 Though in most cases the woman insisted she was there on merit. This was true but the opportunity to show that merit was greatly assisted by family ownership.
- 13 Sod's law states that if something can go wrong it will go wrong.
- 14 We should make clear that the conceptualisation and classification here is ours, not necessarily the interviewees. Becker (1994 : 185) has noted that in everyday explanations people frequently make use of chance and coincidence and some of our interviewees did this. We have, however, extended the concept to cover other cases.
- 15 We should thank the Census Microdata Unit for making available this wonderful resource. Particular thanks to our colleague Richard Lampard for helping us obtain SARs data.

References

- Anderson, Michael. (1985) 'The emergence of the modern life cycle in Britain', *Social History*, 10, 1, 69-87.
- Bakker, Isobella. (1988) 'Women's employment in comparative perspective' in J. Jenson, E. Hagen and C. Reddy (eds) *Feminization of the Labour Force: Paradoxes and Problems*, Cambridge: Polity, 17-44.
- Banks, Michael, Inge Bates, Glynis Breakwell, John Bynner, Nicholas Emler, Lynn Jamieson, and Kenneth Roberts. 1992. *Careers and Identities*, Milton Keynes: Open University Press.
- Bates, Inge. (1993). 'A job which is "right for me": social class, gender and individualization'. In *Youth and Inequality*, Edited by I. Bates and G. Riseborough. 14-31. Buckingham: Open University Press.
- Beck, Ulrich. (1992) *Risk Society: Towards a New Modernity*, London: Sage.
- Becker, Howard S. (1994). "'Foi por acaso": conceptualizing coincidence'. *Sociological Quarterly* 35 (2) : 183-94.
- Brannen, J., and P. Moss. (1991) *Managing Mothers: Dual Earner Households after Maternity Leave*, London: Unwin Hyman.
- Chisholm, Lynne, and Manuela Du Bois-Reymond (1993) 'Youth Transitions, Gender and Social Change', *Sociology*, 27, 2, 259-79.
- Clark, David (1991) *Marriage, Domestic Life and Social Change: Writings for Jacqueline Burgoyne (1944-88)*, London: Routledge.
- Dale, Angela, and Heather Joshi (1992) 'The economic and social status of women', *Deutsche Gesellschaft für Bevölkerungswissenschaft, Conference on 'Frauenerwerbstätigkeit - demographische, soziologische, ökonomische und familien-politische Aspekte'*, Berlin, February
- Dex, Shirley. (1991). *Life and Work History Analyses: Qualitative and Quantitative Developments*, London: Routledge.
- Giddens, Anthony (1991) *Modernity and Self-Identity*, Cambridge: Polity.

- Goldthorpe, John, David Lockwood, Frank Beckhofer, and Jennifer Platt (1968) *The Affluent Worker: Industrial Attitudes and Behaviour*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Griffin, Christine (1985) *Typical Girls? Young Women from School to the Labour Market*, London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Hakim, Catherine (1991) 'Grateful slaves and self-made women: fact and fantasy in women's work orientations', *European Sociological Review*, 7, 2, 101-21.
- Holland, Janet (1988) 'Girls and occupational choice: in search of meanings', in A. Pollard, J. Purvis and G. Walford (eds) *Education, Training and the New Vocationalism*, Milton Keynes: Open University Press, 129-47.
- Jones, Gill, and Claire Wallace (1992) *Youth, Family and Citizenship*, Buckingham: Open University Press.
- Lees, Sue. (1986) *Losing Out: Sexuality and Adolescent Girls*, London: Hutchinson.
- Lees, Sue. (1993). *Sugar and Spice - Sexuality and Adolescent Girls*, Harmondsworth: Penguin.
- Leonard, Diana (1980) *Sex and Generation: A Study of Courtship and Weddings*, London: Tavistock.
- Lewis, Jane (1992) *Women in Britain since 1945*, Oxford: Blackwell.
- Lewis, Jane, and Gertrude Anstrom (1992) 'Equality, difference and state welfare: labour market and family policies in Sweden' *Feminist Studies*, 18 (1)
- Mansfield, P., and J. Collard (1988) *The Beginning of the Rest of Your Life*, Basingstoke: MacMillan.
- McRae, Susan (1991) 'Occupational change over childbirth: evidence from a national survey', *Sociology*, 25, 4, 589-605.
- OPCS (1990) *Standard Occupational Classification*, London: H.M.S.O.
- Padfield, Maureen, and Ian Procter (1993) 'Interviewer's gender and the interview' *University of Warwick, Department of Sociology, Department Research Seminar March*.
- Procter, Ian, and Maureen Padfield (1992) 'Building the panel' *Unpublished working paper, Department of Sociology, University of Warwick*.
- Rees, Teresa (1992) *Women and the Labour Market*, London: Routledge.
- Roberts, K., Sally Dench, and Deborah Richardson (1986) *The Changing Structure of Youth Labour Markets*, London: Department of Employment, Research paper no. 59.
- Roberts, Ken. (1993). 'Career trajectories and the mirage of increased social mobility'. In *Youth and Inequality*, Edited by I. Bates and G. Riseborough. Buckingham: Open University Press. 229-45.
- Roberts, Ken, S.C. Clark, and Claire Wallace. (1994). 'Flexibility and individualisation: a comparison of transitions into employment in England and Germany'. *Sociology*, 28 (1) : 31-54.
- Ruggie, Mary (1988) 'Gender, work and social progress: some consequences of interest aggregation in Sweden', in J. Jenson, E. Hagen and C. Reddy (eds) *Feminization of the Labour Force: Paradoxes and Problems*, Cambridge: Polity.
- Smith, Mike. (1993). 'Changing sociological perspectives on chance'. *Sociology* 27 (3) : 513-31.
- Thompson, Paul. (1988). *The Voice of the Past*, Second ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Wallace, C. (1987) *For Richer, For Poorer: Growing Up In and Out of Work*, London: Tavistock.

TEENAGE PARENTHOOD & SOCIAL POLICY

PETER SELMAN & CAROLINE GLENDINNING

1 Introduction

Much media attention has focused recently on the growing number of one-parent families in Britain headed by never-married mothers. Special concern has been expressed over births outside marriage to younger mothers and the implications of these for the future well-being of the child and the cost of income support to the State. Government ministers have talked of a need to discourage such births by limiting access to welfare benefits and council housing. There has also been concern over a rising conception rate for women under the age of sixteen and the Government White Paper *Health of the Nation* set a target of halving this rate by the year 2000. In the last few months, a third issue has been raised by the publicity over sex-education for younger teenagers, leading to Ministers banning an HEA publication and calling for inquiries into teaching of sex-education in some schools.

In the first part of the paper, we look at the demography of teenage parenthood, outlining trends in births since 1951 and comparing recent trends with those in other developed countries. We shall also look at the impact of legal abortion and at regional variations in the incidence of teenage fertility in England.

In the second part we consider the possible relationship between teenage parenthood and social policy: both policies which may affect the level of teenage births directly e.g. through sex education, contraceptive provision or abortion legislation and indirectly e.g. by the 'perverse' incentives inherent in welfare provision or the structure of educational and employment opportunities available to young women.

1.1 Teenage or Adolescent Fertility

Teenage conceptions/births as defined in demography are those occurring to women under the age of twenty and rates are calculated as the number of conceptions/births per 1,000 women aged 15-19. Most births (60-70%) occur to women aged 18 or 19. However, many writers point to the difference between births to women aged 18 or 19 and those to women under 16.

A number of writers have identified particular problems for younger teenagers and Zabin & Hayward (1993) suggest the use of the term 'adolescent' pregnancy, defined as pregnancy occurring to those aged 17 years and younger. Studies of 'teenage' mothers have included all those under age 20 (Simms & Smith 1986), those aged 16-19 (Phoenix 1991), those aged 17 and under (Francome 1993) and only those under age 16 (Russell 1968). This means that care must be taken in comparing such studies, especially where they appear to offer different explanations of teenage pregnancy.

1.2 The 'Problem' of Teenage Pregnancy

Many writers have seen teenage pregnancy as a problem for the mothers, their children and society (Jones 1986; Zabin & Hayward 1993; Hudson and Ineichen 1991). But others have questioned this simplistic assumption (Phoenix 1991; Pearce 1993; MacIntyre & Cunningham-Burley 1993) or warned against exaggerating the implications of early motherhood (Furstenberg 1987; Geronimus 1987).

Current interest in Britain seems to focus on teenage births as a problem for society rather than for mother or child. The recent 'moral panic' (Lawson & Rhode 1993) is rooted in

concern over the implications of growing numbers of unmarried teenage mothers for public expenditure and on issues such as the link between absent fathers and crime. This can lead to a neglect of the need to offer support to the young mothers of today.

As Phoenix (1991 p.253) has argued:

Although teenage women who become mothers are often believed to constitute a social problem, it may be more accurate to view them as a group of mothers with problems - often not of their own making - who are struggling against the odds.

2 The Demography of Teenage Pregnancy

In this part of the paper, we look at recent statistics on teenage pregnancy in order to:

- distinguish the facts from the 'moral panic'.
- review changes over time in the outcome of teenage conceptions.
- examine how trends in Britain differ from those found in other countries.

We will look at teenage fertility in historical and comparative perspective, consider the role of legal abortion in limiting the number of teenage births and outline regional variations in teenage conceptions in England.

2.1 Teenage Births in England & Wales since the Second World War

Recent concern over teenage fertility lies in the growth in the number of teenage births occurring outside marriage. These have increased sharply since the late 1970s, rising from 19,800 in 1976 to a peak of 44,642 in 1988. Rates rose even more dramatically - from 11.7 in 1977 to 28.0 in 1991. The proportion of teenage births occurring outside marriage moved from 26% in 1971 to 47% in 1981 and 84% by 1992.

However, the total number of teenage births has fallen over the past 25 years and birth rates are well below their peak, although they have changed little in the past decade in contrast to the pattern in many other countries (see section 2.2).

Table 1 below shows trends in births and in births outside marriage since 1951.

Table 1: Live Births to Women under Age Twenty; 1951-1992

Year	Total Births	Rate ¹	Births outside marriage	Rate ²	Proportion ³ outside marriage
1951	29,111	21.3	4,812	3.7	165
1956	37,938	27.3	6,290	4.8	166
1961	59,786	37.3	11,896	8.0	199
1966	86,746	47.9	20,582	12.2	237
1971	82,641	50.6	21,555	14.6	261
1974	68,724	40.5	20,861	13.5	304
1977	54,500	29.8	20,100	11.7	368
1980	60,800	30.9	25,900	13.2	426
1983	54,059	26.9	30,423	19.7	648
1986	57,406	30.1	39,613	21.3	690
1988	58,741	32.4	44,642	25.3	760
1990	55,541	33.3	44,583	27.4	802
1991	52,396	33.1	43,448	28.0	829
1992	47,900	31.8	40,100		837

¹ per 1,000 women aged 15-19

² per 1,000 single, widowed or divorced women aged 15-19

³ per 1,000 live births

Source: OPCS Birth Statistics - Series FM1

The largest annual number of births in post-war years occurred in 1966 when the total was 86,746. The teenage birth rate peaked five years later in 1971 at 50.6. Both number and rate fell sharply during the 1970s and by 1977 there were only 54,500 births and the birth rate had fallen to 29.8. In the next 15 years numbers and rates fluctuate but remain well below the level of the early 1970s.

Between 1988 and 1992, the number of births fell from 58,741 to 47,900, the lowest annual figure since 1959 (46,637). One reason for this apparently dramatic decline is the falling number of teenagers - the teenage birth rate changed little during these years [32.4 in 1988; 33.3 in 1990; 31.8 in 1992].

There is, however, a further shift of importance - in the context of out of wedlock births. In 1975 approximately two-thirds of births outside marriage to women under the age of twenty were registered by the mother alone; by 1991 this had almost reversed with 65 per cent of births at this age jointly registered. A majority of the joint registrations gave the same address for both parents so that in 1991 38 per cent of all out of wedlock births were to couples living together.

Table 2 summarises this change over a period of twenty years

Table 2: Extra-marital teenage births - by registration

Year	Total Births	Registration		[[Joint Registration] Address -	
		Sole %	Joint %	Different %	Same %
1971	21,555	72	28		
1976	19,819	64	36		
1981	26,430	52	48		
1986	39,613	41	59	[26]	[33]
1991	43,448	35	65	[27]	[38]

Source: OPCS Birth Statistics - Series FM1

The number of births registered by the mother alone changed little over this period. The bulk of the increase in births outside marriage is accounted for by those which are jointly registered. The number of joint registrations rose from 6,124 in 1971 to 28,199 in 1991. During the same period, the number of pre-maritally conceived births within marriage fell from 34,598 to 3,662.

We need to know much more about such 'cohabitations' (Kiernan & Estaugh, 1993) and in particular about their stability, as the breakdown of these arrangements may be of significant importance in explaining the rise in the number of single parent families headed by never-married women (Haskey 1993). It has been estimated that as many as 50 per cent of teenage marriages end in divorce (Haskey 1983). It seems likely that teenage cohabitations will prove even less stable, although some will of course lead to marriage at a later stage and these marriages may prove less prone to breakdown than those entered into at younger ages. In the meantime it is dangerous to make too much of trends inside and outside marriage and in the following sections we have focused on teenage fertility and conceptions regardless of marital status.

2.2 Teenage Fertility in Comparative Perspective

Teenage fertility in England & Wales is now the highest in Western Europe. Birth rates in the early 1990s are higher than in 1977, in contrast to most other European countries which experienced significant declines in this period. Table 3 shows that England and Wales now occupy a position intermediary between the USA and most Western European countries, but trends over the period have been similar to the USA.

Table 3: Live Births to Teenagers

USA, England & Wales and Other European Countries						
<i>Selected Years: 1971-1988</i>						
	1971	1977	1980	1983	1988	1990
<i>Births per 1,000 woman aged 15-19</i>						
USA	66.1	52.8	53.3	51.7	54.8	59.4
England & Wales	50.8	29.8	30.9	26.9	32.4	33.3
Sweden	34.6	22.1	15.8	11.7	11.4	12.7
Denmark	29.3	22.1	16.8	10.6	9.5	9.8
France	27.7	22.1	17.8	13.9	9.5	9.1
Netherlands	22.2	10.1	9.2	7.7	5.6	6.4

Sources: UN Demographic Year Book; Council of Europe

All six countries experienced declines in teenage birth rates in the period 1971 to 1977 and the fall in England & Wales was the second greatest, so that by 1977 it had a level of teenage births approximately halfway between the USA and the Netherlands.

Over the next decade, the patterns change dramatically. In the United States and England & Wales rates rise in the late 1970s, fall slightly in the mid 1980s and then rise again, so that in both countries the teenage birth rate in 1988 is higher than a decade earlier. In the other four European countries, there is a very striking decline throughout this second period. The result is that by 1988 the American birth rate is five times that of the four countries of Mainland Europe and the British birthrate three times higher.

We shall return to these comparisons later in this paper, when we discuss the impact of different social policies on teenage birth and pregnancy rates. Before doing this, we shall look at the impact of legal abortion on birth rates and at measures of teenage pregnancy and 'conceptions'.

2.3 The Role of Abortion

Differences between countries in teenage birth rates may reflect differences in teenage pregnancy, but there are also variations in levels of abortion. For example, in Sweden and Denmark, a majority of teenage pregnancies end in a termination and this can be seen as an important factor in determining their low birth rates. However, the Netherlands and France also have low birth rates despite much lower abortion ratios.

Table 4 shows changes over time in birth, abortion and pregnancy rates in three of the countries discussed above.

Table 4: Abortions, Births & Pregnancies to Teenagers					
USA, England & Wales and Denmark					
Rates per 1,000 women aged 15-19: 1977-1988					
	1977	1980	1983	1985	1988
Abortion					
USA	37.5	42.9	43.5	43.8	
E&W	17.2	18.2	18.6	20.9	23.9
Denmark	25.5	22.7	17.6	16.3	
Births					
USA	52.8	53.3	51.7	51.3	54.8
E&W	29.8	30.9	26.9	29.5	32.4
Denmark	22.1	16.8	10.6	9.1	9.5
Pregnancy					
USA	90.3	96.2	95.2	95.1	
E&W	47.0	49.1	45.5	50.4	56.3
Denmark	47.6	38.9	28.2	25.4	

Sources: David (1990); OPCS Birth Statistics and Abortion Statistics

Table 5 shows changes in the ratio of abortions to live births.

Table 5: Teenage Abortions					
Abortions per 1,000 Births [per 1,000 women aged 15-19]					
	1973	1980		1985	
USA	385	804	[42.9]	853	[43.8]
E&W	352	691	[18.2]	708	[20.9]
Denmark	265	1,351	[22.7]	1,791	[16.3]
France				575	
Netherlands		473			
Sweden				1,358	

In Table 4 pregnancy rates were calculated by adding live births and abortions in the same calendar year. In England & Wales OPCS now publishes tables of conceptions, where births and abortions are allocated to a year by the date when the pregnancy is assumed to have started. This has been possible since 1968 following the implementation of the 1967 Abortion Act. It has made possible a more precise monitoring of changes in the outcome of teenage pregnancy.

During the 1970s growing numbers of abortions to teenagers seemed to have halted the growth in teenage births outside marriage of the 1960s (Table 1) but since 1977 abortions have increased alongside out-of-wedlock births. This changing pattern of outcome can be seen from OPCS figures on teenage conceptions.

Table 6: Outcome of Teenage Conceptions, England and Wales 1969-1991

Year	Conceptions (1,000s)					Rate
	Inside marriage Maternity	Outside marriage Maternity	inside outside marriage	Legal abortion	Total	
1969	43.4	43.5	25.3	11.3	123.4	75.0
1970	46.5	43.9	26.1	17.9	134.3	82.4
1974	36.9	27.5	24.1	29.6	118.1	69.6
1977	30.7	21.0	25.2	30.4	107.3	57.9
1980	28.5	20.1	32.2	36.4	117.1	58.7
1983	20.6	14.6	39.8	37.3	112.4	56.0
1986	15.6	11.3	52.3	39.6	118.8	62.3
1989	11.8	7.5	56.4	41.8	117.1	67.6
1990	10.7	5.9	57.5	41.0	115.1	69.0
1991	9.4	5.0	53.4	35.5	103.3	65.3

Table 7: Percentage distribution of teenage conceptions by outcome:

1969-1991 Outcomes	1969 %	1977 %	1983 %	1989 %	1991 %
Abortion	9	30	33	36	34
Marital Births conceived					
• inside marriage	35	28	18	10	9
• outside marriage	35	19	13	6	5
Non-marital births					
• jointly registered	6	9	20	31	34
• sole registration	15	14	16	17	18
Total (1,000s)	123.4	107.3	112.4	117.1	103.3

Source: OPCS Conception Monitors; Birth Statistics

In 1969 70 per cent of conceptions ended in a maternity within marriage; by 1991 over half led to a non-marital birth (two thirds of which were jointly registered) and more than a third ended in abortion.

Finally, it is important to look at what has been happening to conceptions to very young teenagers. Table 8 shows the trends in the number and rate (per 1,000

women aged 13-15) of conceptions to women under the age of 16. Total numbers have been falling since the mid 1980s but this has been the result of a fall in the number of girls aged 13-15, so that the rate rose throughout the 1980s and has only begun to reverse in the last few years.

Table 8: Conceptions to women under age 16

	Total (1,000s)	maternities (1,000s)	abortions (1,000s)	Rate per (1,000)
1969	6.5	4.8	1.7	6.8
1971	8.8	5.5	3.3	8.8
1976	9.1	4.3	4.9	7.9
1980	8.6	3.9	4.6	7.2
1983	9.4	4.0	5.3	8.3
1986	9.2	4.2	5.0	8.6
1989	8.4	4.0	4.4	8.7
1990	8.6	4.3	4.4	10.1
1991	7.8	3.8	4.0	9.3

2.4 Regional Variations in Teenage Conception Rates in England

There are significant differences in teenage conception rates in England & Wales and also in the outcomes of these conceptions. Table 9 below summarises some of these differences for standard regions, listed in order of rates of maternity, for 1990, the year in which the teenage conception rates peaked at 69.0 [10.1 for under 16s].

Table 9: Regional Variations in Conception Rates in England

Region	Conception Rates per 1,000 women aged 15-19: 1990			
	Total	Maternity	Abortion%	leading to maternity%
Northern	78.8	57.2	21.7	72.6
North West	81.2	56.1	25.2	69.1
Yorks & Humber	78.8	55.0	23.8	69.8
West Midlands	82.4	53.8	28.6	65.3
East Midlands	69.3	46.8	22.5	67.5
England & Wales	68.8	43.9	22.5	63.8
East Anglia	58.7	37.3	21.4	63.5
South East	60.2	33.8	26.4	56.1
South West	54.8	33.7	21.1	61.5

Source: OPCS Birth Statistics: Conception Series FM1 no.20

The highest maternity rates are found in the Northern region, where nearly three quarters of the conceptions ended in a maternity. The lowest rates are in the South East and South West. Even higher rates are found in smaller urban areas e.g. in the Metropolitan counties of West Midlands, Tyne & Wear and Greater Manchester maternity rates were respectively 62.9; 61.8; and 61.0.

In an analysis of 1991 conceptions, when the conception rate in England & Wales had fallen to 65.3, Babb (1994) found the highest levels of teenage conceptions in Inner London (90.4) and the principal cities of the Metropolitan Districts (83.2); the lowest levels in mixed urban/rural areas (43.7).

In 1991 teenage birth rates in the northern regions were 30 per cent higher than for England as a whole and the proportion of these occurring outside marriage was also higher (88% in the North and North West, compared to 83% in England & Wales).

There are even wider regional variations in conception rates to under 16s - see Table 10.

Table 10: Regional Variations in Conception Rates in England

Region	Conception Rates per 1,000 women aged 13-15: 1990			
	Total	Maternity	Abortion%	leading to maternity%
Northern	13.1	7.3	5.7	55.7
North West	11.8	6.7	5.2	56.7
Yorks & Humber	12.3	6.5	5.8	52.8
West Midlands	11.6	5.8	5.8	50.0
East Midlands	10.8	5.5	5.4	50.9
England & Wales	10.1	4.9	5.2	48.5
East Anglia	8.9	3.5	5.3	39.3
South East	8.1	3.5	4.6	43.2
South West	8.4	3.2	5.2	38.1

Source: OPCS Birth Statistics 1991: Conception Series FM1 no.20

In two of the Metropolitan Counties maternity rates are higher - 8.4 in Tyne & Wear and 7.8 in Greater Manchester.

It is interesting to note that in both age groups, regions with above average conception rates have lower abortion rates, so that the most striking differences lie in the conceptions leading to maternities, especially in the under 16s where the maternity rate in the Northern Region is more than twice that found in East Anglia, the South East and the South West.

These systematic differences between regions suggest that early motherhood is related to structural differences, but there is a need for much more work on local variations before any clear conclusions can be drawn from such differences.

3 Social Policy and Teenage Parenthood

Plotnick (1993) has argued that 'services and incentives provided by social policies significantly affect teenage pregnancy and child-bearing outcomes.' In this section of the paper, we will look at the relationship between social policies and teenage parenthood in Britain. First we will discuss the impact of specific measures designed to influence teenage birth rates, such as sex-education, the provision of contraceptive advice and access to legal abortion. We will then consider the possi-

ble influence of wider social policy measures in the area of social security, housing and employment policy. In doing so, we will address some of the questions raised in the review of data above; why are teenage conception and birth rates higher in England & Wales than any other Western European country?; why did birth rates in England & Wales (and the United States) rise during the 1980s when in other countries they have fallen to levels well below those recorded in 1977?; can the answers to such questions also throw light on the regional variations within Britain?

3.1 Preventing Teenage Pregnancy

We start by looking at factors which influence the level of teenage fertility:

- 1) the level of sexual activity
- 2) the use of contraception
- 3) the resort to abortion

3.1.1 Level of Sexual Activity

Comparative data on teenage sexual activity is hard to find. Most commentators, however, have concluded that there is no hard evidence of lower levels of sexual activity in teenagers in Scandinavia compared to the USA or Britain (David 1990; Gress-Wright 1993; Jones 1986). Indeed Jones concluded that teenagers were more sexually active in Sweden. Hoem (1987) has shown that 94 per cent of Swedish women born in the late 1950s had intercourse before the age of 20 and that over half had entered a cohabiting union (only 4 per cent of which were marriages) in their teens. The limited evidence available for Britain suggests a steady move to earlier commencement of intercourse. Ford (1991) estimates that in the late 1980s 41 per cent of young women had experienced intercourse by the age of 16, a figure slightly lower than that reported for Danish teenagers in 1984-5 (Wielandt and Boldsen 1989).

Although there is little indication that the persistence of higher rates of teenage births in Britain and the USA is due to a higher level of sexual activity, there has been strong pressure in both countries for policies to actively discourage early sexual intercourse. Joffe (1993) quotes a leading New Right spokeswoman in the USA:

They [liberals] begin with the premise that teenagers should not have babies. We begin with the premise that single teenagers should not have sex.

This belief has led to major clashes over the content of sex education and the availability of contraceptive provision for younger teenagers, which we discuss in the next two sections.

3.1.2 Use of Contraception

Most studies of teenage mothers in Britain indicate that a majority of their pregnancies were unplanned (Simms & Smith 1986; Ineichen 1986; Francome 1993) and that in most cases they resulted from non-use of contraception on the occasion when conception occurred. The lower level of teenage conceptions in Scandinavia and the Netherlands is generally attributed to more effective use of contraception (David 1990; Gress-Wright 1993, Belleman, 1994), with a majority of teenagers using contraception at first intercourse.

This has led to arguments that the most effective policy intervention is to increase knowledge of contraception through improved sex-education and use through more

accessible birth control provision including services specifically targeted at the younger unmarried teenager. This has been the policy of Denmark, Sweden and the Netherlands over the past twenty years and has met with little opposition, while in Britain and the United States there has been continuous debate about the content of sex education and the rights of teenagers to confidential advice on contraception.

a) sex-education

Reid (1982) and Allen (1985) have pointed to the limitations of sex-education in British schools in the 1980s, with fears that explicit teaching would lead to 'experimentation'. That we are still far from resolving the issue in Britain can be seen from recent Press reports of divisions within the Cabinet between Virginia Bottomley, Secretary of State for Health, and Peter Lilley, Secretary of State for Social Security, over the place of contraceptive advice in sex education. Meanwhile, recent amendments to the 1993 *Education Act* have resulted in teaching on AIDs and HIV being specifically excluded from the National Curriculum and parents being allowed to withdraw their children from sex education.

Further examples of ministerial concern came at the end of 1993 John Patten, Minister for Education, called for more stress on morals and less on mechanisms in sex education and in March 1994 ordered an official inquiry into reports that a school nurse had discussed oral sex with a group of 10 and 11-year olds. Soon after this, Health Minister, Brian Mawhinney banned publication of the H.E.A. publication *Your Pocket Guide to Sex*, which was aimed at the 16-25 age group.

Yet a study by Francome (1993) found that a majority of younger teenagers felt that they had received little or no information about contraception from school and a recent study from Exeter University (Balding 1994) shows that most teenagers still learn about sex mainly from their peers.

Similar conflicts are described in the USA (Fine 1988; Zabin & Hayward 1993): these seem to reflect a concern with teenage sexuality rather than teenage parenthood.

In contrast, *Swedish* sex education has been widely noted for its openness. Sex instruction in Swedish schools became mandatory in 1956 and for older students at secondary school includes information about contraception and visits to local family planning clinics (Boethius, 1984; Hoem 1989; Swedish Institute 1990). In *Denmark* sex education was made a compulsory primary school subject throughout the country in 1970 and a year later attempts by a Danish couple to have their daughter excused from such classes were rejected (David 1990). The use of visits to family planning clinics as a supplement to sex education has been associated with declining numbers of abortions (David 1990; Segest 1991). In the *Netherlands* sex education is a compulsory part of the school curriculum. It starts at primary school and at later stages involves teaching about contraception. There is stress on the need to enable teenagers to talk openly about sex. (Belleman 1993).

All three countries see their explicit sex education as central to the success in reducing levels of teenage pregnancy during the past twenty years. Certainly their experience over the last twenty years gives no support to the view that explicit sex-education, which includes practical guidance on the use of contraception and advice on where to get supplies, increases the incidence of teenage pregnancy by encouraging sexual 'experimentation'. The recent review of the impact of sex-

education on young people's sexual behaviour by Grunseit and Kippax (1994) comes to a similar conclusion. Reports from the three countries (David 1990; Swedish Institute 1990; Segest 1991; Belleman 1993) also indicate a much higher level of knowledge and more effective use of contraception by sexually active teenagers than in Britain and America (Francome 1993; Gress-Wright 1993)

b) access to contraceptive services

The NHS (Reorganisation) Act of 1973 brought family planning clinic services in England & Wales within the NHS, absorbing more than 1,000 clinics previously run by the Family Planning Association. Since 1975 GPs have also been fully involved in providing contraceptive advice following agreement on item-of-service payments for female contraception. They are now the most important source of contraceptive advice, seeing more than twice the number of women who attend specialist clinics. However, there have been difficulties over the provision of contraceptive services to younger teenagers.

In 1980 the DHSS issued guidelines allowing doctors in exceptional circumstances to provide advice on contraception to girls under the age of 16 without parental consent. These were challenged by Mrs. Victoria Gillick, who eventually won her case in the Court of Appeal in December 1994. The DHSS suspended its guidance but appealed to the House of Lords which in October 1985 overruled the Court of Appeal decision. The Department's guidelines were promptly reinstated, but the episode had created much uncertainty for all concerned.

A recent survey of family doctors for the TV programme *World in Action* found that one third still believe that they cannot give advice to under-age teenagers. The study of pregnant teenagers accompanying the same programme (Francome, 1993) found that 42 per cent of those who had not been to a GP or clinic thought it illegal to ask for contraception and that a similar proportion thought that their parents would be told. This raises questions about the suitability of GPs as a source of contraceptive advice for young girls and concern over the closure of community family planning clinics (Selman & Calder, 1994).

However, the latest DH statistics on the use of family planning clinic services [Summary Information from form KT131; 1992-3] show a further decline in the number of women attending family planning clinics in England & Wales, but an increase in those aged under 20 [see Table 11]:

Table 11 Family Planning Clinics; female attenders by age 1982 to 1993

Year	Numbers (1,000s) and rates (per 100 resident population)					
	All ages		Under 16		16-19	
1982	1,441	[14.6]	16	[4.2]	233	[15.2]
1985	1,480	[14.3]	12	[3.3]	223	[15.1]
1987-88	1,352	[12.7]	15	[4.4]	209	[13.7]
1990-91	1,092	[10.2]	18	[6.7]	157	[12.0]
1992-93	1,075	[10.0]	27	[10.3]	159	[13.7]

Source: KT31; 1992/93

The fall in the rate of attendance for under 16s between 1982 and 1985 is likely to reflect the uncertainties arising from the Gillick case, but the recent rise suggests that there is now a much greater readiness to approach clinics and that this may be a sign of the impact of recent Government initiatives. However, many sexually active teenagers are *not* in contact with contraceptive services and many of those who do make contact have been sexually active and possibly at risk for some time. A recent survey by Exeter University found widespread ignorance amongst younger teenagers about what services were available locally and where they could get condoms free of charge (Balding, 1994). In an earlier study, Hill (1988) found that those who were seen at clinics came on average 11 months after the commencement of sexual activity.

The *Health of the Nation* target has led to many local experiments - e.g the Streetwise project in Newcastle upon Tyne, which offers a non-clinic based contraceptive service for young people. Another development which may be of importance is the growing use of 'post-coital' or emergency contraception. DH figures show that this was prescribed on about 70,000 occasions in 1992/3 and that about half of these involved teenagers, including about 6,000 under the age of 16. This latter figure is close to the number of under 16 conceptions recorded in 1991.

In contrast, there seems to be little opposition to the policy of making contraception easily available to unmarried teenagers in Denmark and Sweden. In Denmark contraceptive advice is freely available from GPs and family planning clinics. Condoms are on sale in supermarkets and offered free to adolescents in many municipalities (Segest, 1991). A telephone 'sex-line' for young people was introduced in 1992. In Sweden, doctors are specifically forbidden to inform parents about adolescents' requests for contraception. Concern over rising teenage abortion rates in the late 1960s has led to new projects offering subsidised contraception to young people (Persson 1994). In the Netherlands 'medical' methods of contraception have been available free of charge since 1972 (Doppenberg 1994). Family planning clinics are less extensive than in England & Wales but are more targeted at young people (Plotnick 1993) and doctors are required to keep visits confidential if a teenager requests this. In recent years teenagers have been encouraged to use both pill and condom to protect against AIDS as well as pregnancy, a practice sometimes termed 'double dutch'.

Brindis (1993) has argued that contraceptive provision for young people in the USA probably worsened in the late 1980s, as programme funding was reduced and the lack of consensus on contraceptive services for the young became more evident. There has been much opposition in America to school-based clinics as encouraging young people to be sexually active (Pearce, 1993), although Fine (1988) has shown that there is substantial evidence that such clinics can reduce pregnancy rates. There have also been attacks on *Planned Parenthood*, the main family planning organisation, as 'anti-life and anti-family' and anti-abortion activity has become virtually inseparable from opposition to birth control and sex education, with attacks mounted on Title X of the 1970 Public Health Act, which provided for free and confidential contraceptive services for young teenagers (Joffe 1993).

3.1.3 *The Resort to Abortion*

Pregnant teenagers are much more likely to have an abortion in Sweden and Denmark than in England & Wales, where two thirds of teenage pregnancies end

in a live birth (see Tables 4-6). In England, the proportion of teenagers proceeding to a live birth is larger in poorer regions and is associated with higher overall levels of conceptions (tables 9 and 10) In the Northern and North West region, a clear majority of under 16s choose to continue with their pregnancy. Such differences in the proportion of out-of-wedlock conceptions ending in abortion raise questions about the ease of access to abortion between and within countries.

In *England & Wales*, the 1967 Abortion Act does not permit abortion on demand. Most abortions are carried out on the grounds of risk to the mental or physical health of the woman. The most striking regional variations in abortion are in the percentage funded by the NHS for resident women. In 1992 this ranged from 45 per cent in the North Western RHA to 85 per cent in the Northern RHA, two regions where levels of teenage parenthood are above average. There would seem, therefore, to be no simple relationship between access to NHS abortion and levels of teenage parenthood, but more detailed analysis is clearly needed.

Easy access to abortion has been a crucial factor in the very low rates of teenage births in Sweden and Denmark, where more than 60 per cent of teenage pregnancies are aborted. In *Sweden*, women have had a particularly clear right to abortion 'on demand' in the early weeks of pregnancy since 1975 and Swedish health services have translated that 'right' into a reality for most women. Likewise in *Denmark* free of cost abortion has been available on demand in the first twelve weeks of pregnancy since 1973 (David, 1990; 1992).

Similar 'rights' are granted in the USA on the basis of the 1973 Supreme Court judgement in *Roe v Wade* but the use of public funds has been severely restricted since the Hyde amendment of 1976, so that for most teenagers abortion is far from being available on demand. Plotnick (1993) reports higher rates of abortion in states with less restrictive policies on public funding. However, recent Supreme Court judgements have given states further powers to restrict access to abortion.

The explanation of the higher ratio of abortions to live births in Sweden and Denmark seems to lie partly in easier access to abortion, but also to reflect more British women either choosing to go on to a birth outside marriage or feeling sufficiently ambivalent as to not wish to undergo abortion.

3.1.4 Conclusion

Our review above suggests that a number of factors help to explain the lower levels of teenage births in the Scandinavian countries: a practical programme of universal sex-education; easy access to confidential advice on contraception; the availability of abortion for those who have an unplanned pregnancy. The absence of these in many parts of the United States has contributed to the higher teenage pregnancy rates there.

In Britain, the provision of free contraceptive advice and supplies under the NHS in Britain since 1973 has created a sound structure for delivering services to teenagers, but success in reducing the incidence of unwanted teenage pregnancy in the 1970s was halted by the uncertainties over advice to those under 16 during the Gillick case and later by cuts in community family planning services. More recently there have been promising initiatives in services to young people, but these now seem threatened by the current furore over explicit sex education and the threat of further cuts in clinic services.

In the final part of the paper we turn to look at arguments that part of the explanation for the higher rates in Britain and America lies rather in the nature of their welfare provision and at the counter arguments that it is the absence of educational and job opportunities which encourages early motherhood, whether planned or not.

3.2 The Social Context of Teenage Pregnancy

Brindis (1993) argues that adolescent pregnancy may have as much to do with such factors as dropping out of school, isolation, poverty, unemployment, lower self-esteem and lack of hope for the future as it has to do with adolescent sexuality. There is also a widely held view that it is influenced by welfare policies which give benefits to unmarried mothers (Murray 1990; Gress-Wright 1993). In this final section, we shall explore the evidence for such beliefs with special reference to the situation in Britain during the past decade.

3.2.1 Welfare incentives and teenage childbearing

There is a widespread belief in the United States that public assistance in the form of AFDC (Aid for Dependent Children) has offered financial incentives for poor women (including the very young) to bear children outside marriage.

Similar claims have been made recently in the UK in respect of local authority housing and the introduction of one parent benefit and the lone parent premium in income support. Writing in the *Sunday Times* (11.9.93), Charles Murray argued

Turn back the clock, restoring the benefit system for single mothers that Britain had in the mid-1960s, and there is every reason to think that you will turn back the proportion of babies born to single women to the 1960s as well.

Murray (1990:30) argues that changes in benefit rates have 'lifted a large proportion of low income women above the threshold where having and keeping a baby became economically feasible', in comparison with 30 or 40 years ago. David Green (1991:23) also asserts that additional benefits for lone parents provide official encouragement for lone parenthood. What evidence is there to support these arguments?

3.2.2 The evidence on welfare 'incentives' in Britain

It is certainly the case that a number of social security payments in the UK are 'targeted' at lone parents - that is, they are available to families which are headed by a lone parent, but not to other categories of welfare claimants. However it is far from self-evident that either access to these benefits or their levels, once they are received, constitutes an 'incentive' either to conceive and bear children outside a stable heterosexual partnership or to bring about the ending of such a partnership. It is worth noting that all these benefits are available equally to lone mothers and to lone fathers.

First, a small addition to child benefit was introduced in 1975 (Millar 1994: 68), in acknowledgement of the extra costs experienced by lone parent families. However this 'one-parent benefit' has always remained at a very low level; currently (1994/5) it is just £6.15 a week, compared to the universal Child Benefit of £10.20 for the first child and £8.25 for subsequent children, and £15.65 (more than two

and a half times the amount) which is allowed under Income Support - the main UK social assistance scheme - for a child under age 11. Moreover one-parent benefit is taken fully into account in assessing lone parents' entitlement to Income Support. This means that it is of no actual advantage at all to those who are supposed to be encouraged by it to become lone mothers - those who are wholly dependent on means-tested assistance payments.

Secondly, within Income Support an additional payment (or 'premium') of £5.10 a week (1994/5) is available to lone-parent families. Again, however, comparison of this premium with premiums for other groups of claimants is instructive. For example, a disabled adult claimant is entitled to an additional 'premium' of £18.45 a week on top of her/his other Income Support allowances. If levels of benefit reflect political and popular notions of more or less 'deserving' claimants, then it is clear from current benefit levels that lone parents are already treated considerably less favourably than other groups of assistance claimants.

Third, the Income Support scheme contains considerable disincentives, especially for younger lone parents. Lone Parents aged 16-17 are entitled to lower personal rates of Income Support than lone parents aged 18 and over - £36.15 a week compared with £47.50 a week for older lone parents (plus allowances for children). A lone parent under 18 who is still living in the parental home receives even less - just £27.50 a week. Lone parents under the age of 16 have *no entitlement at all* to claim any means-tested assistance benefits for themselves or their children. It is assumed that they will be entirely dependent financially on their own parents who, if they themselves are assistance recipients, will be able to claim appropriate age-related allowances for the young mother and her child.

Fourthly lone mothers have been as adversely affected by wider changes in the social assistance scheme in the UK as have other groups of claimants. In 1988 the old Supplementary Benefit scheme was replaced by Income Support; changes were also made at the same time to a number of other means-tested benefits. According to the Government's own estimates of the likely 'gainers' and 'losers', 54 per cent of lone parent families were to be better off by 50p or more a week from these changes and 33 per cent would be worse off by the same amount. Widely accepted independent estimates, based on the cumulative effects of all the changes which took place in the run up to and during 1988, put the proportion of lone parents who stood to be worse off financially at 74 per cent, with only 25 per cent likely to gain (BRU 1988: 4). Qualitative research carried out after the 1988 changes (Craig and Glendinning 1990) confirmed that lone mothers were as likely as couples with children to have experienced changes in their benefit entitlements which, taken together, left them considerably worse off.

Finally, it is worth noting that lone parent families have always occupied an anomalous and uneasy position within the British social security scheme. Apart from widows (who were 'protected' by their former husband's insurance contributions), there was no provision for lone parents in Beveridge's insurance-based scheme which was introduced immediately after World War II. Moreover, policies for lone parents have always displayed an ambivalence about whether, as the sole adult within the family, they should be treated primarily as 'breadwinners' or primarily as 'mothers' (Millar 1987; 1994). Failure to resolve this dilemma has led to consid-

erably greater risks of poverty for lone parent families (and especially for the children in them) than potential advantages.

The overall picture, therefore, seems to offer little evidence that the availability of social security benefits has advantaged younger single mothers over and above their childfree counterparts, so that such changes are hardly likely to have acted as incentives to out of wedlock births.

3.2.3 Housing policy and teenage pregnancy

In Britain concern has been expressed about teenagers becoming pregnant in order to obtain local authority housing. Speaking at the Conservative Party Conference in October 1993, Housing Minister, Sir George Young asked

How do we explain to the young couple... who want to wait for a home before starting a family... that they cannot be rehoused ahead of an unmarried teenager expecting her first, probably unplanned, child?

Such concerns have led to proposals to amend the Housing (Homeless Persons) Act of 1977 to remove priority for young mothers.

Coleman (1993) has suggested that the rationing and allocation system for local authority housing may be one reason for the 'relatively high level of non-marital births and teenage childbearing in Britain'. Yet there seems to be little evidence that young women seek motherhood in order to obtain such housing. Phoenix (1991) found no-one in her sample who had had a baby in order to obtain council housing. Similarly, Clark (1989) reports that the young unmarried mothers she interviewed were astonished to be asked whether they became pregnant in order to obtain council housing.

Current research at Newcastle University on housing for young single mothers shows that young mothers have very little knowledge of LA housing policies until they seek advice and that in most cases concerns about housing arise only some months after the birth of their child - e.g. when tensions build up within their own parents' home. On a related ESRC funded study, single mothers under the age of 18 accounted for less than one per cent of housing allocations in Cardiff in 1993.

3.2.4 Welfare incentives in other countries

In the United States, the belief that welfare payments are a key factor in maintaining high levels of teenage births outside marriage has been challenged by those who note that the value of welfare benefits has declined during the period of increase in births outside marriage and that studies of the relationship between benefit levels and births outside marriage show almost no correlation (Kammerman 1988). Nevertheless, the belief has led to a number of proposals - and some legislation - to build disincentives into welfare policy, so that teenagers become more aware of the costs of premature childbearing. Pearce (1993) cites three areas in which welfare policy has been changed to the disadvantage of young mothers. First, since 1984, under age mothers living with their parents are assessed for AFDC on the basis of household resources. A second change came with the *Family Support Act 1988*, which allows states to require minor parents to live with their parent(s) in order to receive AFDC. A third change requires teen mothers to return to school full time. Despite these changes, teenage birth rates in the United States have continued to rise.

Support for young single mothers in countries with lower levels of teenage parenthood is not less generous (Kamerman 1988), but seems to be less reliant on means-tested benefits and to be marked by higher benefits for *all* families (France) or by encouragement for all young mothers to enter and remain in the workforce (Sweden). This latter theme will be considered in the next section of the paper.

The view that welfare benefits encourage teenage parenthood has been challenged in a recent article by Andrew Blaikie (1994) who writes:

Why should young women wish to get pregnant in order to be so impoverished as to need welfare? Either they don't mean to get up the junction, they get left in the lurch by absconding Lotharios or they do it fatalistically because there is little else left in their poor lot that seems worthwhile.

In the final section of this paper, we turn to look at this 'nothing to lose' hypothesis (Plotnick 1993).

3.2.5 Educational and Job Opportunities

The proportion of pregnant teenagers who proceed to motherhood is significantly higher in Britain and America than in Sweden and Denmark. This may reflect a perceived lack of alternatives in education and employment (Furstenberg, 1987; Gress-Wright, 1993).

Zabin and Hayward (1993) suggest that in the United States few teenage births are planned or wanted and that women who proceed to motherhood are those who see few benefits in their futures so that 'an unintended birth carries few costs'. Plotnick (1993) concludes from his research in the United States that improvements in educational and earnings opportunities '...contribute indirectly towards reducing levels of teenage pregnancy and childbearing.... because better economic prospects lead teenagers to believe that they have something to lose by becoming parents, thus motivating them to defer childbearing'.

In Britain, the highest levels of teenage births occur to the most socio-economically disadvantaged (Babb 1994) and in the poorer urban areas (see section 2.4). Young mothers have been found to be less likely to have stayed on at school (Simms & Smith, 1986). Phoenix (1991) reports that 'the scarcity of adequately paid permanent jobs was ... the context in which young women in this study decided that early motherhood would not be damaging to their lives.'

In contrast in Sweden 'the strong emphasis on school and work means that childbearing is delayed ... until an average age of twenty-six' (Gress-Wright 1993), i.e. the low levels of teenage births are just part of a general postponement of childbearing in a country where overall levels of fertility are now much higher than in Britain. There is a conscious attempt to develop policies which facilitate women's entry into the labour market and their continued attachment to it at a minimal cost to childbearing and childrearing (Hoem & Hoem 1987). Eighty-five per cent of lone mothers with dependent children are in the work-force (Kamerman 1988) and a majority of these work full time.

Hantrais (1994) cites Britain as an example of 'neutral or negative family policy', offering little help to women wishing to combine full time employment and childrearing and contrasts this with the position in France.

The positive nature of Swedish family policy, with its emphasis on the support of women as both workers and mothers, may be much more significant in their lower rates of teenage fertility than welfare incentives to early motherhood in Britain which we questioned in the previous section. To adopt such an approach in Britain would require substantial improvements to child-care facilities for working mothers, but also the development of work and educational opportunities which would make for a more meaningful experience for teenagers.

Conclusion

Teenage birth rates in England & Wales have changed little over the past fifteen years, during which period rates have fallen substantially in most other European countries. We have argued that the lower teenage birth rates in Denmark and Sweden are in part a consequence of their more effective programmes of sex education and in particular the linking of sex-education to knowledge of family planning provision. In Britain, the current target in *Health of the Nation* is to halve the under-16 conception rate by the end of the century, but this goal is now threatened by cuts in family planning services and ambivalence about sex education in schools.

The other main emphasis in recent Government statements in relation to young mothers has been to assert the need to remove welfare incentives to single parenthood. We have argued that the existing structure of welfare and housing policy does not appear to advantage young single mothers and that there is no evidence that it encourages pregnancy in this age group. Any reduction in provision for this group will put both mothers and children at risk without being likely to influence reproductive behaviour. Only an improvement in educational and job opportunities can increase motivation to avoid unplanned births.

If the strategies developed as a result of *Health of the Nation* and the NHS Management Executive's *Guidelines for Reviewing Family Planning Services* give way to a backlash against explicit sex education and an attempt to control teenage pregnancy by making it harder for young mothers to get benefits and housing, it seems likely that the recent declines in teenage births may reverse and certain that a heavy price will be paid by young mothers and their children.

References

- Alcock K. (1992) 'Teenage pregnancy and sex education' *British Journal of Family Planning* 18 pp 88-92.
- Allen I. (1981) *Family Planning, Sterilisation and Abortion Services*, London: Policy Studies Institute.
- Allen I. (1985) *Education in Sex and Personal Relationships* London: Policy Studies Institute.
- Allen I. (1991) *Family Planning and Pregnancy Counselling Projects for Young People*, London: Policy Studies Institute.
- Babb P. (1994) 'Teenage conceptions and fertility in England & Wales, 1971-1991' *Population Trends* 74 pp 12-17.
- Balding J. (1994) *Young People in 1993* Exeter University.
- Baldwin S. & Falkingham J. (1994) *Social Security and Social Change* London: Harvester Wheatsheaf
- Belleman S. (1994) 'Let's talk about sex' *The Guardian* 19.11.93
- Benefits Research Unit (1988) *Bulletin of the Social Fund Project* Issue no. 1, Nottingham: BRU
- Blaikie A. (1994) *Illegitimacy, Sex and Society* Oxford: OUP
- Blaikie A. (1994) 'Family Fall-out' *Times Higher Education* Supplement 4.3.94
- Boethius G. (1984) *Swedish Sex Education and Its Results*, Stockholm: Swedish Institute.

- Brindis C. (1993) 'Antecedents and consequences: the need for diverse strategies in adolescent pregnancy prevention.' in Lawson A. & Rhode D. *The Politics of Pregnancy: Adolescent Sexuality and Public Policy* New Haven: Yale University Press. 257-283
- Burghes L. (1994) *Lone Parenthood and Family Disruption*, London: Family Policy Studies Centre.
- Bury J. (1984) *Teenage Pregnancy in Britain* London: Birth Control Trust.
- Clark E. (1989) *Young Single Mothers Today: A Qualitative Study of Housing and Support Needs* London: National Council for One Parent Families.
- Coleman D. (1993) 'Britain in Europe: international and regional comparisons of fertility levels and trends' in Ní Bhrolchain M. *New Perspectives on Fertility in Britain*, London: HMSO.
- Craig G. & Glendinning C. (1990) *Missing the Target* Barnados.
- David H.P. (1990) 'United States and Denmark: different approaches to health care and family planning' *Studies in Family Planning* 21-1, pp 1-19.
- David H.P. (1992) 'Abortion in Europe, 1921-1991' *Studies in Family Planning* 23-1, pp 1-22.
- Department of Health (1992) *The Health of the Nation: A Strategy for Health in England*, (Cm 1986), London: HMSO.
- Department of Health (1992a) *The Health of the Nation....and You*, London: HMSO.
- Doppenberg H. (1994) 'Free Pill in the Netherlands; For how much longer?' *Planned Parenthood in Europe* 23-1 pp 8-9
- Farrell C. (1983) *My Mother Said....the way young people learn about sex* London: Routledge.
- Fine M. (1988) 'Sexuality, schooling and adolescent females: the missing discourse of desire'. *Harvard Educational Review* 58 (1) pp 29-53.
- Ford N. (1991) *The Socio-sexual Lifestyles of Young People in South West England*, South West Regional health Authority.
- Ford N. (1992) 'The Sexual and Contraceptive Lifestyles of Young People' *The British Journal of Family Planning* 18 pp 52-55
- Francome C. (1993) *Children Who Have Children*, London: FPA.
- Furstenberg F. Brooks-Gunn J. Morgan S. P. (1987) *Adolescent Mothers in Later Life*, New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Geronimus A. (1987) 'On teenage childbearing and neonatal mortality in the United States.' *Population & Development Review* 13 pp 245-262
- Green D. (1991) 'Liberty, Poverty and the underclass' Paper presented at PSI seminar, London.
- Gress-Wright J. (1993) 'The Contraception Paradox' *The Public Interest* 113 pp 15-25
- Gruneit A. & Kippax S. (1994) *Effects of Sex Education on Young People's Sexual Behaviour*, Geneva: WHO.
- Hantrais L. (1994) 'Comparing Family Policy in Britain, France and Germany.' *Journal of Social Policy* 23-2 pp 135-60.
- Haskey J. (1983) 'Marital status and age at marriage: their influence on the chance of divorce' *Population Trends* 32 pp 4-14
- Haskey J. (1993) 'Trends in the numbers of one-parent families in Great Britain.' *Population Trends* no 71, Spring pp 26-33.
- Hill M. (1988) 'Do family planning facilities meet the needs of sexually active teenagers?' *British Journal of Family Planning* 13-4 pp 48-51
- Hoem B. & J. (1987) *The Swedish Family: Aspects of Contemporary Developments*, Stockholm Reports on Demography no. 43, University of Stockholm.
- Holmgren K. (1989) 'Sweden: an open society' *Planned Parenthood in Europe* 18-3
- Hudson F & Ineichen B. (1991) *Taking it Lying Down: Sexuality and Teenage Motherhood*, London: Macmillan.
- Ineichen B. (1986) 'Contraceptive use and attitudes to motherhood amongst teenage mothers' *Journal of Biosocial Science* 18-4
- Joffe C. (1993) 'Sexual politics and the teenage pregnancy prevention worker in the United States' in Lawson A. & Rhode D. *The Politics of Pregnancy: Adolescent Sexuality and Public Policy*, New Haven: Yale University Press. pp 284-300
- Jones E. F. (1986) *Teenage Pregnancy in Industrialised Countries* New Haven: Yale University Press.

- Kamerman S. (1988) *Mothers Alone: Strategies for a Time of Change*, Dover MA: Auburn House.
- Kershaw A. (1993) 'The Wonder Years' *The Guardian* 18.12.93
- Kiernan K. (1980) 'Teenage motherhood - associated factors and consequences - the experiences of a British birth cohort.' *Journal of Biosocial Science* pp 393-405
- Kiernan K. & Wicks M. (1990) *Family Change & Future Policy* London: Family Policy Studies Centre.
- Kiernan K. & Estagah V. (1993) *Cohabitation: extra-marital childbearing and social policy* London: Family Policy Studies Centre.
- Lawson A. & Rhode D. (1993) *The Politics of Pregnancy: Adolescent Sexuality and Public Policy* New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Lees S. (1993) *Sugar and Spice: sexuality and adolescent girls* London: Penguin.
- MacIntyre S. (1977) *Single and Pregnant*, London: Croom Helm.
- Macintyre S. & Cunningham-Burley S. (1993) 'Teenage pregnancy as a social problem: a perspective from the United Kingdom' in Lawson A. & Rhode D. *The Politics of Pregnancy: Adolescent Sexuality and Public Policy*, New Haven: Yale University Press. pp 59-73
- Meredith P. (1986) *Adolescents: Planning Contraceptive and Counselling Services* London: IPPF
- Millar J. (1984) 'Lone Parents and Social Security in the UK' in Baldwin S. & Falkingham J. (1994) *Social Security and Social Change*, Brighton: Harvester Wheatsheaf
- Millar J. (1987) 'Lone Mothers' in Glendinning C. & Millar J. (eds) *Women and Poverty in Britain* 1st edition, Brighton: Wheatsheaf Books.
- Murray C. (1990) *The Emerging British Underclass* London: IEA
- Musik J. S. (1993) *Young, Poor and Pregnant: The Psychology of Teenage Motherhood* Yale University Press.
- Pearce D. M. (1993) "'Children Having Children': Teenage pregnancy and public policy from the woman's perspective' in Lawson A. & Rhode D. *The Politics of Pregnancy: Adolescent Sexuality and Public Policy*, New Haven: Yale University Press. pp 46-58
- Persson E. et al (1994) 'Subsidising Contraception for Young People in Sweden' *Planned Parenthood in Europe* 23-1 pp 2-4
- Phoenix A. (1991) *Young Mothers?* Cambridge: Polity Press,
- Plotnick R. D. (1990) 'Welfare and out-of wedlock childbearing and public policy.' *Journal of Marriage and the Family* 52, pp 735-746
- Plotnick R. D. (1993) 'The Effect of Social Policies on Teenage Pregnancy and Childbearing' *Families in Society* June 1993.
- Reid D. (1982) 'School sex education and the causes of unintended teenage pregnancies - a review' *Health Education Journal* 41-1
- Rhode D. (1993) 'Adolescent pregnancy and public policy' in Lawson A. & Rhode D. *The Politics of Pregnancy: Adolescent Sexuality and Public Policy* New Haven: Yale University Press. pp 301-335
- Risor H. (1989) 'Reducing abortion: the Danish experience' *Planned Parenthood in Europe* 18-1 pp 17-19
- Russell J. (1968) *Early Teenage Pregnancy* Edinburgh: Churchill Livingstone.
- Segest E. (1991) 'How to do requires knowledge, insight and skill' Paper presented to conference on *Teenage Pregnancy: International Perspectives*, London, September 1991
- Selman P. (1988) 'Family Planning', *Reviews of UK Statistical Sources* Vol XXV, London: Chapman & Hall.
- Selman P. & Calder J. (1994) 'Variations in the characteristics of attenders at community family planning clinics' *British Journal of Family Planning* 20 pp 13-16.
- Simms M. & Smith C. (1986) *Teenage Mothers and their Partners* London: HMSO.
- Simms M. (1993) 'Adolescent pregnancy among blacks in the United States: why is it a policy issue?' in Lawson A. & Rhode D. (1993) *The Politics of Pregnancy: Adolescent Sexuality and Public Policy*, New Haven: Yale University Press. pp 241-256
- Swedish Institute (1990) *Family Planning in Sweden*, Fact Sheets on Sweden, Stockholm: Swedish Institute.
- Wielandt H. & Boldsen J. (1989) 'Age at first intercourse' *Journal of Biosocial Science* 21 pp 169-177
- Williams J.M. & Hindell K. (1972) *Abortion & Contraception*, London: PEP.
- Zabin L. S. & Hayward S. C. (1993) *Adolescent Sexual Behaviour and Childbearing*, London: Sage.

MOBILE FACILITIES FOR WORK WITH YOUNG PEOPLE IN RURAL AREAS

RAY FABES AND DAVID POPHAM

Introduction

Sometimes in our struggle to understand and constructively work with the issues surrounding the lives of young people in an urban environment we can lose the importance of considering the experience of those who live in a rural area. In a previous article Fabes and Banks (1991) clearly identify 'mobile projects' as a distinct approach that more adequately engages with the needs and interests of young people living in rural areas. It is noticeable that during the last five years the growth and development of such projects has produced examples of innovative practice, which in turn has promoted both discussion and experiment throughout the country.

This article will seek to explore the origins and development of such projects, their range in terms of the rural locations in which they operate, the types of vehicles that are utilised, and the kinds of activities which they promote. We will draw on 'Rural Mobiles' (Fabes & Popham 1993), a directory giving an overview of the variety of mobile projects in England currently engaging in informal social education opportunities with young people. We will then analyse the sponsorship and funding of these projects and draw out the key issues in terms of current policy developments in working with young people. We will consider how the contentious notion of curriculum is addressed in the projects and the way this relates to recent statements about 'The Youth Service' and the recommendation that it should operate within a variety of 'partnerships'. For so long rural work has 'often been seen as the poorer, smaller and less resourced urban model implanted into the countryside without due care and attention' (Fabes & Knowles 1991, p.1). In this instance we argue much can be gained from analysing the use of mobile facilities in rural areas which in turn might inform such work in urban areas.

The literature

Little has been recorded specifically about working with young people in rural areas, particularly prior to the 1939-45 war. This is not to say that work with young people in rural areas did not occur previously, but rather that there is a dearth of written documentary evidence. Some exceptions to this occur within the accounts of the foundation of the Girls Friendly Society in 1875, although it is only Percival (1951, pp.81-91) who comments specifically on the rural focus.

More recent records of working with young people in rural areas, begin to appear as youth organisations, already well established at the outbreak of the 1939-45 war, started to come to terms with the effects of the evacuation of children and young people from urban to rural locations. A decade and a half later the Albemarle Report (1960) failed to mention the word 'rural' at all, nor was there any mention of a rural context in the Fairbairn/Milson report, 'Youth and Community Work in the 1970s' (DES, 1969). This was all the more surprising as a subcommittee of the post Albemarle Youth Service Development Council, chaired by R.D. Salter Davies asserted that the rural youth service, 'needs to be even more

flexible and diversified than the service in the towns, and even more ready to use unconventional methods' (para 31) and that, 'a peripatetic "hop on" vehicle [might be provided]... a mobile coffee bar...' (para 44) which could be one alternative approach (YSDC, 1964). The Report was ignored by Fairbairn/Milson. It is not only in government reports that the rural context of youth work has been ignored, major commentators such as Smith (1988) appear to give little more than an acknowledgement in passing.

On the other hand, in 1978 the Campaign for Rural Youth (CRY) had gathered force within the National Association of Youth Clubs and its publication 'Missed the Bus' (CRY, 1979), appears to have stimulated discussion around things rural. It is a little surprising, given the title of CRY's pamphlet, that it did not refer to mobile facilities either. Even so, the work of CRY clearly influenced the Thompson Committee and its significant report (HMSO, 1982) included a section entitled 'Rural Areas', which argued that young people in rural areas should receive a 'fair share of resources and appropriate styles of work'(para. 6.34, p.59). With the support of the Youth Service Inspectorate, CRY evolved into the 'Rural Youth Work Education Project' based at the National Association of Youth Clubs. The publications of this project gave those working with young people in rural areas a more concerted voice, and one, 'Delivering Rural Youth Work' (NAYC, 1984) contained explicit accounts of mobile facilities (pp.44-46, 57-58, 70-74). Subsequent developments are well documented in Fabes & Knowles (1991, pp.23-27).

Origins & development of rural mobiles

The 'Princess Mary Caravan', has been described as, 'the first mobile publicity and training unit' (GFS, 1975, p.2) and was launched by the Girls Friendly Society in 1922. It was a sophisticated and well developed mobile response that travelled widely throughout the Country (Heath-Stubbs, 1926, pp.116-117). There does however seem little to link this earlier work with current practice, although Fabes (1992) offers a brief summary. Other commentators however, might equate some of the 'Christian' mobile projects with that of the earlier itinerant evangelists.

With the exception of the urban, Birmingham based 'Twenty Two Centre' (DES, 1963) and the mention of 'mobile coffee bars' in the Salter Davies Report (YSDC, 1964) there seems to be nothing formally recorded about mobiles until the late 1970s (see NAYC, 1984). More recently, White (1991) and Shanks (1992) make helpful contributions by including rural mobiles in their case studies of work with young people. Fabes & Popham (1993, pp.6-8) outline the development during the 1970s and 1980s.

Geographic range

The research reported in 'Rural Mobiles' (Fabes & Popham 1993) records 46 active projects in England spread over 24 counties from Cumbria to Cornwall, with a further 21 projects (in seven more counties) that are known to be in existence, under development, or to have recently ceased operating. This accounts for in excess of 60 recent projects spread over more than 30 of the 40 counties (excluding those considered to be metropolitan areas such as Manchester, Tyne & Wear and London). The area covered by individual projects varies from the 'Mobile Action' caravan operating on the housing estates peripheral to Bridgwater in Somerset to 'Craven Youth Enquiry Service' covering around 1200 square miles in North

Yorkshire. Road networks used vary from location to location, but as a generalisation most projects seem to operate an area of between 150-450 square miles. This again roughly equates to a radius of 7-12 miles from a home base. The terrain covered by projects is also varied, from the Cambridge and Lincolnshire fens in the East to the uplands and hills of Shropshire in the West. This means that whilst for some projects, contact needs to be maintained across an area of widely scattered villages and farms linked by a complex network of roads and lanes, others in upland areas have their contact links defined by the roads following the valley bottoms. The differing terrain and spread of habitation has resulted in projects developing a variety of responses. Some operate a minibus service (for example, 'Youth Wheels' and 'Wolds Youth Bus', both in North Yorks) to young people in isolated farms and hamlets, thus providing access to facilities in local towns. Others like 'Village Link' in Leicestershire and 'Breckland Freestyle' from Norfolk use their vehicles for the most part to take resources into a rural area. Double decker buses such as operated by the 'Desford Rural Outreach Project' and 'Rutland Bus' in Leicestershire form self-contained centres that drive to a meeting point. In a similar way caravan projects like 'The Van' in Oxfordshire provide a focal point where young people can congregate. The Leicestershire Council for Voluntary Youth Services video 'Bus Stops' (LCVYS 1993) goes some way towards illustrating the responses described above by recording the work of the three rural mobiles in this county.

The types of vehicles and facilities offered

The range of vehicles being used reflects the need to match the mobile facility with the locality in which it operates. The stereotypical image of a mobile is that of the converted double decker bus, and whilst this remains a popular choice it is not always the most suitable for the terrain. Of the 46 projects in the 'Rural Mobiles' directory, the vehicles used are as follows:

Table 1: Types of Vehicle

19	Double Decker Buses.
10	Caravans or Trailers + Minibus or Land Rover
8	Minibuses/Caravanette
4	Single Deck Buses or Coaches
3	Converted Truck/Library Van/Ambulance
2	Specialist Built Vehicles

The choice of vehicle is influenced by a number of factors: cost, usage, staffing, impact and image, physical constraints, security and maintenance. For example, the 'Chatterbus' project in Cornwall has operated three vehicles in succession. The first two being double decker buses, but the current vehicle is a converted single deck crewbus. The decisions influencing the selection of this new vehicle were based on the assessment that a double decker bus simply did not suit the winding lanes and low bridges of the local road network, thus making it difficult to reach the new locations where young people were now congregating. The variety of factors which determine the choice of a vehicle are interlinked but inevitably funding,

both in terms of capital outlay and subsequent running costs, has a significant impact on the options open to most projects. Some projects have exceptional assets like the mechanic, the youth worker, the driver, the publicist and politician all in one person (see Keith Jones, 'Born to be Bus', Shanks 1992).

More than one project (now using alternative methods of engaging with young people) has reported that pilot schemes to assess usage have revealed that where a double decker 'playbus' operates in the locality then older groups will avoid being associated with something that they perceive as being for children. What is not certain is whether the option of a minibus and caravan/trailer would be sufficiently different to be attractive to target groups resistant to the playbus image. Projects reporting this type of identity difficulty appear to operate a peripatetic 'village green' model as an alternative method of contact. The exterior image presented by a mobile unit is significant. Some groups have expressed concern that a large vehicle can sometimes overwhelm the limited space available (pub forecourt, village square), or simply be too big either to park safely or to negotiate bridges and overhanging trees. One project where young people were involved in the design and decoration of their mobile solved the height difficulty by having the roof of its ex-removal truck lowered by eighteen inches (White 1991, p.2). Another problem experienced by some projects is that their vehicles suffer from vandalism because of a lack of secure garaging. There are unexpected pitfalls too - a project operating in a coastal strip lost the use of its vehicle when salt affected the wooden framework.

On the whole projects mostly appear to have set out with a reasonably clear idea about what they want out of a vehicle and make their choice accordingly. In one or two instances however projects have inherited or have had a vehicle thrust upon them. This seems to create a quandary as a struggle emerges to fit usage to the vehicle, rather than the other way around, and most often results in little negotiation with the young people concerned.

Activities - the range and variety offered

As might be expected with the wide range of vehicles employed, the activities and facilities offered by mobile projects vary considerably. By their very nature all of the 46 projects we researched had a common starting point, they all took what they had to offer out to where young people could take advantage of it. There are a variety of ways in which mobiles are used, but it is possible to find some common themes as Table 2 demonstrates.

Table 2: Activities Offered

- 5 provide access, by acting solely as a means of transport.
 - 31 take activities to a meeting point.
 - 10 act in a dual role both as transport and a means of bringing in activities.
-

Four of the five projects where the mobile provides transport only (for example Shropshire's 'Clebury Mortimer Minibus'), bring young people together from small villages, hamlets and isolated farm dwellings to a common point where they can meet together, perhaps in a village hall or Youth Centre. The remaining project, Nottinghamshire's 'Special Coaches Project' operates a fleet of coaches with

hydraulic lifts which offer transport facilities to groups of young people whose mobility would tend to make conventional coach transport difficult. This project is a vital link for young people with a disability, who also live in rural areas of the county.

By far the most popular style of mobile project (almost two in every three projects researched) is where the vehicle is used to take activities into a location and the vehicle itself, in all but two cases (specialist outdoor activity trailers), then becomes the meeting point. Essentially the only difference between this style of working and the remaining group (about one in every five projects researched) is that this latter group has the capacity to combine the functions of transporting both young people and activities, and in several cases providing a base for small group residential experiences as well.

With the exception of the 'transport only' projects and the specialist outdoor activity trailers (such as 'Breckland Freestyle', Norfolk), the most apparent common factor in mobiles is that they provide somewhere inside for young people to meet their peers, and generally they have 'coffee bar' facilities if not a complete kitchen available. Providing somewhere for young people to come, sit, talk, listen to music and to 'be' in some degree of comfort is a major linking theme in the work of rural mobiles, and accurately reflects an engagement with the issues which affect young people in rural areas as previously discussed in this journal (see Fabes and Banks, 1991).

Sports, outdoor games and arts and craft equipment are also a common feature of mobile work, with more than half of the projects having their own or immediate access to a local resource base. The range is wide with some projects (e.g. Warwickshire Association of Youth Club's 'Mobile Craft Training Unit') able to match the variety of craft opportunities on offer in a building-based centre. Other projects, particularly those with a more specialist information, advice or counselling role (for example 'Craven YES', North Yorkshire; 'The Van', Oxfordshire; 'Tackle Express', Norfolk) carry more in the way of an information network, access to specialist workers, issue-based publicity and games. The television and video recorder play a part in most projects where young people come aboard (four also have their own video camera). Equipment that operates efficiently on a 12v DC power supply is now more readily available and reduces the dependency on a 240v mains or generator power supply. Information Technology likewise is very evident, with two in three projects using computers in some form or another. Playing computer games is backed up by promoting access to word processing, desktop publishing and advice programs. Board games remain a common feature with both traditional (Scrabble, Trivial Pursuits) and issue based (Grapevine, Scruples, Man's World) packages finding a place on most mobiles.

Musical instruments take their place alongside the cassette player in about one in four of the projects, mostly in the form of keyboards, synthesisers and guitars. One mobile even acts as a rehearsal room on Sundays, when the driver takes his motorcycle in the mobile, deposits the group on top of the moors, returning later that day to drive the group back into the 'undisturbed' villages!

Some of the bus-based projects have a freestanding generator and are able to offer activities using their own inflatable 'Bouncy' mattresses, earth balls and games parachutes away from building-based supplies of power and lighting. Other spe-

cialist vehicles like Shropshire's 'Hamlet Hopper' and Nottinghamshire's 'Transformers' can be used as living and sleeping quarters whilst groups are away from home. The 'Transformer' project also has a self-contained climbing wall and zipwire, mountain bikes and climbing equipment. Other outdoor activity projects (such as Leicestershire's 'Girls Breakout on Wheels', Clubs for Young People formerly Boys Clubs 'Sportsmobiles') have access to camping equipment, canoes and so forth.

In terms of models of contemporary practice the style of work is similar to detached work, in other ways mobiles can often be an enormous boost of activity and enthusiasm to small village clubs meeting in draughty corners of village halls, unstimulating (often junior) classrooms opened reluctantly by local schools or treading gingerly in the only church hall available in the location in question.

It is the ability to bring this type of 'modern' stimulation into the often very constricted lives of young people in rural areas that makes the mobile distinctive.

Our research also revealed a couple of items that were not initially apparent as facilities required by this type of work, reflecting the isolated nature of most rural work. Communication when projects are 'on the road' is desirable for both the workers and young people alike. Telephones are not always readily accessible particularly in the case of breakdowns, or arranging lifts home, so some projects operate citizen band radios whilst another has the use of a mobile phone. One project concerned about its mainly female staff operating along some very isolated moorland roads has come up with an interesting alternative - a radio linked to a local taxi firm means that in an emergency workers can summon help via a 'known' agency.

The other item of interest to emerge from our research was that of the delicate subject of toilet facilities. This is not a problem in most locations where there is access to toilets, but several bus projects (not only those undertaking residential trips) are equipped with modern camping 'flushing' toilets.

Funding sources - partnerships, sponsors, grants & trusts

Almost all projects list securing continuity of funding as the most pressing issue. Our research did not attempt to undertake a financial analysis of mobile projects, but a number of general principles did seem to emerge that are worth commenting on. With regard to staffing, few initiatives have full-time paid staff, most rely on a paid worker with other duties or on paid or volunteer part-time workers, usually funded by a local authority. A full-time paid member of staff is a rarity and where they do exist this is frequently a post with substantial time commitments to other areas of work. Projects vary in terms of both scale and complexity, accordingly rough estimates of annual running costs vary from £1,500 as the salary of a part-time worker for one project to £150,000 as the total running cost for a major mobile project with a number of full-time salaried staff.

If the data in 'Rural Mobiles' is analysed no less than 32 out of 46 projects exist on a pattern of partnership. The types of bodies include: European Social Fund, individual Parish Council donations, fund raising events, large company sponsorship, Rural Development Commission start up grants and consistent funding from independent Trusts and Charities. In 30 out of the 46 it was an Education-based service that had been the 'lead body' in the venture, and was still the core funder.

The fully independent trust projects tend to be those associated with para-church organisations such as British Youth for Christ, where funds are raised locally with the support of participating churches. The projects funded solely by local authority youth services tend to be specialist projects set up to undertake work with girls and young women (for example 'Girls Work Caravan'), travellers (for example 'South Bucks Outreach Project'), young disabled people (for example 'Special Coaches Project'), or specialist opportunities (for example 'Transformers Project') seen as appeal-worthy in their own right. It is apparent however that, like Victorian charity with its lists of individual sponsors, the mobile project for working with young people in rural areas would seem to need an overarching umbrella of goodwill from a range of influential bodies. For example, one project researched would not exist without the sponsorship of its Rural Community Council, although that body makes no financial contribution at all.

Both the Salter Davies (YSDC, 1964) and DES (1988) reports called for flexibility and diversification in approaches to work with young people in rural areas. Mobile projects seem to have demonstrated some imaginative ways of widening their bases of support, never relying on a single source of funding or sponsorship.

Key issues for mobile work

The key to effective rural mobile work seems to be finding ways of reducing the negative aspects of living in a rural environment upon the lives of young people. Fabes & Banks (1991) identified issues with negative aspects as: isolation, visibility, equal opportunities, leaving home, access and personal experience; but young people from rural areas when asked also identify positive features: space, peace and quiet, lack of traffic, safety, and what they regard as 'community' (Popham, 1990). We must be clear that rural life itself is not a negative experience. Most of us who live or have lived in a rural location as a young person can recognise positive aspects of rural life. There are, however, issues surrounding opportunity of access to facilities, or to other people that are readily available in towns and cities in a way that is missing in many rural locations. A trawl of the information provided by the projects researched provides some indications of the issues they are active in addressing.

1) Access to information and advice:

Access to information and advice forms part of the work of the majority of mobile projects: most carry information leaflets, others provide a sophisticated advice and information network, occasionally on a computer database. Welfare rights, employment and benefits advice, leaving home and homelessness, and contacts with other advice organisations and workers is part of this role, which tends, in part, to replace facilities provided by Youth Information Shops, Young People's Counselling and Advice Services and the Citizen's Advice Bureaux in the towns. The 'Craven YES' (Youth Enquiry Service) caravan project in North Yorkshire visits school and college campuses on this basis and seems to have built up an effective local network of contact points. The response to this type of initiative is not always an immediate success. Evidence from Leicestershire would suggest that when a mobile just advertises, 'Rights, Information and Advice' no one goes near the vehicle. It has been suggested that this is because of a perception by the young people involved that to ask for help is an admission of not being able to manage one's own affairs. In other areas, however, projects have demonstrated that where

advice and information services are offered within activities that are acceptable to young people, then the response is more positive. It does appear that the style of approach required to engage with the needs of young people in this aspect of mobile work needs very careful evaluation at a local level. The response in one location does not necessarily readily transfer to another. Similarly the relationship between workers and young people is crucial (Fabes & Popham, 1994).

2) Personal Development

Informal social education is about ensuring individuals have the opportunity to develop and enhance their experience of life. This involves access to information, but also the confidence to know how to use what is known. Therefore it is not surprising that among projects researched, the following topics occurred on a number of occasions: housing and homemaking, employment, healthcare, pregnancy, young parenthood, personal safety, substance use, the impact of crime on the victim, and equality of opportunity.

In terms of equal opportunities several projects had been involved in cross cultural work, exchanges with urban groups or one case with a Sikh community. In a similar way issues surrounding stereotyping with regard to race, HIV/Aids, homosexuality, travellers and disability form part of the work of many projects. A number of projects mention work with girls and young women, but much fewer appear to have a focus on working specifically with boys and young men on issues of masculinity. Projects dedicated specifically to work with girls and young women are building up resources that also reflect their own interests, in presenting positive self images, whilst working on the issues of equality of opportunity and empowerment. Several aspects of developing positive images with young people in rural areas through mobile projects are also featured in the wide ranging text 'Nothing ever happens around here' (Phillips & Skinner, 1994), the first publication of the Rural Development Commission's three year project based at the National Youth Agency.

3) Participation

Most projects are active in involving young people in programme planning, management and decision making, for example it is written into the constitution of the 'Pegasus Project' that 50% of its management committee should consist of young people (under 25 years). Others use a community development model which encourages young people and local adults to find their way forward in partnership to establish their own freestanding groups. There are outstanding examples of projects where young people have been involved with the instigation and motivation of a project and its subsequent development (see White 1991, pp.1-4).

4) Curriculum

All of this works towards an understanding of how the contentious notion of a 'curriculum' is developed in mobile projects. First and foremost the relationship between a mobile project and young people is voluntary; accordingly, there must be a willingness on the part of the workers and young people alike to want to meet together. This means that any curriculum activity is likely to come about as a result of consultation and negotiation. If, for example, a group of young people want to undertake a particular activity, or go somewhere, then this will need to be discussed with the workers, plans laid, pick up arrangements set and outcomes agreed. This leaves the workers with plenty of scope to share the tasks (and more importantly the

experience) and explore the issues involved with the participants. The negotiated nature of work from mobiles lends itself admirably to the construction of informal learning curricula leading to the participants gaining knowledge and acquiring social and practical skills. It is our view that much of the work of mobiles accurately reflects the main points of the 'Statement of Purpose' agreed at the second ministerial conference (NYA, 1993). It could be argued that these flexible and innovative ways of engaging with the needs and interests of young people in rural areas also offer some important lessons to inform work in other areas of the country.

5) Policy

The National Advisory Council for the Youth Service in its report on Youth Work in Rural Areas (DES, 1988, Ch.6) suggested that potential funding agencies with a presence in rural areas, especially QUANGOs, charities and trusts should become significant partners in work with young people in rural areas, and that youth service agencies should move away from a reliance on a single source of funding. Mobile facilities have certainly established the case over the last five years. A distinctive policy seems to have emerged within most projects, that a partnership model is the most effective. This reflects the current political trend (see Home Office, 1994).

The range of opportunities for developing the work of rural mobiles is reflected in the variety of agencies with which the projects have working links, not as funders exclusively this time but as partners in the project or as agencies offering specialist advice (for example National Playbus Association). Our research indicates that the agencies actively involved in maintaining contact with the work of mobile projects include: Adult Basic Education, Barnado's, Careers Service, Sports and Arts Councils, Health and Social Services, MIND, PHAB, Community Groups, and Citizens Advice Bureaux.

This brings a new dimension to the partnership concept, that of the mobile as a contact point for multi-agency provision. Not every agency has either the funds or indeed the requirement to maintain a regular presence in an area, but contact names and telephone numbers can be made available on a mobile for when a need arises.

The Future

Although partnerships appear to help bring about innovative links and approaches to work in rural areas, there is a nagging concern in the mind of the writers, that the financing of developmental work frequently follows whatever issue happens to be in the public eye at the time. This in itself is no bad thing since it tends to help concentrate effort on a point of identified need. However, if mobile projects become too dependent on pockets of short term targeted funding; then they run the risk of playing to the tune of whatever issue happens to be politically and professionally topical at the moment. This could lead to the situation where projects will cease to have the ability to develop the more imaginative generic responses to the everyday needs and interests of young people in rural areas that is demonstrated by so many of the projects researched. For example, as much urban and estate-based work is funded by new delinquency and crime prevention measures it may be difficult for such rural projects to respond to the same criteria.

Mobile projects are not confined to rural areas alone. A similar article analysing the use of urban mobiles is likely to reveal some interesting comparisons of trends and practice, which in turn would offer valuable lessons to urban and rural practice alike.

Ray Fabes and David Popham are based in the School of Health and Community Studies, De Montfort University, Leicester.

References

- The Albemarle Report (1960) 'The Youth Service in England and Wales', London, HMSO.
- CRY (1979) *Missed the Bus*, Campaign for Rural Youth, Leicester, NAYC.
- DES (1963) 'Is this Britain's only Mobile Youth Club?', in *Department of Education and Science Newsheet*.
- DES (1969) see 'The Fairbairn-Milson Report'.
- DES (1988) *Youth Work in Rural Areas*, (NACYS Subcommittee Report), London, Department of Education & Science and the Welsh Office.
- Fabes, R.C. (1992) see NYA (1992).
- Fabes, R.C. and Banks, S. (1991) 'Working with Young People in Rural Areas'. in *Youth & Policy*, no.33, pp.1-9
- Fabes, R.C. and Knowles, C. (1991) *Working with Young People in Rural Areas*, Leicester, Leicester Polytechnic.
- Fabes, R.C. and Popham, D.B. (1993) *Rural Mobiles*, Leicester, National Youth Agency.
- Fabes, R.C. and Popham, D.B. (1994) 'Negotiated learning around local issues', in *Adults Learning*, Vol.6, No.2.
- The Fairbairn-Milson Report (1969) 'Youth and Community Work in the 1970s', London, HMSO
- Girls Friendly Society (1975) *1875-1975 One Hundred Years of the Girls Friendly Society*, London, GFS.
- Heath-Stubbs, M. (1926) *Friendship's Highway, Being a History of the Girl's Friendly Society*, London, GFS.
- HMSO (1960) see 'The Albemarle Report'.
- HMSO (1982) see 'The Thompson Report'.
- Home Office (1994) *Make a Difference*, London, Home Office.
- Leicestershire Council for Voluntary Youth Services (1993) *Bus Stops* - a video, Three Rural Youthwork Projects in Leicestershire. Leicester, LCVYS.
- NAYC (1984) *Delivering Rural Youth Work*, Leicester, National Association of Youth Clubs.
- NYA (1992) *Working with Wheels*, Conference Report, Leicester, National Youth Agency.
- NYA (1993) *What is the Youth Service?*, Leicester, National Youth Agency.
- Percival, A. (1951) *Youth will be led, The story of voluntary organisations*, London, Collins.
- Phillips, D. and Skinner, A. (1994) *Nothing Ever Happens Around Here*, Leicester, Youth Work Press.
- Popham, D.B. (1990) *There's too many Nettles!*, A study on models of rural youth work in East Warwickshire (unpublished), Leicester Polytechnic.
- The Salter Davies Report (1964) 'The Problems of Youth Work in Rural Areas', Youth Service Development Council, London, HMSO
- Shanks, K. (1992) *Mobile Work Series No.2 Road Works - Mobile Provision for Youth*, Bristol, National Playbus Association.
- Smith, M. (1988) *Developing Youth Work*, Milton Keynes, Open University Press.
- The Thompson Report (1982) 'Experience and Participation: Report of the Review Group on the Youth Service in England', cmdn 8686, London, HMSO.
- White, P. (1991) *Windows on Practice - Working with Rural Youth*. Leicester, Youth Work Press.
- YSDC (1964) see 'The Salter Davies Report'.

URBAN YOUTH - NOT AN UNDERCLASS

BOB HOLMAN

I am pleased to give a lecture to mark the 150th anniversary of The YMCA¹. Pleased because it is right to pay tribute to the contribution of the YMCA and pleased because I share the Christian principles on which it was founded.

Young People Today

What is the condition of young people today? It must be made clear that most are in jobs (or education and training), do have a home, are not criminals. None the less, there is much of concern for a significant minority.

Consider poverty. If poverty is taken as incomes below 50% of average income then, in 1991, 13.5 million people in Britain were poor. One in three of all children are in this plight. Bit figures do not convey the problem. Living on the large estate of Easterhouse in Glasgow, I have young mothers at my door who can not afford nappies if they buy food and young men who ask for a sleeping bag just to keep warm.

Consider unemployment. In Glasgow, and probably in Newcastle, one in four 16-24 year olds are out of work. 16-17 year olds are supposed to be guaranteed Youth Training places with an allowance of £35 a week, which the millionaire government minister, Jonathan Aitken probably considers too comfortable. Yet Youthaid estimates that 122,500 16-17 year olds are outside of schemes and work and that three quarters of these have no income at all. Even those in work may be in poverty. In Newcastle and Glasgow, 65% of jobs on offer have very low wages with young people typically taking posts in shops and restaurants at £2-3 an hour.

Consider housing. Young people under the age of 25 occupy 40% of the country's furnished rented accommodation. And 10% of that is unfit for human habitation. In places like Easterhouse, where one in four council flats are empty, young people can obtain a flat but not afford to furnish it. They turn to the Salvation Army Furniture Store for the beds and mattresses and cookers which the rest of us have chucked out. At least they have a tenancy. Shelter estimates that 50,000 16-19 year olds experience homelessness each year. In Newcastle, the YMCA reports 3,583 young people on the housing list, an increase of over 400% since 1980.

And what of crime and drugs? In 1990, 124,000 young adults (17-20 years) were found guilty or cautioned for indictable offences. Serious figures, yet we should note, falling figures. The number of drug addicts notified to the Home Office is still relatively small. Yet, in Glasgow, the police estimate thousands of users on the peripheral estates. A YMCA survey in Northamptonshire found over 50% of pupils saying they were offered drugs at school. Hard drug use may be a minority but it is a serious problem. One morning at 2 am, I was woken by a young man demanding money for drugs—and he had a meat cleaver to persuade me. I know teenage girls who are prostituting to feed their habit. Some police estimates put 50% of crime as drug-related.

The Underclass Explanation

What is the reason for these social problems? Of late, Charles Murray has popularised the explanation of an underclass.

In his book, published by the Institute of Economic Affairs, *The Emerging British Underclass* (1990), Murray claims the existence of a growing, evil, underclass, made up of two main groups:

- a) *There are 'large numbers of young healthy, low-income males (who choose not to take jobs'. These 'young barbarians', as he calls them, sleep with as many women as possible. 'Without a job or family to give life meaning, drugs become that much more valuable as a means of distraction. The cost of drugs makes crime the only feasible way to make enough money to pay for them.'*
- b) *The other group is young, single mothers who choose to have children outside of marriage or co-habitation.*

According to Murray, the young men want sex, the young women want children, so they breed. Murray continues, 'The key to an underclass is a situation in which a very large proportion of the whole community lacks fathers,' The young mothers are incapable of raising children who also lack the discipline of a father. The outcome is a generation of youngsters who do badly at school, have no desire to work, lack family values and are criminal. The underclass theory explains poverty, unemployment, crime and drug taking. This underclass is so vast that it threatens society. Backed by the Sunday Times, Murray now writes that a battle is waging between the underclass and what he calls the New Victorians. The latter are mainly professional, well-paid people, who are moral, keep to their marriages and are honest—people like us, of course. The outcome will determine the fate of Britain.

What has provoked this explosion? The answer, Murray says, is the welfare state. Young men can choose to be idle by drawing the dole. Young women can choose to have children without partners because the state will pay. The solution, then, is to cut welfare to the unemployed to force them to take jobs. Digby Anderson even wants to remove the vote from the long-term unemployed. David Green advocates removing 'all the special benefits which are available to single parents' so that they marry for economic reasons. Murray also wants reduction of state education and training programmes because the underclass have genetically low IQs—about 80 for single mums—and so can not be improved by them. All this should occur within a private enterprise economy, which, without state restraints, will blossom to provide jobs for all.

A Critique

I may have exaggerated but I hope not caricatured the underclass thesis. It must be taken seriously because it is an influence within government. And it must be taken seriously because it is expounded by people who genuinely want to reduce unemployment and crime. I am not disputing that social evils exist, I am contesting an explanation which pins the blame on the poor.

Central to the underclass thesis is the explanation that state welfare has brought into being an underclass of young, unemployed, single people who turn to crime and drugs. Kirk Mann, in his devastating attack on Murray's scholarship, points out that in the Victorian hey-day of private enterprise, when state welfare was almost unknown, violent crime was common place, unemployment frequently reached high levels, and illegitimacy was not exactly unknown. In north-east Scotland, in

the 1890s, 45% of live births were outside marriage. There is no straightforward connection between expenditure on state welfare and social malaises.

The relationships between crime and unemployment and illegitimacy rates are subject to varying interpretations and I am no expert. I am a failed university professor who, like my beloved West Ham United, has constantly been relegated. However, I have spent the last 18 years living close to the very young people who are now labelled the underclass. My fundamental objection is that they do not display the pathological features which Murray insists are the characteristics of the underclass.

Easterhouse is worth examining because Murray takes it as a classic example of the underclass community. He likens it to the worst areas of New York, 'a community without fathers' where 'the kids tend to run wild.' So if Murray's thesis is correct we will find Easterhouse dominated by an underclass, the rejection of the work ethic, a majority of single parents, the abandonment of family values, a job culture of crime and drugs. In Easterhouse there are some wild kids; I know they attend our youth clubs. There are unemployed teenagers who hang about the streets; I know, some tried to roll over our minibus with me in it until some recognised me as the old guy who use to coach them at table tennis. There is violent crime: I know young people have been stabbed to death in our district. But the mistake of people like Murray is to pay a flying visit to Easterhouse and then take the worst examples as representative of what goes on.

If Murray stayed in Easterhouse he might ascertain these factors.

- 72% of Easterhouse children live in 2-parent families. So much for the community without fathers.
- The majority of 'economically active males' are in work. Unemployment rates are high but still most people work or desperately seek work. I am frequently writing references for young people as they apply for low-paid, short-term, dead end jobs. The work ethic still prevails.
- Amongst unemployed young people there are some drug users, some criminals. But they are not the majority, not a huge underclass. Far more representative are those who have the strength—and I'm not sure I would have—to resist temptations, to attend our clubs, to play in the football teams, to help in community activities.
- And family values are still strong. I think of a young father who has known nothing but short-term jobs. He is a virtual prisoner in Easterhouse for he rarely goes out for a holiday. Yet he stays with his partner, loves his kids, is strongly anti-drugs, and is one of the regular helpers at the youth clubs.

These are not untypical. Dr Anthony Heath reviewed research which separates welfare dependents and others. The former did want to work and, if anything, held stronger family values than the rest of society. But it didn't take them out of poverty.

Turning from Easterhouse, lets look at 30 young people, living away from home, studied by the Centre for Social Welfare Research at Edinburgh University. Most had slept rough, those in accommodation were in 'hard to let' tenancies. What were the characteristics of these young people at the bottom of the pile?

- a. None were homeless by choice. Most had left their parental homes following arguments or abuse. Over a quarter had been in public care.
- b. None had enough money to afford decent private accommodation. Two had no income at all. The majority received between £20-60 a week, including one who was in employment.
- c. Two thirds appeared in bad health with long-term illnesses like stomach ulcers and depression.
- d. They were not lacking in motivation. A third were attending some kind of training or educational courses to improve their prospects. All dreamt of getting a job.

The report concludes that these youngsters are not a macho underclass who choose to be unemployed and enjoy a life of crime and drugs. Rather they just wanted to be part of a society which excluded them.

My argument, then, is that there is no massive underclass, genetically inferior to the rest of us, which is taking over society and which is the cause of social evils. There is poverty and unemployment amongst young people but that is no justification for directing punitive policies against them.

I must add one other objection to the underclass explanation. I can not accept the condemning, insulting and offensive ways it regards young people. I am a Christian who believes that all people are created by God, are of unique value and of equal worth to Him. I must therefore reject a thesis which speaks of fellow human beings as 'barbarians', 'inferior', 'the rabble' and 'eyesores'. In Proverbs 17 v 5 it says, 'To sneer at the poor is to insult the creator..'

Another explanation

If the underclass explanation does not account for increasing poverty and unemployment, not to mention crime and drugs, what does? Of course, there can not be one single explanation and I do not claim to have all the answers. But my own experience and study leads me to give weight to the summary of the research by professors George and Howards, namely that,

industrial societies are stratified along class, gender and race lines so that economic and political power is unequally distributed. A person's economic position and hence the risk of poverty is largely decided by his family, background, education, gender, race and occupation.

Governments can challenge or re-inforce these inequalities. Since 1979, as Professor Jane Millar explains, British governments have upheld them by the following policies:

economic policies which tolerate massive unemployment with its associated poverty:

market policies which lead to low paid jobs:

social policies which restrict welfare services:

tax policies which mean that since 1979 the richest 10% have gained an average £87 a week while the poorest have lost £1 a week.

In other words, it is social, economic and government forces, not a wicked underclass, which lead to unemployment, poverty, low wages and homelessness. However, the long-term victims of these forces may eventually respond with behaviour which is harmful to themselves and others. For instance, there is a connection between unemployment and crime with the Manchester Probation Service reporting that 85% of its clients are unemployed. This is not to say that most unemployed people turn to crime. Far from it. It is to say that unemployment is one factor which may contribute to crime. Let me illustrate.

- a. Sometimes unemployment leads to a boredom which finds an outlet in crime or drugs. Those who scorn such an 'excuse' do not appreciate the frustrations, the sense of futility, the numbing nothingness that can stem from living unemployed on a run down estate with no prospects of change. Life must have activity and meaning. We live in a society which places status on occupation and which defines fulfilment in terms of consumer spending. But the same society denies employment and purchasing power to a minority of its young who may therefore seek illegal gratifications in taking cars, break-ins, drug taking.
- b. And unemployment and its associated poverty can lead to crimes of desperation. A young man came to confess to me that he had nicked my wallet from our flat. As explanation, he showed me his knee, smashed in by a loan shark's baseball bat. He had borrowed from the shark to get supplies for his kids. When he could not re-pay, he was beaten up. To avoid another beating, he stole from me. Desperation. A young mum shop-lifts to feed her baby. Another tells me that, against her will, she will prostitute, if it is the only way to obtain money for her family. These are not an underclass who hold different values from us. They want to work, want to look after their children.

I am not saying that unemployment and poverty are the cause of crime. Robert Maxwell and much activity in the City disproves that. I am saying that unemployment and poverty can precipitate some young people into crime.

To sum up. There is much to concern us about young people. Many, not most are unemployed, in poverty, in inadequate housing conditions. These deprivations stem not from the sudden appearance of an escalating underclass, whose genes and values are different from ours, but because they are subject to economic forces and government policies which handicap them while benefiting others. These disadvantages do push some into crime and drugs. In addition, and it is a point I have not developed here but have elsewhere, they make it difficult for them to raise their children in ways which satisfy society. It follows that they will not be helped by policies which further reduce their incomes, lock them up, or further exclude them from society. The best hope is to enable them to be a part of society.

What can be done?

In the long run, the alleviation of youth unemployment, poverty and poor housing rests with government. Even those who are opposed to direct statutory provision must concede that levels of employment and the availability of affordable accommodation depend upon the way government manages the economy.

I do seek more direct government intervention. In my book 'A New Deal For Social Welfare', I explain my belief in the principle of mutuality, that we are all responsible

for the well-being of each other, a principle which can be expressed collectively through social policy. A government committed to improving the lot of young people would need a short-term and long-term strategy. In the short-term, it should re-institute Income Support for unemployed teenagers, protect low-wage earners, and enable local authorities to extend accommodation for the young. In the long-term it should seek a re-distribution of resources to remedy the inequalities of the disadvantaged.

It will be objected that such state expenditure will harm the economy. On the contrary. Places like Easterhouse needs residents with more money to spend on food, clothes, furniture etc. For only if its local economy is revived will there be shops, a bank, employment. As Will Hutton so cogently argues, 'The fight against poverty is not merely a moral injunction: the just society begets the sound economy.' And these would be a better way of spending public money than the 4 million spent annually on luxurious lodgings for judges, on handouts to government ministers on leaving office, on the £5 billion gained by lowering income tax for high earners since 1979.

The YMCA

We can all try to influence politics. We can not all be politicians. So let's consider the role of voluntary bodies. I will outline some of the work of the YMCA and then turn to our own work in Glasgow.

For over 5 years, the YMCA in Newcastle has based its Project 10 on a block of flats. Its staff welcome new young tenants with starter packs of household goods and contact other young people on the streets. They give advice on practical matters like food, housing, independent living. The young people are drawn together into friendship groups by joint leisure activities and by residential weekends. The groups can then discuss the social challenges faced by them and take individual or group action. The Walker Detached Youth project keeps in touch with vulnerable young people over a long period. The staff are around when they are rejected, feel aggressive, have been arrested. They help the youngsters negotiate with social service and housing officials. They assist with job applications. A young mothers' group is a means of sharing experiences and learning child care skills. There is also fun at volleyball, excitement at parachute jumps. These shared activities promote a solidarity which is translated into wider action such as a lobby of MPs to get backing for the youth services.

In Northamptonshire, the YMCA responded to concern about drugs by taking a double decker bus onto local housing estates. The bus was equipped with sofas, stereo and a cafe and staff were soon able to initiate discussions about drugs and sexual behaviour. Youngsters poured in and, on neglected estates the bus became a youth club.

Fare in Glasgow

Our project on the Easterhouse estate in Glasgow is much more modest than those of the YMCA. It is called FARE, Family Action in Rogerfield & Easterhouse. FARE is a local organisation with its committee elected by residents. Last year its staff consisted of a leader Graham Hammond, a youth worker Josephine Whyte and myself part-time. Due to financial cuts, we now only have Graham as a paid member. We live locally. FARE is run cheaply and has just a small room in the Tenants Association's flat, no clerical staff, not even a photocopier. In style and location, it is a part of the neighbourhood. What does FARE do?

First, youth activities. In an over-crowded area with virtually no youth facilities, no cafe, no entertainment, FARE runs 16 youth activities each week. The extensive youth work depends upon 18 sessional workers, all local parents, all but one unemployed. In the summer, FARE arranges holidays for 150 youngsters. They range from adventure holidays for teenagers to family weekends. One involves an 8 hour drive with Easterhouse kids to a camp in Norfolk. No wonder my hair has gone grey.

We hope these clubs, sporting activities, holidays, lessen boredom. More, we want them to provide new experiences for young people who live restricted lives. After returning from a barge holiday in Holland, one teenager wrote, 'I wish I could have a photograph of my feelings so I could always have them.'

These activities are open to the neighbourhood. They are not just for delinquents or drug users. There is no stigma attached to attending. Hopefully it offers constructive leisure as an alternative to illegal activities.

Second, community ventures. FARE staff joined with other residents to form a community association, a credit union, a food co-op. The community association now has a nursery where qualified staff offer good care to small children—often those of young parents. The credit union, with a membership of 550, makes low interest loans and has virtually stopped loan sharking in our district. The food co-op is temporarily closed following a series of break-ins: when it re-opens, it will again sell bread at 27p a loaf as against 50p on the vans; it can enable young people, and others, to obtain cheaper food. Practical.

Third, friendship. With a few vulnerable youngsters, we offer constant friendship. After years of unemployment, a local man killed himself. The news was conveyed to his wife while she was in maternity having their fifth child. She was left with poverty and guilt and withdrew from the world. Her eldest son lost his place at YTS and became a drug addict. I knew the family through our youth clubs and was then able to help the mother in practical ways ranging from getting her a Hoover to avoiding eviction. I give most attention to her 15 year old who is disruptive and expelled from school. I am a kind of father figure to him and he usually comes round to tea and we play table tennis and pitch and put together. We've been close for 7 years and I've seen him grow up. I taught him to play and now he laughs as he thrashes me at badminton. If I can help him get through his teens without recourse to crime and drugs I'll be satisfied. But the big test will come when he leaves school.

The Essentials

The YMCA projects and FARE have had a few successes. So it is worthwhile drawing out their essential features.

- *They Are at the Hard End.* The Newcastle YMCA has deliberately shifted its resources to street level, to seeking out the most needy young people. FARE is located within the midst of a socially deprived estate. Projects require management expertise and support. But, in the end, their quality depends upon having committed staff in face to face contact with young people.
- *They are Long-Term.* Vulnerable young people sometimes complain about social workers who come and go. Some young people, especially those who have unstable family backgrounds, take a long time to form relationships. Therefore it is essential to have staff who stay. Indeed stickability is as important

as ability. In my previous project in Southdown, a young woman joined our team. She was obviously middle class and with a 'super' accent. At first, the kids made fun of her but, over the years, she won their respect by her persistence and compassion. After 11 years in Southdown, we moved to Easterhouse where I was one of the few English people in an estate where southerners are not popular. One resident said to me, 'We don't like the English but it's better than coming from Edinburgh'. I have the advantage of a Glaswegian wife and I've now been there 8 years. Residents will accept you if you are genuinely committed to them and you demonstrate it by staying.

- *They Are Available.* Young people tend to have crises in the evenings, weekends and bank holidays when statutory agencies are closed. I believe that those in real need must always have a door on which they can knock. Being available does inconvenience us but, at times, you open a door to a young woman whose been beaten up, a young man on the verge of suicide, a kid has been kicked out. It is essential.
- *They Are Prepared To Share Power.* Staff in projects may earn low salaries but, in relation to users, they are often in positions of power. They can determine who uses the facilities, who goes on the holidays, who gets the information. They form very close relationships with some young people and that brings the possibility of manipulation. It is essential therefore that power is shared with users. Clearly, the YMCA projects attempt to involve young people in decision making. Our approach in FARE is that the committee is elected by residents, who include teenagers. Consequently, management decisions, including employment of staff, are in the hands of users and that means those who know life at the hard end.
- *They Are About Creating Opportunities.* It is not enough to entertain young people. They must be equipped with the skills, resources and opportunities for self-development. The YMCA projects are about empowering young people so that they have more opportunities to live independently, to find employment. To achieve this end we must be able to perceive the potential of our users. Recently, I visited an alcoholic mother in psychiatric hospital: her daughter, 18 and heavily pregnant came in: I groaned inwardly for I remembered her as an uncontrollable 15 year old who, sometimes, had to be forcibly restrained during her rages and who then went into residential care: yet she has settled down with a stable partner and visits her mum every day: moreover, she told me that her eventual aim is to work in a children's home so as to put her negative experiences to good use: potential.

When I first moved to Southdown, Dave Wiles was a delinquent thug, on probation for violence and drug dealing. He was dramatically changed by a Christian conversion and became first chairperson of our senior youth club. Later he worked full-time on the project as my assistant. He obtained some training and we swapped roles, he became leader with me as assistant. He proved far better than me, not only in communicating with youngsters, we expected that, but also in managerial skills. Our part was to create the opportunities for him.

These essential features - involvement at the hard end, long term commitment, availability, power sharing, opportunity creation - are being pursued by voluntary bodies. They should also characterise statutory ones and social policy. But they will only come about if young people are regarded, not as an evil underclass to be condemned, but as decent human beings who deserve the same advantages as we have.

FARE's AGM was being held in the Tenants Association's hall. I looked outside at the flat next door where the close was piled with flowers where a teenager had been stabbed to death. A car drives by containing drug dealers looking for customers. Kids play the street. The AGM is crowded with residents, nearly all on low incomes. They include teenagers, one of whom is voted on to the committee. They are not an underclass. They are mainly decent people concerned to improve life for their families, for young people. Voluntary bodies like FARE have a part to play. But that is not sufficient. We must all strive for a more just society to improve the lot of the young people of the inner cities and estates of places like Glasgow and Newcastle.

Bob Holman is a Visiting Fellow in the Department of Social Policy at Manchester University and is a neighbourhood worker on the Easterhouse Estate, Glasgow

Notes

1 This is an unedited text of a prepared speech given at the YMCA's 150th Anniversary Lecture, Newcastle University, Oct 13, 1994. Reproduced by the kind permission of the author.

References

- Edinburgh Centre for Social Welfare Research (1991), *Excluding Youth*.
George V. & I. Howards (1991), *Poverty Amidst Affluence*, Elgar.
Green D. and A. Heath (1992) in D. Smith(ed), *Understanding the Underclass*, PSI.
Holman B., (1993) *A New Deal for Social Welfare*, Lion.
Hutton W., (1992) *The Guardian*, 24th February.
Mann K., (1992) *The Making of an English Underclass*, OUP.
Millar J., (1993) in A. Sinfield(ed), *Poverty, Inequality & Justice*, Edinburgh University.
Murray C., (1990) *The Emerging British Underclass*, IEA.

the DEPART
design and print
Corporate Image
Promotional Material
Business Stationery
Advertisements
Newsletters
Journals
DEPART
DEPART

The Art Department
1 Pink Lane · Newcastle upon Tyne · NE1 5DW
Telephone Number: (091) 230 4164 · Fax Number: (091) 222 1235

WORKING SPACE

SHORT SHARP KENYAN SAFARI

PHILIP ROYCROFT

When Lord Fraser announced a £1m scheme to reduce juvenile crime in Scotland earlier this year, he outlined the general thrust of this initiative as lying somewhere between two undesirable and apparently opposing approaches:

- Certainly not of the short sharp shock variety.
- This will be no soft option. There will be no safaris to Kenya.

Although the government has dropped the term 'short, sharp, shock', it has provided a very useful and emotive label with which opponents can identify and discredit the government's apparent enthusiasm for punishment. The building of new high security units to lock up even younger children is the latest evidence that this is still the government's preferred option in England and Wales, despite advance evidence that it will not work. These brutal and expensive regimes do not reduce crime, they do not stop youngsters from reoffending, and they are substantially more expensive than the majority of alternatives. This policy seems based on the bleakest of assumptions:

- Young people who offend are inherently evil
- Locking them up will protect the community
- The more severe the punishment the greater the deterrent
- Punishment is more effective than encouragement
- Nothing works anyway

On the other hand 'Kenyan safaris' has recently provided punishment enthusiasts with an equally emotive label with which to attach the child centred approach, or soft option, depending on your point of view. I suspect that we are now stuck with this image, and that we will have to come to terms with the implications of living in the post 'Kenyan safari era'! As someone who has not yet been on a Kenyan safari, but who has devoted a hunk of his life to promoting active learning approaches, I have a particular interest in what this might mean for me.

I can't even remember now which tabloid first blew the whistle on Bryn Melyn, the Welsh centre who send 'hooligans' on alpine skiing holidays and Kenyan safaris, paid for by you and I, the long suffering tax payer! The story understandably triggered strong public reaction and resentment.

The majority of young people involved in criminal activity do so as part of an adolescent culture, an inappropriate and damaging rite of passage into adulthood. This is an adventurous delinquent phase which on the whole they will leave behind in their early twenties. The further down the road we take them towards secure custody during these formative years, the more likely they are to take on a criminal identity in adult life. When you combine emotional deprivation, with physical iso-

lation, purposeless activity, and constant negative reinforcement, then it's not surprising that we end up with disturbed, angry and unpredictable individuals. Clear evidence of this can be seen in the alarmingly high incidents of suicides and violence to self and others within secure units, and back in the community on their release. As a baby's early life is hopefully shaped by the reflected love in its parent's eyes, so it is with young people entering adult life. They learn how to be an adult during this time, often adopting the attitudes and actions of those around them. This is the way in which they enter adult life. It is not surprising therefore that 80% of those who leave these institutions will re-offend within 2 years.

The term 'Kenyan safari' highlights the dilemma which those who are involved with alternative programmes face. They must balance the needs of these adolescents to find positive routes into adulthood, with the more immediate and legitimate concerns of their victims, that justice is seen to be done. In trying to help a young person find a positive route, the first step is to build trust and rapport with a responsible adult(s), often within a group environment. Channelling their creativity, and quest for adventure through recreational or adventurous activity is a popular means of building trust. When you consider the levels of unemployment, increasing poverty, and the decline in services within these communities, it is easy to understand why others are resentful. Those who break the windows and get caught, appear to receive the treats and attention denied those whose windows were broken. We should not be surprised that there is popular support for fairly brutal forms of punishment fuelled by resentment and anger. Punishment is back on the agenda as a means of teaching youngsters the difference between right and wrong! But what is the scale of the problem? How bad are these youngsters?

What ever happened to Dobermans and Pit-bull Terriers? Last year they were roaming the streets eating children. Have the dogs reformed? If Pit-bull Terriers can be turned around so effectively within a year then we need to apply a bit of this knowledge to the problem of our feral youngsters. As you have probably guessed, attacks by dogs have not changed dramatically since it was big news. The first lesson that we should apply is caution. Maybe young people are not any more evil than we were at their age. Perhaps the incidents which have hit the headlines reflect a wider malaise, rather than a new epidemic amongst our children. In Scotland for example incidents of reported crime declined by 8% last year. Perhaps this focus on young hooligans is a distraction, and that the sense of frustration and anger expressed about juvenile crime is symptomatic of a deeper and more widespread sense of social injustice. We shouldn't lose sight of the fact that young people are growing up in the communities of our making. If they lack direction and hope then we must accept some responsibility for not providing the necessary leadership and vision.

The advantage of locking people up is that we don't need their co-operation to do it, their views and opinions are of no consequence, we don't require them to exercise choice, and trust is not a factor. However it is also unrealistic to expect them to reconsider their attitudes and behaviour, and make positive changes, they will simply not be receptive. As any good educator would tell you co-operation, respect, creativity, challenge, choice and trust are needed to create a genuine learning environment. You can't teach young adults until they want to learn. Once

that want is there then the commitment will follow. Programmes which incorporate an element of adventurous activity have the potential to bring all of these ingredients together within a dynamic framework. They can engage young people at a number of levels, providing them with genuine opportunities to take responsibility, exercise choice, value their own creativity, rely on others, and experience success. They provide a safe environment within which to experiment, to take risks, and develop their individuality. A safari in Kenya might well look like a soft option from the outside. For the young person who planned and prepared this adventure, who made the commitment, accepted the discipline involved, and risked succeeding, it was a challenge. For the key worker who was there unsupported, for six weeks, 24 hours a day, this too was no soft option.

There is little doubt that these programmes can effect significant change to an individual's self-perception and behaviour in the short term, or within the context of the programme itself. The greatest difficulties lie in transferring that learning back to their community or family. A programme is only as good as the quality of the connections which the young people make between what they have experienced within the programme, and the reality of their lives.

There is nothing wrong with the rationale behind Bryn Melyn, my criticism is over their naiveté in choosing such glamorous activities, which fail to take into account the feelings of the victims, and concerns about the difficulties which young people experience in transferring the lessons they learned on safari, to the reality of street life. A note of caution therefore for those who are planning to base their alternative to custody projects on the Mediterranean or the Caribbean. Lord Fraser's latest alternative programme is run by the 'Airborne Initiative', staffed by ex-military instructors, and includes a 500 mile expedition across the Highlands of Scotland, where the midges and rain provide politically acceptable levels of discomfort!

Philip Roycroft works for Endeavour Scotland.

ADVERTISING RATES AND DATA

CIRCULATION

Youth & Policy is issued quarterly. It has a circulation of 1,000 not only throughout the United Kingdom and Europe, but also as far afield as the USA and Australia. Many academics and professionals subscribe to what has proven to be a valuable contribution to those involved in various forms of youth study and youth work.

RATES

Advertisements (where finished artwork is supplied)

Full Page £160

Half Page (landscape only) £80

Inserts Price negotiable

Where other journals wish to place advertisements or inserts in Youth and Policy, we would be open to negotiation.

MECHANICAL DATA

Full Page 113mm wide x 182mm deep

Half Page 113mm wide x 89mm deep

COPY REQUIREMENTS

Artwork format: Bromide/PMT

Screen: 133dpi

Advertisements can also be generated by our graphics department. We require a bromide or PMT of your logo, any other logos, photographs and copy you wish to be included in your display. Please specify typeface where exact match is needed. Price subject to examination of copy.

FURTHER DETAILS PLEASE CONTACT

Judith Cocker (Promotions)

Youth & Policy

10 Lady Beatrice Terrace

New Herrington

Houghton le Spring

DH4 4NE, England

IN THIS ISSUE

Louise Hurley and David Treacy

Models of Youth Work: A Sociological Framework

Irish Youth Work Press 1993

ISBN 0-9522207-0-9

IR£7.50 (pbk)

pp 70 + iii

Ann Hagell and Tim Newburn

'Persistent Young Offenders'

Policy Studies Institute

ISBN 0-85374-6133

£15

pp 136

Carol Lupton and Terry Gillespie (editors)

Working With Violence

Macmillan 1994

ISBN 0-333-56743-9

ISBN 0-333-56744-7

pp 222

Priscilla Alderson

Children's Consent To Surgery

Open University Press, 1993

ISBN 0-335-157327 (pbk)

ISBN 0-335-157333-5 (hbk)

£37.50 (hbk)

£12.99 (pbk)

Harry Hendrick

Child Welfare: England 1872-1989

Routledge 1994

ISBN 0-415-00773-9

£45 (hbk)

pp 354

James McCormick

Citizens' Service

The Commission on Social Justice: Institute for Public Policy

Research 1994

ISBN 1-872-452-87-6

£2.95 (pbk)

pp 29

Graham Crow and Graham Allan

Community Life: An Introduction To Local Social Relations

Harvester Wheatsheaf 1994

ISBN 0-7450-1198-5

£12.95 (pbk)

pp 229

Susan Moore and Doreen Rosenthal

Sexuality in Adolescence

Routledge 1993

ISBN 0-415-07527-0

0-415-07528-9

£35.00 (hbk)

£12.99 (pbk)

Jim Hyland

Yesterday's Answers:

Development And Decline Of Schools For Young Offenders

Whiting & Birch Ltd 1993

ISBN 1-871177-43X

£39.95 (hbk)

£18.95 (pbk)

pp 206

Edited by Gerald R Adams, Thomas P Gullotta & Raymond Montemayor

Adolescent Identity Formation

Volume 4 of Annual Book Series:

Advances in Adolescent Development

Sage 1992

David Moore

The Lads In Action: Social Process In An Urban Youth Subculture

Arena/Ashgate Publishing Ltd 1994

ISBN 1-85-74-22031

£29.50 (hbk)

ISBN 1-8572-2044

£12.95 (pbk)

pp 161 + xiii

Nicholas Saunders

E for Ecstasy

Published by Nicholas Saunders, 14 Neals Yard, London, WC2H 9DP 1993

ISBN 0-9501628-8-4

£7.95

pp 320

Louise Hurley and David Treacy

Models of Youth Work: A Sociological Framework

Irish Youth Work Press 1993

ISBN 0-9522207-0-9

IR£7.50 (pbk)

pp 70 + iii

ANDREW WEST

This is not a 'how to do it' but a 'how to think about it text'. It follows a tradition of papers and books on social work theory and practice in utilising a framework derived from the work of Burrell and Morgan (1979). The surprising thing is that such an attempt has not been tried or published before. But also surprising is that Hurley and Treacy make no reference, in text or bibliography, to their social work counterparts such as Howe (1987), Whittington and Holland (1985) or Leonard (1975). It may not be necessary to make such reference, but it would make for wider discussion of key underlying notions common to both areas of practice, concerning values of life and society, and suggest bases for differences in practice or aims/outcomes.

The paper opens with a brief introduction to the notion of education and youth work (see below) and to Burrell and Morgan's framework and the sociologies of radical change and regulation. The authors then devote a section to each of the four paradigms - Functionalist; Interpretive; Radical Humanist; Radical Structuralist. These paradigms are linked to four models of youth work, characterised as (in related sequence) - Character Building; Personal Development; Critical Social Education; Radical Social Change. Within each section they consider a Review of Theory; Assumptions about Society; Application to Youth Work; Characteristics of the Model including programme, emphasis, roles and outcomes; a chart illustrating the points made (these charts are combined to make a single full page summary at the end). The sections devote more space to the first part (theory and assumptions) than to practice process and outcomes and this can be seen as problematic in relation to the paucity of literature on youth work theory, and the limited literature used by the authors. The paper follows its subtitle, focusing clearly on framework of theory to the exclusion of debate and discussion of youth work practice to further illustrate and analyse the paradigms. The problem with such a framework, useful though it is conceptually, is its potential for rigidity and the implication that theories and practices are mutually exclusive and cannot and do not overlap. This is of importance here. The four models which are related to the paradigms are very briefly described when relating them to theory which is a weakness when compared to the well-referenced section of theory and sociology. There is clearly a need for more publication of description and analysis of practice on which to draw. For whilst the models outlined may correspond to notional ideas and experiences/observations of practice, they need to be rooted. The lack of literature prevents laying out

the practice and then organising it into a framework of models (which would almost certainly overlap and mix in various ways).

That said, the discussions are generally interesting and stimulating. The sections on Critical Social Education and Radical Social Change certainly overlap, as the authors acknowledge. The first draws especially on the work of Freire and Willis, the second considers Marxist theorists in the context of reproduction and ideology. This last paradigm has a rather baldly stated outcome of 'a society where institutions will be overthrown and replaced' (p57): it is interesting to contrast this with that of Howe's implicit statement (of aim) of the redistribution of wealth and power (1979: 151), which, it is suggested, requires the abolition of the capitalist system. These words (and ideas) are little heard in the 1990s, where the language of opposition has changed considerably.

Perhaps linked to this point is the bibliography which contains few works except (unpublished) Masters theses and Smith 1988, published after 1982/3. This is a pity. Although written in an Irish context (largely only the Introduction), the work has far wider applicability as does literature published elsewhere. Although Smith's 1988 work is listed, its critique of social education has not been used, nor its suggestion of the need for clear meanings required for social education, informal education and so on. These definitions and discussion would be valuable in the early section on 'Learning in the Youth Work Context' where the authors briefly develop three categories of Formal, Non-formal and Informal education.

A further suprising omission is any direct consideration on structural inequalities particularly gender, race, (dis)ability, sexuality. This would have been especially useful within each section on the application of the paradigm to youth work practice.

Basically, the problem is that the work is too short. It is not a book but of A4 stapled format, with the appearance of good, basic DTP work. However, several typos remain, as do references to men/man (as opposed to human, her/him): whilst most of these are in quotations from other works, some comment (even, for example, [sic]) is required, especially to those taken from recent theses. The lack of attention to gender gives it a dated appearance.

The framework overall provides a useful introduction to thinking about youth work, an activity sadly underdone as has been noted elsewhere by others, and this in itself means the work is stimulating. This text may be most used by students on courses, but should be used elsewhere to help introduce the association of values and practice and societal outcomes. To do this it need to be accessible: for the newcomer the theoretical overviews need to be tempered by more description, discussion and analysis of practice. This is the old conundrum of accessibility and the balance of theory and practice. It is unfair to criticise this text harshly, for it is clearly not intended as anything but a framework, although it does need a proper summary/conclusion. The paper deserves reading, circulation and discussion.

Andrew West is Research and Development Officer for Save the Children Fund in Humberside.

References

- Burrell, G. and G. Morgan (1979) *Sociological Paradigms and Organisational Analysis* London: Heineman
- Howe, D. (1987) *An Introduction to Social Work Theory* Aldershot: Wildwood House
- Leonard, P. (1975) 'Explanation and Education in Social Work' *British Journal of Social Work* 5 (3)
- Smith, M. (1988) *Developing Youth Work* Milton Keynes: Open University Press
- Whittington, C. and R. Holland (1985) 'A Framework for Theory in Social Work' *Issues in Social Work Education* 5 (1)

Ann Hagell and Tim Newburn

'Persistent Young Offenders'

Policy Studies Institute

ISBN 0-85374-6133

£15

pp 136

STEVE ROGOWSI

The early 1990s have seen an increased debate about the possible existence of a small number of young offenders who, because of their persistent involvement in criminal activities, account for a large proportion of offences committed by this age group. Concern is also expressed that the police and courts have great difficulty in dealing effectively with these offenders. It is in this context that Hagell and Newburn report on a research study of persistent young offending commissioned by the Home Office Research and Planning Unit. It is a concise, readable book which provides a timely antidote to the more rabid ranting of the Tory press and politicians.

The research looks at a sample of over 500 young offenders who were arrested three times or more during 1992 in two police force areas (a midlands county and London Borough). The study had three main aims: to provide a reliable estimate of the number of young offenders who offended frequently, the number and type of offences accounted for by this group, and to define persistent offending; to examine the functioning of the criminal justice system in relation to these offenders, together with their experience of the system; and to examine the background of these offenders, their criminal histories, families, educational experiences, contacts with welfare agencies and drug use. A central issue is the nature and definition of 'persistence'.

The book is divided into four parts. Part one provides a background covering young offenders and the criminal justice system, the method of

research, and the sample of young offenders. Part two is entitled 'Youth Reoffenders and the Criminal Justice System' and covers patterns of arrest and offending of the sample along with, for example, use of sanctions. Part three asks (and answers!) if there is such a thing as 'persistent young offenders'. General themes and an overall summary are found in part four.

Chapter one gives a succinct history of juvenile justice, in particular the two approaches of welfare and punishment (or justice as it used to be called by some social workers during the 1980s). The former involves helping and supporting young people who offend, while the latter involves a determination to ensure that those who continually offend receive punishment that makes it clear their behaviour is intolerable. Punishment is obviously to the fore at present, witness the proposals for secure training centres despite all the evidence which shows incarceration does not work. It is also inhumane and very expensive.

Chapters four to seven are concerned with providing basic information about the backgrounds, patterns of arrest, official convictions and offence types of the young people in the sample. As the authors state this kind of information is lacking on young people 'who have been arrested repeatedly', and as such this provides interesting reading.

However, it is chapter eight 'The Issue of Persistence' which, for me, is the central point of the book. The 500 plus sample are referred to as 'young reoffenders' and they are at the heavy end of juvenile offending. This distinguishes them from what is believed to be a smaller group, 'persistent offenders', whose offending is believed to be significantly more frequent than the majority of reoffenders. If only we could identify persistent young offenders then lock them up or 'take them out of circulation', the argument goes, then there would be a significant drop in crime. The key question is can such a group of persistent offenders be identified within Hagell and Newburn's sample? They look at three definitions of 'persistence' (p 99) based on frequency of offending in one year, frequency of offending in a three month period and the possible new secure training order criteria (children aged 12-14 who commit three or more imprisonable offences, one of which must have been committed whilst subject to a supervision order, and where the offence under consideration must be serious enough to warrant a secure training order). In applying these definitions to their sample they highlight a number of difficulties with the proposed policy in relation to persistent young offenders. Firstly, no two definitions of persistence will lead to the identification of exactly the same individuals. Secondly, the fact that a discreet group of persistent offenders cannot be identified in this manner suggests that any definition of persistence will tend to be arbitrary. Thirdly, the sentencing of juveniles on the basis of a definition of persistence will therefore involve a degree of inequity. And finally, provision for persistent offenders is likely to be targeted inefficiently. It must also be emphasised that the 'persistent offenders' in this sample, whichever definition is used, are not strikingly different from the full sample.

Another point to note is that concern about 'persistent offenders' is not new as, for example, there have been several occasions during the last century when committees of inquiry have been formed to consider how best to respond to the perceived existence of a small group of offenders who offend on a more frequent basis than the vast majority. The eventual responses adopted always alternate between welfare and punishment. Perhaps, as crime and delinquency are linked to the structural inequalities in society, it is these inequalities that must be addressed, but that needs another book.

Overall then, 'Persistent Young Offenders' is a welcome book and should be read by all those interested in young offenders and how to deal with them.

Steve Rogowski *Social Worker (Children and Families) with a local authority in the North West of England*

Carol Lupton and Terry Gillespie (editors)

Working With Violence

Macmillan 1994

ISBN 0-333-56743-9

ISBN 0-333-56744-7

pp 222

JANET BATSLER

This book draws together a very useful collection of essays which reflect on the practical experiences of workers and organisations involved in the movement against violence against women, a movement which emerged over twenty years ago in the context of the Women's Liberation Movement. All of the writers testify to this political point of origin by referring to the principles of feminist and/or woman-centred practice throughout.

Twenty years is a long period of time to reflect on and to grow up in and these essays clearly reflect a good deal of organisational and practical experience. In particular, the essays reflect the complex professional and policy negotiations which the attempt to offer real support to women survivors of sexual violence entails. Feminist practice is shown to be clearly concerned with the role of language in problem definition and policy intervention, and with an address to power relationships, particularly those between men and women. There is less attention than might have been expected to the question of how women are positioned in relation to other power systems such as those of class and race: a point I will return to later.

The early chapters by Terry Gillespie, Marianne Foley and Carol Lupton focus attention on the experiences of the major feminist organisational initiatives of the last twenty years - Rape Crisis Centres and Women's Aid - and on police and social work responses to them, specifically in the form of Victim Support Services and the Sexual Assault Referral Centre initiatives.

The complex interweaving of a successful feminist agenda and the Conservative Government's restructuring of welfare provision is very evident here. The feminist success has been in the insistence that rape and wife assault are public issues not private troubles, to be taken seriously by the courts, by police and by social workers. The Conservative restructuring of welfare has led to an increased reliance on voluntary sector provision of all kinds - and here, the feminist voluntary sector is at risk of being marginalised by non-feminist initiatives, on the very terrain which feminism created. The impact of replacing political analyses with professional definitions of the problem, of unwieldy democratic forms of organising by a managerial culture, of the increasing competition for funding: all of these are touched on in these chapters.

Kish Bhatti Sinclair's chapter on 'Asian Women and Violence from Male Partners' usefully focuses attention on white racism in service provision within both statutory and voluntary services, and by focussing attention on specific case studies, highlights the seriousness of the neglect of women's interests caused by such racism. It is a pity that this theme is scarcely touched on elsewhere in the book.

Further chapters deal with social work with mothers whose children have been sexually abused; with prostitution and the state; with work with men who abuse women and children; with violence against social services staff; and with the questions raised in work with violent women. In each case, it is clear that a feminist perspective highlights and clarifies the focus of the work and can continue to give voice to problems that as yet have no names. So, Claudia Bernard's chapter on social work with mothers whose children have been sexually abused enables a close and honest attention to the needs of both women and children who have different kinds of relationships to the man who has abused. She breaks out of the family therapy model, with its in built tendency to blame the mother, and allows us to take a fresh look at the detailed practice of support. Stella Perrot's chapter on working with perpetrators highlights the dilemmas for a progressive anti-sexist practice with men in a period in which unthinking condemnation is recommended as penal policy by Government, and community-based educational initiatives are promoted by the Probation Service. Both Marianne Hester and Joan Orme highlight areas of work which have had little attention and in which attention to the workings of gender will allow a more accurate story to be told.

Maggie O'Neill's essay on 'Prostitution and the State: Towards A Feminist Practice' is outstanding in offering both a detailed account of a feminist model for intervention in working alongside the whores movement and an

analysis of the masculinist State which gives proper weight to the nature and force of feminist challenge to existing social relations. It is a difficult task for those of us involved in feminist social work or community work interventions to both attend to the needs of women in the here and now and work strategically for social transformation. The danger highlighted by this book, which should find a place on all initial training courses, is that the restructuring of the welfare sector will return feminism to philanthropy and 'rescue work' and that political education and organising on the question of working with violence will become secondary.

It seems likely that the book was compiled before the success of the recent 'Zero Tolerance' campaign. It would be good to see the work undertaken in this book developed to give us accounts of campaigning and educational initiatives with a community work focus. It is also in this context absolutely necessary that we continue to develop feminist analyses which consider the complexities of women's position in relation to violence, so that the interrelationship between sexism and all other aspects of oppression is clearly identified and understood. Joan Orme's chapter on 'violent women' does begin to open up this question and is useful in locating possible ways of understanding women's violence as resistance to prolonged oppression. That women's violence may sometimes for some women be a means of sustaining privilege is a possibility which will also need to be explored.

Janet Batsleer is Senior Lecturer in the Department of Applied Community Studies at Manchester Metropolitan University.

Priscilla Alderson

Children's Consent To Surgery

Open University Press, 1993

ISBN 0-335-157327 (pbk)

ISBN 0-335-157333-5 (hbk)

£37.50 (hbk)

£12.99 (pbk)

JUDITH HOLMES

For her research into the subject of children's consent to surgery Priscilla Alderson interviewed 120 children aged between 8 and 15 in three hospitals in London and one in Liverpool. In order to study school age children she chose to look at those admitted for orthopaedic surgery.

Many of the children had congenital malformations which interfered with their growth or development. On average the children interviewed

had already had five operations and frequent stays in hospital. Eight of them had been admitted more than twenty times. Of the hoped-for benefits of surgery 81% of children and 87% of parents hoped for improved mobility and 82% of children and 84% of parents hoped for relief of pain. Alderson emphasizes that she did not probe too deeply in her interviews as there were no resources to help people to recover from intrusive interviewing and the feelings that can be stirred up.

Much of the book consists of verbatim accounts of interviews with children, their parents and health professionals from surgeons to play specialists. This is often moving as the children describe their hopes, fears and past experience of often painful surgery. Alderson also discusses children's human and legal rights and their competence to give consent. She contrasts orthopaedic practice in other European countries. There is a lengthy review of research about children, including research on consent.

Unfortunately much of the discussion of these issues is buried in the accounts of the interviews, making it difficult to follow. Alderson acknowledges that drafts of the book were criticized as piecemeal and anecdotal. There are no clear answers as the children's responses varied widely and some who had endured months of painful treatment were anxious to continue while others were equally certain that they would not have agreed to treatment if they had been more aware of what was involved. Medical and nursing staff gave differing responses to questions about children's competence to consent to surgery, as did the children and their families.

An important issue raised in this book is the question of whether surgery should be performed just because it is possible. 'Normality' to a disabled child may be more to do with being able to behave like other children than with looking like them. A child who was forced to use callipers to walk instead of using her wheelchair became lonely and frustrated, adding social isolation to her disability. Alderson mentions the possibility that some have surgery hoping that it will also cure their loneliness or failure and then find that the reasons for the loneliness go deeper than the defect. The support given to children and their families in making such serious decisions is not always as good as it could or should be. A clear difference was found in the standard of care where the approach was paediatric rather than orthopaedic. Paediatric-orientated nurses encourage children and their parents to understand their treatment and to take part in it, whereas in the traditional orthopaedic approach the nurses take charge and carry out the treatment themselves.

Having begun her research with an expectation that children might be able to give consent at about 10 to 12 years Alderson found a 'range of experience, ability, the desire to make or share in making or to delegate decisions in school-age children' which she had not expected to find. She found that competence develops in response to experience and reasonably high expectations, rather than gradually over time through ages or stages. She finds Piaget's, Kohlberg's and Erikson's assumptions inap-

appropriate - 'traditional beliefs have to be re-examined if children's abilities are to be appreciated'. As she comments, 'research on children only began seriously in the twentieth century ... it seems that research with children has hardly begun'.

This book contains many useful insights into children's attitudes to pain and disability as well as their views on their own competence to give consent to surgery. Most had a high level of understanding of their condition and what their treatment would involve. Sadly some surgeons and nursing staff still take an authoritarian, paternalistic approach believing that an extensive knowledge of anatomy is necessary to follow any explanation of proposed surgery.

The research for this book was undertaken before the Children Act, 1989 came into effect although its provisions are taken into account. On children as witnesses Alderson writes 'The law has contributed to the understanding of children's consent by commissioning research into children as witnesses in court. Their ability to recall and recount events under stress, and to distinguish reality from fantasy, has been investigated. Researchers have also examined egocentricity as a moral and cognitive weakness in child witnesses. Some researchers conclude that the real danger of egocentrism may be that of the interviewing adult who is unable to appreciate the child's view'. She contrast the views of Lord Justice Scarman that certain children are mature and competent with that of Lord Justice Donaldson that children differ fundamentally from adults. She reasons that 'what you find depends partly on what you are looking for'.

This book provides useful material for all those with an interest in promoting children's welfare, especially children in hospital. It is to be hoped that it will not only be widely read but acted upon. It is sad to note Alderson's comment 'Despite our experience, we had not anticipated the amount of suffering which the children were expected to accept - or consent to'. However, she notes that good practice benefits children and this should become the benchmark by which all treatment of children is judged.

Judith Holmes University of Northumbria

Harry Hendrick
Child Welfare: England 1872-1989
Routledge 1994
ISBN 0-415-00773-9
£45 (hbk)
pp 354

TONY JEFFS

REVIEWS

Little over 100 years ago William Booth, founder of the Salvation Army, wrote 'Incest is so familiar as hardly to call for remark'. Around the same time 63% of all homicides were of infants under a year old. Hendrick pertinently reminds us there has never been a 'golden age of childhood' and most certainly any search for it need never overduly linger in the vicinity of the nineteenth century. This is not a text which lends support to those politicians and commentators yearning for a return to Victorian values. The portrait offered of that period is grim and frightening. It serves as a valuable reminder of why reformers demanded state intervention in the private realm of family life, control over the practices of employers, adoption, institutional care and the management of schools. Hendrick rarely mentions the contribution of early youth workers or youth organisations but does provide a rewarding insight into what motivated them and shaped their thinking.

This book offers a detailed history of that branch of social policy which was, and still is at times, collectively referred to as 'child welfare'. It is an untidy rag-bag of services catering for the needs of pre-school children, children in employment, those at risk of abuse and exploitation, the hungry and ill-clothed, the disabled and handicapped, the delinquent and truant. However well-intentioned and scholarly any attempt to provide an historical overview of the development of such provision is likely to end up as confusing, even disjointed. So it says a great deal about the craft of the author that this text is both readable and coherent. Without ever losing sight of the need to chart the changing interpretation of the very concept of childhood during the period covered he offers a guide to the emergence and implementation of policy. The book is full of wonderful segments recounting the struggle to develop a particular service or the emergence of a campaign or policy. 'Hidden histories' are given an airing and often provide a fresh perspective on both an era and field of policy. These also frequently illustrate the extent to which inter-linked networks of reformers have shaped, even at times managed, policy. One particularly delightful by-way is the account provided of the origins of the Child Guidance movement. The book is not, it must be stressed, a simplistic account of the forward march of welfarism and child savers. We are shown the problematic nature of state involvement in the closed world of the family and the extent to which policy has been orientated towards a desire to control children, especially working class children.

However narratives are lost along the way. For example accounts of early policies designed to cater for the blind, the deaf and the 'feeble-

minded' are not matched by a discussion of post-war provision in the sector - Warnock and the 1981 Act are barely mentioned. In a similar fashion we are told about the rise of the school meals service but are given little account of how it has been dismantled. Likewise the changing welfare role of schools is overlooked. The prime state agency for over a century involved in the care and control of young people has been the school. No account of child welfare can ignore the extent to which schools have been involved in child welfare and in particular how many have sought to extend their welfare role. Yet schools and educational services post-1945 are largely overlooked. Social policy as a discipline has long tried to ignore schools. Social policy journals and conferences display similar inclination to avoid discussing educational policy apart from pre-school provision and post-school training. This book is no different from the majority but that is hardly an adequate excuse for offering a partial account of child welfare. Hendrick is probably correct in his summary statement that 'Much of the history of social policy... is in fact the history of the imposition of adult will upon children's bodies' (p.2). Nowhere has this been more observable than the school sector both in terms of those of the institutions and the relentless push towards extending the length of compulsory education and training. It is, therefore, regrettable that the interpretation of child welfare policy has been compressed to by-pass post-war educational policy and changing welfare practices of schools.

As the book progresses it becomes more and more a history of discrete services, juvenile justice, child protection and child health and less and less an account of child welfare. I have few problems with this except a lingering sense that here is a text falling between a number of stalls. Of witnessing an opportunity missed by focussing the account of those services. On the one hand perhaps given the scale of the enterprise this was the only way it could be translated into a manageable task. Identifying gaps is not the way in which I would wish to conclude the review. Hendrick has provided us with a book to be appreciated and savoured, one offering students and the general reader a shrewd and intelligent overview of child welfare policy. Here is a standard text, one unlikely to be bettered for a long time.

Tony Jeffs teaches at the University of Northumbria

James McCormick

Citizens' Service

The Commission on Social Justice Institute for Public Policy

Research 1994

ISBN 1-872-452-87-6

£2.95 (pbk)

pp 29

TONY JEFFS

The Commission on Social Justice was established in 1992, they inform us, 'at the instigation of John Smith', the Labour leader. Here was an attempt at hands-off policy formation by a Party terrified of promising anything for fear of offending someone somewhere. Chaired by Gordon Borie it recruited 16 of the great and the good, not all Labour members. This is one of a series of policy documents they have sponsored. So what 'do the brains of the Left' (as the IPPR modestly tell us in their publicity they have been described) have to offer?

This pamphlet advocates the introduction of voluntary non-military community service of three months duration. The aims of the programme are to:

- (a) provide education for citizenship, each programme containing a core educational module teaching social skills and social cohesion. This would build upon a compulsory Citizens' Learning Module to be added to the National Curriculum.
- (b) break down social barriers by involving people from different backgrounds.
- (c) encourage citizen involvement in public service

McCormick stresses it would be open to all but significantly adult involvement is couched in terms of them serving as project leaders or supervisors. Borrie in recommending the scheme unfortunately gives the game away by pointing out that.

Almost one million young adults between the ages of 16 and 24 are not in employment, nor are they training, nor are they studying. The costs of social exclusion for this group are all too obvious. Citizens' Service could give them and every other young adult a new stake in society. It could combine volunteer commitment with meeting community needs.

Strip away the humbug and what you have, again, is a scheme designed for young adults. Others may advocate compulsion but McCormick clearly prefers a voluntary scheme. He is far too intelligent to believe a compulsory programme would be anything but a nightmare to organise like the wartime compulsory registration of young people; and a formula for manufacturing a multitude of dissatisfied service recipients.

The programme suggested here offers a choice of 'service' setting - the community (a local authority, health authority, voluntary agency or char-

ity); environment (conservation work); international (a developing country); and security (police and emergency services). The remuneration offered the volunteer remains a matter of debate with the sum suggested ranging from £20 to £50 per week. In addition this scheme, like its American counterpart, advocates the awarding of educational credits to those who complete the programme. These could be cashed in to help pay-off college fees or a Student Loan. In the United States this has undoubtedly ensured the excess of demand over supply for the Clinton scheme launched in 1993. Too much should not be read into this 'popularity'. For as one student told me however bad this type of programme might be it just had to be better than MacDonald's ('the absolute pits'), her current part-time job washing-up and the prospect of paying-off a mounting overdraft over the coming years. She and others spoken to showed little enthusiasm for a scheme they viewed as a ploy by which their poverty would be exploited by the government rather than MacDonalds.

Presented as new policy initiative this is actually a re-tread. A tired old idea only recently touted around by Youth Call, a motley crew of voluntary service enthusiasts and right-wingers keen to put National Service back on the political agenda. They claimed a mass programme would virtually eliminate youth unemployment, drastically reduce youth crime, rescue the welfare state and resuscitate the Dunkirk spirit. This type of proposal seems to periodically surface notably during periods of high unemployment and concern about youth crime. It certainly has a long pedigree having probably been first advocated by the educationalist and philosopher Charles Fourier (1772-1837). He believed it would control 'the Little Hordes' (hooligans) and ensure unpleasant work would be undertaken without the need to create a stigmatized underclass.

It is difficult to predict whether a future government will follow Clinton and launch a similar programme here. David Blunkett has certainly hinted that a compulsory scheme could be part of a 'radical' response to mass unemployment. Voluntary or compulsory it is to be hoped that youth agencies will resist the bribes attached and the temptation to cooperate for short-term financial gain. It is fundamentally a bad idea.

First, because it is based on a deficit model of young people. No evidence exists that young people are less altruistic, more reluctant to be active citizens or more indifferent to the suffering of others than the rest of society. Indeed personal experience tells me the opposite is the case and that if any group would benefit from a dose of either voluntary or compulsory community service working in unpleasant settings it is the rich and powerful. Such a scheme will once again patronise the young and confirm the erroneous belief of many that they are 'different and inadequate'.

Second, it is nonsense to imagine that such a programme will help to break down social barriers. This crude assumption is akin to one which holds that foreign travel, sending the kids abroad, will erode chauvinism. Programmes like this will, if educational credits are offered or the remuneration is above the YTS level, disproportionately attract those from poor

backgrounds, whilst those under 18 and unemployed will feel they have no choice but to 'join up'. Certainly some from better-off backgrounds will 'give it a try' but the majority are no more likely to join than they are to seek low paid jobs in bars and nursing homes to gain an insight into the lives of the poor and world of low paid menial work. Sadly it will only serve as a distraction deflecting attention from the urgent need to address the problem of student debt (amongst a sizeable minority) and developing policies capable of providing worthwhile employment opportunities for those wishing to commence work at 16.

Third, it calls for yet more compulsion within the school curriculum thereby further restricting the right of young people to exercise some measure of control over what they learn.

Fourth, it will devalue certain types of work and therefore the contribution and social standing of those undertaking such work on a permanent basis.

Fifth, as with the late and largely unlamented Community Programme, it would create a culture of dependency amongst welfare, community and youth agencies. Many of these will again become reliant on a supply of cheap temporary labour and thus acquiring a stake in the perpetuation of high levels of youth unemployment and a disincentive to campaign for alternative economic and social policies.

Finally, in the current climate when Workfare is clearly on the political agenda, whichever party wins the next election, support for programmes such as this will inevitably be interpreted as de facto acceptance of the right of the state to make the poor work for their meagre benefits. It will again allow politicians and others to further retreat from their responsibility to seek and implement full-employment policies.

Citizens' Service is a policy of despair bereft of originality. Sadly if this is the best the 'brains of the Left' can come up with then we really are in trouble. Those involved in informal education with young people and the youth agencies it seems really must put on their own thinking caps and cease relying on others to come up with solutions.

Tony Jeffs teaches at the University of Northumbria

Graham Crow and Graham Allan

Community Life: An Introduction To Local Social Relations

Harvester Wheatsheaf 1994

ISBN 0-7450-1198-5

£12.95 (pbk)

pp 229

IAN MARTIN

Reading this book reminded of the time I worked in a traditional fishing community in the North East of Scotland. I once asked an elderly woman to explain something to me, only to get the response that she couldn't help because she was an 'incomer'. Apparently, she had come to live there with her parents at the age of two and had remained there throughout her life.

One of the key themes examined in this excellent book is that communities are 'active creations' and are to be understood as much in terms of exclusion and closure as inclusion and membership. Consequently, the most significant focus of attention is on the process of the construction of communities, which are often more real in symbolic than physical terms and on the boundaries which are erected both to keep some people in and others out. The sociological reality of community may therefore be far from the 'warm and persuasive' ideological construction against which Raymond Williams (1983) famously warned us in 'Keywords'.

It should be emphasised that this book is less an 'introduction to local social relations', as its subtitle states, than an introduction to research on local social relations. This, I think, limits its overall appeal to a wide and general readership while at the same time heightening its value to those with more specialist interests. For example, it should certainly be on the shelves (and in the lecture notes) of those teaching courses, at all academic levels, which are concerned with the ways in which the study of community life provides the vital mediation between micro and macro levels of analysis. As a source book, it fills an important gap in the literature - which helps to explain why Bell and Newby's 'Community Studies', originally published in 1971, has lasted well beyond its sell-by date. It should also be in the team/agency collections of all community workers and others who labour under the 'community' prefix in their work. It is worth noting, incidentally, that reference is made throughout to studies in Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland as well as England.

On the other hand, it is the kind of book to which I would refer students in a more selective way because it is essentially a fairly exhaustive - and only very occasionally slightly exhausting review of research, mainly conducted over the last 25 years. As such, it includes a useful account of the history of 'community studies' as a research method as well as the theoretical and ideological onslaught on it which led to its decline in the late 1960s and throughout the 1970s. As Abrams (1978) notes, however, 'the paradox of community is the coexistence of a body of theory which constantly predicts the collapse of community and a body of empirical studies which finds com-

munity alive and well'. The argument is convincingly made, particularly by reference to the burgeoning of locality and neighbourhood studies in the 1980s and 1990s, that we need this level of analysis if we are to understand the social and cultural impact of economic restructuring and recent social policy development. As 'the study of ordinary people's everyday lives in the full variety of contexts' (p 196), we cannot do without community studies - however problematic and contested this approach may be in methodological and conceptual terms.

Four particular features of the book are especially significant and, given the dearth of good literature in this field, to be warmly welcomed:

First, communities are treated as 'active creations' which develop within the possibilities and constraints of particular historical and material contexts. Central to the argument of the book is the dialectic between agency and structure. Indeed, a basic theme is that the 'intermediary structures' of community are the crucial catalyst of the 'sociological imagination', which C Wright Mills (1959) defines as the ability to make the necessary distinctions *and* connections between the 'personal troubles of milieu' and the 'public issues of structure'. In this way, the evasions of micro thinking, which makes sense of 'everything in particular and nothing in general', and the determinations of macro analysis, which make sense of 'everything in general and nothing in particular' (Dale 1989), are carefully and systematically avoided. In this respect, the contradictions of recent and current public policy are well observed - policy which destroys communities (plural) while at the same time investing the expectation of the 'care' of systematically stigmatised and traditionally excluded groups in an ideological (and largely mythical) construction of 'community' (singular).

As feminist commentators and researchers have consistently argued and evidenced, the privatisation implicitly in 'care in the community' means not only care *by* the community but also care in the family and home, ie unpaid care by women. This is just one example of the ways in which both policy and the wider processes of social and economic change have redrawn the boundaries between the public and private spheres. The second very important contribution of this account of 'community life' is the consistency with which the impact of socio-economic, political and cultural change is shown to be differentially experienced and borne in the daily lives of women and men. In this way, for example, the overwhelmingly male construction of the 'traditional working class community' is exposed and, at the same time, it is made clear why women so often continue to 'be in the community without being able to be full members of it' (p 129). Perhaps the single most striking achievement of this account is its demonstration of how the community level of analysis is needed to expose the gendered consequences of changes in employment structures and social policy, particularly in relation to housing.

Research shows that the general trend is clearly towards increasing economic inequality and social polarisation. The third particular strength of

this book is that it shows how in this socially regressive process class position is systematically mediated not only through gender but also through 'race'. Again, we need community studies to help us understand this and, simultaneously, to signal how, in the words of Paul Gilroy (1987), an alternative, popular construction of community has 'proved to be a potent symbol in the mobilisation of minority ethnic groups'.

The fourth reason for welcoming Community Life is implicit in what has already been said, but it should perhaps be stated explicitly. The problematic of 'community' is honestly confronted throughout. Not only are communities examined as dynamic processes, 'happenings' rather than 'things' that reflect change as much as continuity, but they are also shown to be messy, ambivalent and contradictory - and consequently all the more real, and important, if difficult, to study.

My one reservation about this account is that no more than the occasional and somewhat oblique reference is made to the potential of community studies as a way of examining the significance of contemporary social movements within civil society as counter-hegemonic sites of defence, resistance and challenge. This is largely because the book is essentially a review of recent research, much of which has been primarily policy-related. On the other hand, it is also precisely the kind of source we need in order to rehabilitate and revitalise the community studies approach - and so, perhaps, to pave the way for a different, and more subversive, project.

Ian Martin is a Lecturer in Community Education at Moray House Institute of Education, Edinburgh.

References

- Abrams P (ed) (1978) *Work Urbanism and Inequality* Weidenfeld & Nicolson
- Bell C and Newby H (1971) *Community Studies: An introduction to the sociology of the local community* George Allen & Unwin
- Dale R (1989) *The State and Education Policy* Open University Press
- Gilroy P (1987) *There Ain't No Black in the Union Jack* Hutchinson
- Mills C Wright (1959) *The Sociological Imagination* Oxford University Press
- Williams R (1983) *Keywords* Fontana

Susan Moore and Doreen Rosenthal

Sexuality in Adolescence

Routledge 1993

ISBN 0-415-07527-0

0-415-07528-9

£35.00 (hbk)

£12.99 (pbk)

PAM CARTER

Part of a series bringing research findings to a broad audience interested in adolescent development, this particular book draws on studies from a range of disciplines. It depicts sexuality as constructed from physiological, psychological and social elements, and considers the interplay between these supposedly separate facets. The political context for this text, as for all other utterances regarding teenage sexuality, has become almost ludicrously fraught. Teenage pregnancy, sex education and knowledge, date rape and sexual abuse are the symbolic grounds on which a variety of social and political conflicts are acted out. The term moral panic is currently suffering a certain amount of over-exposure but is nevertheless entirely apposite.

In this context Moore and Rosenthal adopt the measured tones of expertise and evidence in presenting material on: gendered experiences of sexuality; gay and lesbian young people: sexual risks including AIDS, sexually transmitted diseases and pregnancy; as well as theoretical and methodological issues. The extent of their material is impressive, drawing on studies conducted in their own Australian context as well as in Britain, the US and New Zealand.

There is something for everyone here, carefully extracted pieces of information on all the familiar areas. Their aim has clearly been breadth rather than depth so that readers are likely to find at least a few references and ideas on whatever interests them. Most readers are unlikely to be challenged however if they have more than a basic grasp of their area. The book is neutral rather than provocative, objective rather than passionate. These are not necessarily damning criticisms; they are presumably qualities expected within editorial policy for the series. But there are dangers. The most important one is inherent within the series as a whole - that of studying young people as a distinct and separate species. Although these authors question the extent to which adolescence is a meaningful category the overall style is of dispassionate science with all of its limitations. Their own commitment to young people's needs and interests filters through at times but this is mostly suppressed in an effort to stick strictly with the evidence. And since findings presented arise mainly from behavioural studies rather than analyses of social structures and dominant ideologies, the dynamic is one of a mature 'us' studying a different 'them'.

Nowhere is this tendency shown more clearly than in the chapter on 'Gay and Lesbian Adolescence' written by Mark Goggin. This chapter begins with a recognition of homosexuality as a socially constructed category and expresses strong suspicion of scientific explanations sought in the past in order to find 'cures'. But there is no recognition that central to the construction of this cate-

gory is the need to shore up the shaky category of heterosexuality. Goggin's starting point is the all too familiar question, 'what explains the development of homosexuality?', answers to which are sought within individual development. Although his stance on this is a liberal one (he is against homophobia) his fundamental assumption in seeking this kind of explanation is that we are dealing with some kind of deviation from an unexamined normal state. This leads him to endorse biological explanations for homosexuality and to offer as likely truths the findings of research considered dubious by many of those active in the gay and lesbian studies field¹. One of the main arguments he deploys to defend the biological roots of homosexuality is the equation as he describes it between 'gender nonconformity and adult homosexuality'; in other words gays and lesbians are likely to be different from their heterosexual counterparts through deviating from gendered norms in all sorts of ways - they really are different. The notion that gender itself is socially constructed and operates, to an extent, as a means of social control appears to have escaped him. Conformity to gendered expectations is demonstrated in the rest of this book as pretty undesirable. Because Goggin adopts this position he confirms all sorts of stereotypes: gay men who hated sport but liked dolls and role playing females in childhood; and lesbians who were always tomboys and felt masculine. Being lesbian or gay does produce a sharper awareness of the controlling effects of gender stereotyping and of the performance element in being male or female. Lesbians and gays are more likely to play around with gendered norms because their constructed nature has become so obvious to them. But that doesn't mean that everyone else is happily conforming to a naturally occurring set of gendered behaviours.

Biology, then, is accorded an especially central position within Goggin's chapter on lesbian and gay young people. But the remainder of the text also displays uncertainty about how to treat biology. One of the early chapters is devoted to 'biological aspects' followed by one on 'social influences'. Seeing the biological and the social as separate strands, the biological coming before the social, suggest perhaps a false dichotomy between the two. Recent work on the sociology of the body argues that it is more appropriate to see the body as 'always already' social in the sense of being inevitably understood and experienced through meanings ascribed to it. Although the authors are clearly aware of these issues and review a range of theoretical perspectives they are reluctant to overtly prioritise and utilise one of these in their analysis. At a number of points in the text a sharper analysis would have been achieved had they opted for more decisive argument rather than too many 'on the one hand this and on the other hand that' approaches. But there is useful material here, it is a very helpful starting point for those engaged in working with young people on issues of sexuality. But more challenging material is also needed if we are to confront the variety of ways in which sexuality can be problematic for all sorts of people not just those in the adolescent category.

Pam Carter *University of Northumbria*

¹ A useful discussion of this is contained in Stein, (1993) E. 'Evidence for Queer Genes' in *GLQ Journal of Lesbian and Gay Studies* Vol 1, no 1 pp 93-110.

Jim Hyland

Yesterday's Answers:

Development And Decline Of Schools For Young Offenders

Whiting & Birch Ltd 1993

ISBN 1-871177-43X

£39.95 (hbk)

£18.95 (pbk)

pp 206

PAM DAVIES

A cursory glance at the title of this book, the black and white photos on the cover and inside might suggest a narrative which harks back to, and potentially harps on about, the past. The good old days when young boys and a handful of girls could be punished for offending, being unruly, or in danger of moral turpitude. A close read of the fifteen chapters (180 pages of text) hardly bears out this 'old fashioned' suggestion. Although there is a definite lamenting of the Community Home with Education (CHE) System being 'so rapidly and easily cast aside', (p 180) the author makes a serious and painstaking thorough analysis of this traditional system for a purpose: so that people who are committed to the welfare of young people in trouble, particularly those in management roles and political spheres, are aware of what has been tried and tested before, of the strengths and weaknesses of different courses of action, of the minefields arising out of legislative changes, boundary shifts, financial pressures and ultimately that we are all considerate of the people involved: the young and those directly responsible for them.

The author provides an account of the forerunners of what became known as CHEs from the 1800's to the present day provision. Important landmarks in the history of alternative types of child care are clearly signposted from the Poor Laws, through to the challenge at the end of the nineteenth century to the whole ethos of institutional care. Child welfare concerns introduced in the 1930s gave rise to the welfare versus justice debate in the juvenile courts. In the 1960s the Ingleby Report could be seen as the catalyst for, and the early beginnings of, modern alternatives to residential care. Chapters five and six tell of the collective pressures for change. Included are examples of harsh regimes in the approved Schools, the influence of the press and a telling factor in their demise, the schools seeming inability or reluctance to change the disciplinarian type regimes and values within, to meet and match up with, the new more permissive values of the 1960s without.

A turning point in the book, chapter seven illustrates the snowballing of state intervention, during the 'welfare years'.

The Children and Young Persons Act, 1969, is examined in chapters eight and nine, telling and politically important chapters giving an insiders view of how an Act can operate quite differently in practice to the theory it is seen to support. This point signals the demise of the CHEs

which Hyland sees being superseded by nothing any better or coherent in the guise of Intermediate Treatment. Calling upon a number of damning research reports as evidence, the author heavily criticises the generalist approach afforded by such programmes.

From the mid 1970s 'the development of a philosophy and practice supporting alternative measures to the use of residential care and education for young offenders' (p XIV) is examined. The polarisation between avoiding bringing young people before the courts (diversion) and penal disposal in the form of custodial sentences and prison became more extreme after the Criminal Justice Act 1982. This Act clearly indicated that young offenders were victims of a shift in penal policy towards a justice, rather than a welfare approach. Jim Hyland argues that CHEs were also a victim of this 1982 Act. They 'had clearly been dismissed from having any part in the middle ground' (p 140) of penal measures, where any form of adequate provision was severely lacking.

As the political and economic climate of the 1980s became more harsh, the struggle for the CHEs survival also increased. The closure of four CHEs are examined against this background, the author experiencing two of these first hand. All sixteen referred to collapsed under market forces and financial constraints and 'the general disarray into which the CHE began to fall from the early 1980s onwards' (p169).

Between the lines the account provides a timely reminder of the lessons that can be learnt from historical precedents and the wide ranging and far reaching effects of pressures for change from all directions. In the current climate of moral panic and the distinct threat of an over-reaction to juvenile delinquents across the board, this is indeed timely.

The strengths of the book are where the author is highly explicit: The concern about the loss of CHEs for juveniles and the manner in which this concern is documented are explicit, as is the conflicting aims theme introduced in chapter two and thereafter recurring throughout. Another explicit element concerns the author's amazement and disbelief in the apparent support for Intermediate Treatment when CHEs were largely abandoned. Hyland's derision in this seemingly unwarranted faith is keenly felt and the objectivity of the author is severely at risk here.

At another level the account raises, but doesn't attempt to deal exhaustively with, some important debates concerning principles of punishment, welfare versus justice and touches upon issues concerning separate provision for male and females, youth and adults. The approach also fills in the history of many of the features and problems of today's prison system, ie segregation, classification, buildings, costs, success/failure rates.

The author relies heavily upon official documentation combined with long-standing professional experience of the Approved School and CHE System as information sources. The account genuinely strives to be informative and objective. That there is a struggle to achieve this at times is

evident. The text tends towards being overly punctuated with facts, numbers, references to official reports and legislation, so that the point at stake is often difficult to recall, the flow for the reader is hampered by this style. Although there are tributes made to the residents (clients) of the CHEs, it may have been interesting to hear the girls and boys stories from themselves rather than from or in addition to the management and policy viewpoint, thereby varying the prose, content and style.

I wouldn't envisage the book becoming a fully recommended text in any academic area but more of a background reader. Chapter eight however, should be part of the book that is regularly dipped into and read as a case study on the awareness of the socio-economic and political influences on policy and practice. A useful contribution from a practitioner about the past but with lessons (which could have been more forcibly argued) for the future. The concluding chapter typifies this lack of optimism and belief in the relevance of the account to the future. The message at the close of the book is therefore a confused one. The author on the one hand is suggesting ways forward for the remaining CHEs but simultaneously admitting we've lost them forever.

Pam Davies Lecturer in Criminal Justice Studies University of Northumbria

Edited by Gerald R Adams, Thomas P Gullotta & Raymond Montemayor
Adolescent Identity Formation
 Volume 4 of Annual Book Series:
 Advances in Adolescent Development
 Sage 1992

GWYNETH LLOYD

This is an edited collection of papers, which forms part of an annual series intended to '...analyze, integrate and critique an abundance of new research and development in the field of adolescent development'. The style and approach is academic and North American; only one chapter, written by a psychologist from the Netherland's refers to European research and experience, I found some of the chapters fairly difficult to read particularly when densely referenced. However I feel that the effort is worthwhile!

For many of us our practice with young people is underpinned by a personal theoretical perspective, which tends not to be based on any individual model but is an eclectic mixture of ideas and beliefs developed through our reading, our professional work and relationships and our training. This is likely to include some assumptions about the nature of

identity and the process of identity formation, often based on the ideas of Erikson, remembered from our initial training.

This book offers an opportunity to rethink these assumptions, by providing an account of the thinking in the field of identity studies, in terms of a critique of the history and of current research. In particular several of the chapters address the '...invisibility of women, class, race and culture to the development of any theory of "normal" or healthy development' (Archer). Erikson wrote about the development of identity in terms of men, adding his thinking about women later in his work, through the notion of 'inner space', an essentially biologically derived idea. Archer argues that '...many feminist readers feel that they have been written about as an afterthought, portrayed as deviant rather than normal, biologically driven...'

Much of the book is therefore about the broadening and re-defining of the concept of identity and the process of identity formation, within different theoretical models. Several chapters are critical of the approach which has often been used to research identity, critical of an over empiricism, based on a falsely scientific method (eg chapter 2 'The Inner Space & Beyond', S Petterson et al and chapter 3 'A Feminist's Approach to Identity Research' S Archer). This kind of method is illustrated however by some of the other chapters, where previous research findings are listed extensively but uncritically! I would support the argument made by Patterson and her colleagues that research needs to look at the interpersonal context of identity development and move '...identity research out of the university and into the broader world'.

I liked Berzonsky's process model of identity, defining it as '... a self-constructed theory of the self. This self-structure serves as the conceptual framework within which the life experiences are interpreted and it provides the basis for attempts to cope with stressors and personal problems'. He also emphasises '...that identity develops within a particular cultural context and cannot be divorced from environmental constraints and interpersonal influences'. However, he describes his own research in a style inaccessible to the average reader (or it may be that as a woman I am not good enough at sums!).

Concepts of self and identity are fundamental to thinking about adolescent behaviour and the professional practice of those working with young people. In the present climate of political thinking with respect to many aspects of this work and prevailing rhetoric of punishment, it is essential for us to be able to discuss our work clearly and with reference to current research. This book does not make much explicit connection with practice although there is one interesting chapter by Jones which looks at adolescent drug use in the context of adolescent identity formation. However much of the research and thinking described in the book as a whole does have implications for our thinking about practice.

There is some British work in this field, the best known probably by Coleman, but this American work is still worth the effort of reading,

especially for its attempts to include the dimensions of gender and ethnicity. It wouldn't be a basic text for the desk of practitioners but useful for those who want to develop their thinking and for anyone doing a course.

Gwyneth Lloyd teaches at Moray House Institute of Education, Herriot-Watt University Edinburgh.

References

- Coleman JC & Hendry L (1990) *The Nature of Adolescence*, Routledge
 Coleman JC (1987) *Working with Troubled Adolescents*, Academic Press

David Moore

The Lads In Action: Social Process In An Urban Youth Subculture

Arena/Ashgate Publishing Ltd 1994

ISBN 1-85-74-22031

£12.95 (pbk)

ISBN 1-8572-2044

£29.50 (hbk)

pp 161 + xiii

MIKE WAITE

Concern about highly visible and 'threatening' aspects of young men's behaviour has been central to most studies of youth cultures since Victorian times. There are two key tests for any work which aims to explore this area further.

One is whether it relates itself consciously and critically to this tradition, so that debate and understanding is moved on.

The second is whether the specificities and peculiarities of the particular situation being studied are highlighted, so that we are helped to understand what is distinctive. If this does not happen, we are left with ahistorical descriptions which simply suggest that there is an unchanging 'eternal' dispensity on the part of young men to 'behave badly'.

Although Moore addresses himself to these tests, his book remains unsatisfactory on a number of levels. *The Lads in Action* is based on a participant - observer studies of skinheads in Perth, Western Australia which he carried out in 1984-1985. The strongest thread in the book is his very detailed accounts of the day to day life of individual 'lads' in their constantly changing 'action-sets' and 'quasi-groups'.

We get blow-by-blow (literally) accounts of their nights out, analysis of their dress, and evidence of how the telling and elaboration of anecdotes

serves to create and affirm the extent to which different individuals belong to and shape the subculture.

This presentation is linked to an interesting exploration of the theme that being a skinhead is a way of constructing an English ethnic identity in urban, multicultural Australia. Moore's subjects are not Englishmen abroad, exported skinheads whose behaviour means the same 'down under' as it does in London. The subculture is reworked and modified in a number of ways, and its 'defensive' nature takes a unique form. The skinheads, often the sons of English immigrants with relatives 'back home', use the style to assert a set of values and a sense of belonging which they can call their own against the background of multicultural Perth, in which ethnic identification generally is a key social feature.

Moore's choice of subject is partly shaped by his concern that 'English, Irish, Scottish and Welsh migrants are largely invisible ... they are curiously neglected in debates over Australia's ethnic composition'. He concludes with a call 'for future research to outline some of the other ways in which this ethnicity is manifested in Australia and to put to rest the popular notion that only those from non-English speaking backgrounds are "ethnic"'. Assuming that the aim of such work would be to explode the myth that those from English speaking backgrounds represent a unified, uncomplicated block against which other groups should be defined and judged, Moore's call should be welcomed. But, to this English reader, his call also suggests another agenda, the attempt by some white people to 'play the "ethnic minorities" at their own game', to claim for themselves the rights and access to space which positive action grants to victims of racism and prejudice precisely because they are oppressed vis a vis those from 'English speaking backgrounds'. I hesitate to accuse Moore of promoting this agenda because I accept that the identity and power status of the various segments of the white community have different forms and degrees of importance in a country where they are themselves immigrants.

One area to do with oppression where Moore's work is unforgivably weak is the book's treatment of women. Even taking on board his points that he is studying a very male dominated subculture, and that as a male researcher he could not be privy to 'all female conversations', his defensive assertion that 'any understanding and discussion of the relationships between skinheads and young women is necessarily presented from the point of view of the males with whom I moved' just will not do. There are so many examples of descriptions and analyses of young women's sub-cultural behaviour written by women that it is now possible, even for men, to achieve gender-sensitive readings of youth culture to a degree that Moore does not even attempt.

Instead, he talks of 'skinhead relationships *with* young women' in a way which reinforces and accepts the young women's subordinated and 'used' role. Acknowledging in footnotes that feminist critics like McRobbie were complaining (almost twenty years ago) that much sub-

cultural analysis renders women invisible and that 'in spending time together, Sandie, Karen and Jessie no doubt created their own set of understandings about men/women relationships' only serves to underline how thin Moore's work is in this area.

When he talks in the main part of his text about other components of the CCCS theoretical tradition, Moore is correct to identify a general weakness in relation to conveying 'the subjective experience of everyday life as a member of a subculture', and he aims to provide a description and offer analysis of what being a skinhead means to the skinheads themselves.

But in several analytical sections, Moore's prose becomes very dense, suggesting a lack of clear understanding of some of the theories he's applying. Perhaps his book on this subject would have been more enjoyable, useful and interesting if it had taken a more journalistic form.

Mike Waite is head of Response and Senior Worker on youth issues for Wirral Youth Service.

Nicholas Saunders

E for Ecstasy

Published by Nicholas Saunders, 14 Neals Yard, London, WC2H 9DP 1993

ISBN 0-9501628-8-4

£7.95

pp 320

ROBERT MACDONALD

E for Ecstasy is a stimulating and provocative book by a non-academic, Nicholas Saunders, whose own positive experiences of the drug Ecstasy (MDMA) spurred him to find out more and to report his research as an antidote to the generally negative, media representations of Ecstasy.

The book is divided into distinct sections. The first 100 plus pages contain accounts of, for instance, the history of the drug, its dangers and pharmacology, legal aspects of Ecstasy, harm reduction strategies and guidance about how to use the drug more safely. All of this is referenced to a lengthy section of annotated footnotes for those who wish to pursue the points he makes in more depth.

This, in turn, is followed by a series of accounts of drug use written by people surveyed by the author who have found that Ecstasy has changed their lives in some way. An annotated bibliography to the largely medical research literature, donated by Alexander Shulgin, comprises a fur-

ther 80 or so pages. The book concludes with a review of current British research, sources of information, a glossary of terminology and index.

Whilst this could have made the book fragmented and difficult to read, the opposite effect has been achieved. *E for Ecstasy* is written in an accessible style which avoids jargon. This really is quite an achievement given the complexity of the issues and the diversity of disciplines - pharmacology, the law, sociology, neuropsychology etc., - that the work covers. The book also benefits from effective organisation and editing making it a valuable tool for those interested in Ecstasy and the appeal that it holds for many thousands of young people.

Potential readers may, however, find it difficult to lay their hands upon a copy. At least one chain of retailers has completely refused to stock the book and I know of one university library which, whilst stocking *E for Ecstasy*, keeps it behind the issue desk in brown paper covers! (The front of Saunders' book is designed in a psychedelic, Acid-House style which was thought might appear too attractive to impressionable students).

In short, the book - about an immensely popular if illicit youth drug - has created something of a 'moral panic' despite the effort of the author to challenge exactly this sort of knee-jerk, moral condemnation though scholarly argument.

Saunders' main objective is to review the available evidence in order to reach a more balanced (and what turns out to be, in his view) a more favourable assessment of the drug. He argues that, as a drug, Ecstasy is less dangerous than Paracetamol and as a leisure activity, taking it is less dangerous than a skiing holiday in Switzerland. *E for Ecstasy* is a goldmine of information. Did you know that Siberian reindeer hunters drink the urine of their prey for its hallucinogenic qualities (reindeers, apparently, eat 'magic mushrooms')? Or that Ecstasy has had a marked effect in reducing violence between City and United football fans in Manchester?

Although much of this is very informative and engaging, I was disappointed that there was no developed, theoretical discussion of the rise of drug using youth cultures. Furthermore, on one or two occasions I was left wondering whether the author's appreciation of the drug was clouding his critical judgement. On page 45, for instance, he comments 'there are the stories of first time users who have "flipped"; I don't know of any personally, but it seems likely that these were unstable personalities': a rather glib response.

The section of the book which has probably caused the most alarm is that entitled 'suggestions for first time users'. Saunders stresses that he is not encouraging the taking of a Class A drug but that young people (one estimate puts the figure at around three-quarters of a million people using Ecstasy, in connection with the Rave Culture) will continue to use the drug regardless of the protestations of the moral establishment and

that they should be encouraged to do so safely. There is a subsequent discussion of how practical harm reduction policies can be put into effect.

Overall, *E for Ecstasy* is a highly useful book for students (who give more positive reviews than this when they have been able to find it), for those working in the drugs field, for people who teach and research about youth and drugs and, finally, for people who have decided, or might decide, to use Ecstasy.

Robert MacDonald *University of Teesside*

S U B S C R I P T I O N S

Annual Subscription (4 Issues)

Academic Institutions, Statutory Organisations and Libraries£40.00
 Individuals & Youth and Community Agencies£23.00

Overseas

E.C.Add £3.00 postage
 ElsewhereAdd £6.00 postage

Back Issues - nos: 9 onwards

Academic Institutions, Statutory Organisations and Libraries£9.00
 Individuals & Youth and Community Agencies£5.00

Overseas

E.C.Add £0.75 postage
 ElsewhereAdd £1.50 postage

Subscribe to **Youth & Policy** by completing the order form below and sending to:

**Youth & Policy Subscriptions,
 10 Lady Beatrice Terrace, New Herrington,
 Houghton le Spring, Tyne & Wear,
 DH4 4NE, UK.**

Name.....

Address.....

I wish to subscribe to Youth & policy. I enclose £

Please send me back issues nos:..... I enclose £

Postage (overseas only) £

Total Remittance enclosed £

Please send me an index (issues 9-45) (tick box)

I require a receipt (tick box)

**Cheques made payable to 'Youth & Policy'
 SEND REMITTANCE WITH ALL ORDERS.**

SUBMISSION DETAILS

Subscriptions: Annual subscriptions (of 4 issues) for statutory organisations, academic institutions and libraries £40 (individual and back issues £9 each); youth and community organisations and individuals £23 (individual and back issues £5); overseas add £3 postage EC, £6 postage elsewhere.

Advertising: Details of rates, deadlines available from Judith Cocker.

Reviews: Suggestions for future review material and names of possible contributors to Meg Brown.

Working Space: is aimed at those who may not normally consider writing an article and may be written in whatever style an individual feels comfortable with. Contact Richard Barber.

Articles: of normally between 2,500 and 8,000 words should be sent to Sarah Banks, Rob MacDonald or Bob Hollands. They should take an analytical approach to theoretical, practical and/or policy issues concerning young people in society. On receipt of the article the author will be notified whether it is being considered for publication. This process involves the editorial group seeking comments from three referees.

All articles must be typed with double spacing on white paper and authors should send three copies.

We also encourage the submission of the final text on computer disk (3.5 inch) saved in 'text'/ASCII format (please enclose adequate instructions for our typesetters). Attention must be paid to our statement concerning equal opportunities and offensive language; contributors should adopt the house style of the journal laid out below:

Single quotation marks should be used unless quoting within a quote, where double quotation marks should be used. Indented quotes do not require quotation marks but where a quote is presented within an indented quote, single quotation marks

should be used. Abbreviations that have attained common usage can be used (e.g. USA) but those which are less well known should be spelled out in the first instance with the abbreviated form following in parentheses, e.g. British Youth Council (BYC). The abbreviated form can be used thereafter. Tables, graphs and diagrams should be set out clearly and included in the relevant place in the text. Subheadings should be clearly marked and underlined. References should be set out in the Harvard system. Thus, the author's name, date of publication and, if necessary, page number should be included in parentheses in the main text, for example, (Smith, 1984, p.10). All references should be listed at the end of the article, with the title 'References', in alphabetical order by author's surname and including publication details.

Thus, for a book:

Hutson, S., and Jenkins, R. (1989) *Taking the Strain: Families, Unemployment and the Transition to Adulthood*, Milton Keynes, Open University Press.

For an article:

Willis, P. (1984) 'Youth Unemployment: Thinking the Unthinkable', in *Youth and Policy*, vol.2, no.4, pp. 17-24.

And for a report:

The Thompson Report (1982) Experience and Participation, cmdnd 8686, London, HMSO.

Any information which is supplementary to the main text should be noted by a number in parentheses and listed in numerical order at the end of the article before the references, under the title of Notes.

Address for All Correspondence:

Youth and Policy, 10 Lady Beatrice Terrace, New Herrington, Houghton le Spring, DH4 4NE

CONTENTS

ISSN 0262-9798

Michael Lavalette, Sandy Hobbs, Sandra Lindsay and Jim McKechnie Child Employment in Britain: <i>Policy, Myth and Reality</i>	1
Ian Procter and Maureen Padfield Young Women's Career Aspirations: <i>What Happens to Them?</i>	16
Peter Selman & Caroline Glendinning Teenage Parenthood & Social Policy	39
Ray Fabes and David Popham Mobile Facilities for work with Young People in Rural Areas	59
Bob Holman Urban Youth - Not an Underclass	69
Working Space - Philip Roycroft Short Sharp Kenyan Safari	78
Book Reviews	82
Subscription Page	112